

# English Joachite Manuscripts and Medieval Optimism about the Role of the Jews in History: A List for Future Studies

***Kathryn Kerby-Fulton***

The anti-Semitism of Chaucer's "Prioress's Tale" was for a long time the main window on Insular attitudes toward Judaism for Middle English specialists, but in her rich collection of essays *Chaucer and the Jews*, Sheila Delany recently began the important task of broadening perspectives on this 'absent presence.' Drawing attention, for instance, to the much ignored Asian setting of Chaucer's tale, Delany started shifting the perspective eastward and toward what Ruth Nisse has aptly called the 'channel crossing' which the field really needs.<sup>1</sup> Ironically, Chaucer himself, as Delany's work emphasizes, was far less parochial than modern scholars have sometimes been, having repeatedly been obliged by his day job to make this channel crossing into a European world enriched by a Jewish presence. Incorporating superb work by scholars like Denise Despres, Elisa Narin Van Court, and Mary Dove, Delany's collection also models a cultural history that reaches back into twelfth- and thirteenth-century England before the expulsion in 1290, and before the English imagination was left to its own often unhappy devices, once it was unfettered by real encounters with Jewish individuals. Using a combination of 'channel-crossing' codicology and intellectual history, I would like to introduce here another set of sources which scholars can use for the study of English attitudes towards Judaism: the Insular proliferation of Joachimism.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Chaucer and the Jews*, edited by Sheila Delany and reviewed by Ruth Nisse. For recent studies on English Judaism and Joachimism, see Nisse, "A Romance" and "Your Name"; Klepper, *The Insight of Unbelievers*, esp. 29-30.

There was a surprisingly strong dissemination of Joachite thought in the Insular world — not quite as strong or as radical as in Joachim’s native Italy or in Franciscan Spiritual-influenced southern France, but considerable nonetheless. Joachim of Fiore’s “confidence in the privileged