Methodism Among Nova Scotia's Yankee Planters

Allen B. Robertson
Queen's University

During the 1770s two revivalist evangelical sects gained a following in Nova Scotia; one, Newlight Congregationalism — with both Predestinarian and Free Will variants — grew out of the religious and social heritage of the colony's dominant populace, the New England Planters. The other sect, Wesleyan Methodism, took root among transplanted Yorkshiremen who moved between 1772 and 1776 to the Isthmus of Chignecto region where it was initially propagated among the faithful in local prayer groups. Ordained and lay preachers of both movements promoted a series of revivals in the province which drew an increasing number of followers into the evangelical fold. The first of these revivals was the Newlight-dominated Great Awakening of 1776-84. In general, Newlightism's greatest appeal was in the Planter townships even though it mutated by 1800 into a Baptist polity. Methodism, which had a fluctuating number of adherents among the visiting military forces at Halifax, had its stronghold in areas settled by British-born colonists, and increased in numbers with the successive waves of Loyalists coming to the province after 1783. Methodism was not confined, however, to segregated geographical areas of Nova Scotia. By the early nineteenth century, there were significant Methodist congregations composed primarily of Planters located throughout the Annapolis Valley and along the province's South Shore. Interesting questions are posed for historians when we consider why New Englanders and their descendants were attracted to what appeared to be essentially a foreign hierarchical religious-cultural movement which had broken from...


rigid predestinarianism. Methodism, moreover, was strongly associated with the Church of England, an institution that had been abhorred by generations of Rhode Island, Connecticut and Massachusetts's colonists. An examination of the similarities and differences between Newlightism and Methodism goes far to illuminate the various elements which made it possible for some Planters to make the transition to Methodism.

It is obvious to even the most casual observer that there were many similarities between the two sects and one of the noticeable peculiarities of Nova Scotian colonial religious history is the difficulty which faced sectarian preachers as they tried to gain individual followings. Planters, Yorkshiremen and Loyalists — all were willing to listen to any visiting preacher, contribute to his expenses and donate funds for the erection of more than one place of worship within a community. As a result, a settlement might be described as Methodist or Newlight depending on who happened to be evangelizing. Since, as David Bell has pointed out, Newlights, Wesleyans and Baptists placed emphasis on the 'New Birth' as a demonstrative conversion experience and preachers from the three sects relied on highly charged language to instill their audiences with vivid, emotional imagery, it is little wonder that the lay community often found it confusing to distinguish between Newlight and Methodist preaching.

Combined with these shared characteristics were sermons, hymns and exhortations containing a similar message which further clouded the differences between the two sects.

About 1780, for example, John Payzant (in-law of the charismatic Newlight preacher Henry Alline), reported that Alline had gathered a mixed Newlight-Methodist congregation in Cumberland. William Black, who had corresponded with John Wesley prior to embarking on a career as an itinerant preacher, was said to have been associated with this meeting.

Although this union only lasted a short time before doctrinal differences arose, it was indicative of the laity's confusion over the sects. Indeed, it took ministerial leadership to point out the differences which lead to the eventual division of this congregation. Payzant provides another example

---


4 D.G. Bell, Newlight Baptist Journals of James Manning and James Innis (Hantsport, 1984), 4.


from Liverpool in 1783. Liverpool was a town primarily inhabited by Massachusetts and Connecticut Planters. The Newlight Payzant wrote that:

The people received [him] [Black] as one of Mr. A[lline's] preachers. Mr. Chipman at that time came to Liverpool and found Mr. Black and preached with him. At the same time Mr. B[lack] was drawing a party of[f] from the others. Mr. Jos. S. Baily who was from the Bay of Fundy w[h]ere Mr. B[lack] was well known, he acquainted the people that Mr. Black was not Sound in his principles and was not owned by the people called newlight — which made a Separation. Some said that Mr. Black preached the Same Gospel that Mr. A[lline] preached. But the[y] soon found a Radical difference between the two, so that the[y] made two congregations which were ever after continued.7

It is little wonder that Liverpudlians were bewildered. There was already tension among the Newlights over Free Will and Predestinarianism, and Methodist William Black sounded much like Henry Alline when he espoused Arminianism and a 'New Birth.' Those attracted by the new birth theology therefore could be forgiven for believing that the two great preachers offered the same message. During the 1780s and 1790s, however, churches became more institutionally formalized and leaders aimed both for a core congregation composed of loyal members and increased conversions. In the competition for followers, greater attention was paid to the laity and the explication of doctrinal differences as well as the similarities between the sects.

Many of Nova Scotia's first-generation Yankee Planters could remember the upheaval caused by New England's Great Awakening. It too had left a legacy of divisions between 'Old Light' Congregationalists and the 'New Lights'; however, both groups had continued to adhere to orthodox reform Protestant doctrine and the peculiar New England version of Calvinist predestination.8 Under the charismatic influence and teaching of Henry Alline from 1776 to 1784 these old splits were renewed in Nova Scotia. Alline rejected the deterministic theology of New England for Free Will soteriology; yet it is evident from the subsequent success of the Baptists that few of Alline's followers went on to perpetuate their leader's more extreme heterodox cosmological pronouncements.9 Nonetheless,

7 Cuthbertson, 31.
9 Armstrong, Great Awakening in Nova Scotia, 88-107; Rawlyk, Ravished by the Spirit, 6-9; Bumsted, Henry Alline, 77-96.
sufficient numbers embraced Free Will theology to sustain Newlight Congregationalist (Allinite) and Free Will Baptist churches. From that number of Free Will adherents, some were convinced of the correctness of Wesleyan Arminianism as preached by William Black, Methodist missionaries from the United States and English missionaries directed by John Wesley and his successors.

The years of Alline’s preaching and the sixteen years following his death in 1784 were marked by turbulent sectarianism in the Maritimes. Alline had been indifferent to church discipline, sacraments and denominational labels — for him the ‘New Birth’ was everything. His evangelical message is succinctly summed up in a journal entry at the time of his conversion:

O the infinite condescension of God to a worm of the dust! for though my whole soul was filled with love, and ravished with a divine ecstasy beyond any doubts or fears, or thoughts of being then deceived, for I enjoyed a heaven on earth, and it seemed as if I were wrapped up in God.¹⁰

Even if Alline’s understanding of his own experience deviates from the orthodox norm, such lines put him in the tradition of the Christian mystics, among whom Richard of St. Victor may be singled out for the similarity of his descriptions of Divine Love.¹¹

Similar depths of ecstatic response or at least profound pietistic expressions could be found among Methodist adherents as well. The Methodist Reverend William Jessop of Delaware, a brother-in-law of a leading Loyalist merchant, Robert Barry, himself a lay exhorter at Shelburne and in Planter Liverpool, made extended missionary tours of New Brunswick and Nova Scotia. His journal was replete with passages in this vein:

This has been a day of peace to my soul; when I awoke I was favored with some precious gales of the spirit from Pesgath’s top. I was also made to drink of those streams which make glad the city of our God. O! Lord where shall I begin to praise thee for if I had ten thousand

¹⁰ Rawlyk, Ravished by the Spirit, 5.
¹¹ F.C. Happold, Mysticism: A Study and an Anthology (1963; reprint Harmondsworth, England, 1970.), 245: "The third degree of love is when the mind of man is ravished into the abyss of divine love so that the soul, having forgotten all outward things, is altogether unaware of itself and passes out completely into its God.... In this state, while the soul is abstracted from itself, ravished into that secret place of divine refuge, when it is surrounded on every side by the divine fire of love, pierced to the core, set alight all about, then it sheds its very self altogether and puts on that divine life, and being wholly conformed to the beauty it has seen passes wholly into that glory...." Richard of St. Victor (d. 1173), The Four Degrees of Passionate Charity [Love].
They Planted Well

tongues they would not be sufficient, for thou hast done great and marvellous things for me; thy precious blood hath purchased my pardon and salvation; all I enjoy comes from thee.\textsuperscript{12}

Planters who expected enthusiastic religious language were certainly able to find it in both Jessop and Alline, for there was no insurmountable boundary between the sects on this issue.

Nova Scotia’s Yankee settlers also endeavored to duplicate their New England models of church and state. The Congregational church, with its heavy emphasis on individuality, perpetuated the concept of a church as a voluntary association of ‘saints.’ The church called and dismissed its ministers, and the ministers themselves formed a kind of Puritan brotherhood which worked out doctrinal questions, sought consensus on disputed theological points and ensured that the laity were properly instructed in the steps to conversion.\textsuperscript{13} The Great Awakening of the late 1730s had introduced demonstrative, emotional conversions as a required rite of passage into the company of Newlight saints. It had also added the danger of community upheavals that often accompanied vigorous revivals. The Allinite Awakening revived the New England Awakening heritage.\textsuperscript{14} Congregational churches in Nova Scotia continued to be democratic associations which regulated their own internal affairs while preachers held churches together through a loose organizational network.

By the 1780s and 1790s, problems existed in the religious and cultural life of Congregational communities which made Methodist alternatives more attractive to the populace. Although historical elements drawn from the New England past brought about difficulties in the new churches, Alline was to blame for many of the insurmountable obstacles facing the Planters. Concerned almost solely with bringing the message of the ‘New Birth’ to all who heard him, Alline’s preaching tours agitated congregations, made divisions in previously consolidated church bodies and left the converted to organize and attempt to govern themselves.\textsuperscript{15} The ‘ravager of souls’ failed to provide the leadership which might have prevented sectarian splits. The abdication of such responsibility and Alline’s indifference to the sacraments, together with the emphasis on the Holy Spirit’s renewal of souls, led in the years following his death (as it had


\textsuperscript{13} A discussion of the New England Puritan ministerial brethren and their relationship to the laity can be found in Darrett Rutman, \textit{American Puritanism} (Philadelphia, 1970).

\textsuperscript{14} McLoughlin, \textit{Revivals}, 8; Rawlyk, \textit{Ravished by the Spirit}, 8-9.

done, indeed, even during his life) to serious outbreaks of antinomianism. The most widespread variant was labelled the "New Dispensation" in which private revelation took precedence over Scripture, Church authority and ministerial control.\textsuperscript{16} The 1790s were a chaotic period for Newlights and Newlight Baptists, a time in which several prophets (male and female) declared themselves, some ministers were led in New Dispensationalism and each church seemed to have become almost an island without any overruling authority to whom it could appeal for guidance.

It was against this background, then, that Wesleyan Methodism offered comforting security to the Planters without overthrowing evangelical revivalism. John Wesley had institutionalized and integrated laity-led prayer groups within the structure of a highly regulated hierarchical ministerial association based, in part, on Anglican ecclesiastical precedent. His Nova Scotian followers used this system to foster Methodist respectability in areas devoid of ordained ministers and fostered the faith throughout the province.\textsuperscript{17} Classes, composed of seekers after conversion and perfection and led by a designated elder, formed Methodist 'cells' at Cumberland, Shelburne, Liverpool, Halifax, Guysborough and in several smaller centers. These mini-congregations provided a ready audience for itinerant preachers and were used as the basis for evangelical efforts in these localities. Like the Newlights, late eighteenth-century Methodists used a mix of ordained men and trainees, as well as local men gifted as preachers, to spread the Word. Added to this array were the exhorters who enlarged on and re-emphasized pertinent points drawn from the sermons. When numbers warranted, trustees were selected from the Methodist converts. These men — exemplars of Wesleyan teaching — served as elders, raised funds for the construction of meeting houses and salaries for missionaries and concerned themselves with other aspects of institutional church organization. In all cases, the local 'societies' — as the churches were termed — were governed by the District Meeting of Ministers of the New Brunswick-Nova Scotia circuits.

It is necessary at this point to summarize the unique composition of the Nova Scotia Methodist mission field. Following his entrance into a career of itinerant preaching, William Black had called on John Wesley to take responsibility for the fledgling church and to assist it with missionaries. Loyalists at Shelburne had among their numbers Wesleyan leaders from the John Street Chapel in New York city and two of their number, James and John Mann, joined Black on the itinerant circuit. Meanwhile Robert Barry in Liverpool and Philip Marchington in Halifax added their appeals

\textsuperscript{16} 'Prophets' included Lydia Randall and Sarah Bancroft; one may also cite Rev. Harris Harding, as a spokesman/prophet for New Dispensationalism, see, Robertson, "Legacy of Henry Alline," 38-39; 55-67.

\textsuperscript{17} French, Parsons & Politics, 8-11; Betts, Bishop Black, 5-6, 26-27.
for aid from England. In 1785, the American Methodist Episcopal Church responded to Wesley's and Black's representations by sending Freeborn Garretson and James O. Cromwell to the province, the first two foreign missionaries to be sent to Nova Scotia. Until the mid-1790s the province was nominally a mission of the Methodist Episcopal Church, though in reality it existed as a semi-autonomous District led by a Superintendent (or 'bishop') and his ministerial colleagues. At the same time, Wesley also sent missionaries to the colony, as did his successors, through the English Conference. Although the American/English overlapping of responsibility created problems, it can be said that in general the result was a coherent Maritime structure which resisted the fractionalizing tendency of Newlightism.

Planters troubled by the confusion inherent in Newlight divisions found refuge in the Wesleyan Methodist fold. Those who cared to learn the doctrinal basis of Methodism could do so through the writings of John Wesley, a trained theologian whose body of writings stood out in marked contrast to the convoluted heterodoxical insights in Henry Alline's theological-metaphysical works, *The Two Mites* and *The Anti-Traditionalist*. Further, the often-felt sense of isolation in the ultra-independent Newlight congregations was absent from the Methodist societies which from 1785 fostered a sense of regional identity through the District Meetings. Ties to both the Methodist Episcopal Church and the English Connection provided an international fellowship in which Nova Scotia Methodists found themselves part of a dynamic and growing 'global' religious movement. Methodism in the province, at least prior to 1800, was an expanding religious body in marked contrast to Newlight

---


19 A standard stipulation in deeds for sites of Wesleyan chapels included reference to Wesley's works; e.g.: Robert Gray to Robert Barry, Thomas Smart, Thomas Ridgeway, Isaac Enslow and Alexander McKay [Trustees], 19 Sept. 1804: "...to the intent that they and the Survivors of them and the Trustees...for ever permit such Person or persons as shall be appointed by the Yearly Conference of the People called Methodists and no others...to preach and expound God's Holy word Provided always that the said Person or persons preach no other Doctrine than is contained in Mr. Wesley's Notes upon the New Testament and Eight Volumes of Sermons...": Registry of Deeds, Shelburne, N.S.: Book 5, 459.


factionalism.  

Planters who continued to value baptism and communion found a strong sacramentalism in the Wesleyan fellowship. It perpetuated, in Planter eyes, the Congregationalist practice of admitting only the converted to the communion table, a contrast to Anglicanism's all-inclusive call. In essence, Methodism was that 'Puritan' church sought by Nova Scotia's Yankee ancestors rather than being a mere variant of the suspect Church of England. Combined with sacramental observance, evangelical piety and structure, the Methodist societies with their classes and selection of trustees gave the Planters a degree of democracy which made the Wesleyan association less 'foreign' than it first might have appeared to them.

The Methodist road to conversion and its subsequent pursuit of perfection was not a narrow one. Enough variation in individual conversions was permitted to accommodate a variety of temperaments. By contrast, the Newlight tradition as exemplified by Alline was far more rigid. Alline, who had undergone an intensely emotional conversion, took his rebirth as the norm by which the validity of other such conversions were tested. Anyone who could not match this experience was left to endure great psychological distress. Methodism provided the evangelical alternative to this situation and John Payzant, commenting on a Horton township revival in 1786, disdainfully alluded to the desertion of Newlightism by Planters:

The Baptists Insist that Mr. Payzant Should Preach in their meeting House, which accordingly he did and continued until the reformation was over. Then they Refused him the House. At almost the conclusion of the Reformation the Methodist came to Horton, and preached there. In a reformation there are always some that our Churches cannot receive. They were a pray [prey] for the Methodist, which caused a division, for they took all such into their Class, So that the opposers, to vital religion, opposed more than ever. They said that the Methodists were more favorable than the new lights....

22 Smith, *Methodist Church*, Vol. 1, 332-44, provides a review and summary of Wesleyan progress at the end of the 1790s on such matters as church buildings, seating capacity, general sizes of congregations and numbers of the congregations who were full members of the Methodist churches — for example, Halifax [Zoar Chapel] c. 900 capacity, 1798 membership 120; Liverpool c. 500-600 capacity, 1798 membership 130; Shelburne-Barrington circuit 1798 membership 158.


The Methodist perspective of the same event, as recorded by William Black, is of a decidedly different cast:

We had some very happy times...during the winter, especially at Horton, where there was a powerful awakening among the people. Fifteen witnessed a good confession; I doubt not but more would have found the love of God, had it not been for the great opposition they received from the Antinomian Mystics.\(^{26}\)

As we can see, it was difficult in a predominantly Planter area to go over to a minority religious position. Nonetheless, there were converts to Methodism at Horton, an indication of the powerful attraction that the Wesleyan path offered.\(^{27}\)

Besides its purely religious aspects, Methodism was attractive to Planters in other ways. As with traditional Congregationalism, Wesleyan Methodism favoured an educated clergy. Of course, few native Maritimers could proceed by any path other than private study. Their English counterparts, who came from Anglican backgrounds, had better educational opportunities and were respected for their intellectual training. This is not to say that the leadership eschewed employing gifted men who lacked formal training. There never was, however, the deep seated suspicion of education which existed among the Newlights.

Squire Simeon Perkins of Liverpool was a shrewd businessman and discerning worshipper. His diary chronicled the comings and goings of all the denominational preachers in his community from the 1760s to 1810. Won over by Methodism in the early 1790s through the instruction of William Black and the friendship of business acquaintances Robert Barry and John Kirk (both Loyalists), he had no objections to hearing a read sermon.\(^{28}\) As trustee of Liverpool's first Methodist chapel, Perkins also tried to evaluate the orthodox content in the preacher's delivery, as he did when Rev. Cooper spoke in town in 1801:

Mr. Cooper is an Orator, and uses very Good Language, his Observations Very pertinent, and his doctrine Strictly according to the General Doctrines Preached by the late Mr. John Wesley, and, to my weak apprehension, Scriptual.\(^{29}\)


\(^{28}\) Charles Bruce Fergusson, ed., *The Diary of Simeon Perkins 1804-1812* (Toronto, 1978), 16: 4 March 1804: "Mr. Barry Read one of the late Mr. Charles Wesley's Sermons in the afternoon...."

Perkins, like many of his day, was a reader of religious works and following his conversion he continued with Wesleyan tracts. A man of business, he readily recognized the need of education and became part of that mercantile leadership element in colonial Methodist society which promoted such values.

It has been persuasively argued that the Great Awakening of 1776-1784 helped prepare Nova Scotia's Yankees to cope with the political-social outcome of the Revolution. Residents of the British Empire, they had found consolation in the Newlight message and concept of themselves as special people. Those Planters who adopted Methodism were likewise given reassurance. Outreach by the Methodist Episcopal Church enabled Nova Scotians to continue close ties with their former New England homeland and expanded those ties to the middle states which formed the heart of American Methodism. Though such relations created some problems for elements among the Loyalist Methodist groups still resentful of the political outcome, it nonetheless proved the means by which animosities were lessened. At the same time, orientation toward England was facilitated by correspondence with John Wesley and as a result of the increased numbers of English missionaries coming to the province. The English tie of Methodism appealed to Planters eager to acknowledge that they had a new role to play in a royalist colony and enabled the 'neutral Yankees of Nova Scotia' to become full participants in the Second British Empire.

Finally, Methodism facilitated the integration of both Planters and Loyalist settlers in Nova Scotia. As already mentioned, there was a core group of Methodists at Shelburne in addition to a presence at Halifax — both the result of the refugee influx. This bolstered the Methodist numbers in the province, provided new preachers and leaders, and introduced an active mercantile class which increased the sect's respectability. Planter Liverpool was the most important south Shore community outside Halifax. Its proximity to Shelburne meant that contact was inevitable. William Black and subsequent missionaries made Halifax, Liverpool and Shelburne a regular part of their circuit so that news of the faith's growth

30 Stewart and Rawlyk, People Highly Favoured, 179-92; Rawlyk, Ravished by the Spirit, 16-17, 88-89.
31 "I made bold to open matters to Mr. Wesley, and begged of him to send one preacher from England as a number of people would prefer an Englishman to an American. Many have refused hearing me on this account." Freeborn Garrettson to Francis Asbury, 1786, quoted in Nathan Bangs, The Life of the Rev. Freeborn Garrettson, 5th ed. (New York, 1847), 11.
32 Neil McKinnon notes the reestablishment of ties to the United States by the Loyalists but does not consider how they reoriented themselves in their Nova Scotia residency vis-à-vis the crown: Neil McKinnon, This Unfriendly Soil: The Loyalist Experience in Nova Scotia 1783-1791 (Montreal, 1986). Cf. Robertson, "Charles Inglis and John Wesley."
was passed along to both Planter and Loyalist followers. The relocation of a few Loyalist labourers, artisans and merchants to Liverpool was eased through the support of the Planter Methodist society. John Kirk, Captain Samuel Man and Doctor Daniel Kendrick were three noteworthy members of this Society as was Robert Barry who, prior to moving to Liverpool in 1810, was already an active supporter of Methodism in the town. When the trustees were chosen in 1793 to oversee the Society in Liverpool the group included Loyalist John Kirk and Planters Simeon Perkins, Samuel Hunt, William Smith and Captain Bartlett Bradford. These men spoke for the Society in the absence of ministers, while Hunt and later Barry (who became trustee in 1815) led the services when no missionaries were present. While Liverpool is only one center, it is a fine example of the blending of peoples into Nova Scotians — a process aided in part by the sharing of belief in the tenants of Wesleyan Methodism.

The year 1800 is important in the history of both Nova Scotia’s Newlight Baptists and Wesleyans. This was the year that the Baptist Association was organized, marking a breakaway from Newlight theology. Methodists recall this as the year that William Black sailed to England to appeal for Wesleyan missionaries to replace the Methodist Episcopal missionaries who had been redirected to aid the rapidly expanding movement in the United States. Those few years in the 1790s when Methodist manpower was depleted marked a time for Baptists to regain lost ground and build up a foundation from which they were to remain numerically superior to


34 For initial discussion to build a Methodist meeting house and subsequent developments, see, Charles Bruce Fergusson, ed., The Diary of Simeon Perkins 1790-96 (Toronto, 1961), 215-16, 233.

35 PANS, MG 4, Vol. 79, Records of the Methodist Church, Liverpool, Nova Scotia. The class lists and pew-subscribers provide information and offer a way to identify which Planter families converted to Methodism and help locate Loyalist settlers in the town and vicinity. Pre-1800 records for the Annapolis-Granville Circuit, an area of Planter and Loyalist settlement, are not extant; however, a check of baptismal and marriage records post-1800 offer a source comparable to Liverpool’s records: PANS, Mfm, Churches, Bridgetown: Methodist/Presbyterian/United. Planter settler lists, Loyalist grantee lists and genealogical records would have to be drawn on to provide percentage statistics of Planters-Loyalists in either the South Shore or Annapolis Valley circuits (and elsewhere in the province). Even a cursory check, however, reveals both immigrant groups in the Annapolis-Granville Circuit as Methodists and increased intermarriage between Planters and Loyalists.

36 Cuthbertson, John Payzant, 78-83.

37 Smith, Methodist Church, Vol. 1, 369-73; Betts, Bishop Black, 51-55.
Methodists throughout the nineteenth century. Though the ratio would be about three to one for Baptist congregations over Methodists in the 1800s, Yankee Planters did not drop away from the latter. They continued to find comfort in the spiritual and institutional alternative of Wesleyanism and would remain, as had their Methodist parents and grandparents of the eighteenth century, Planters with a difference.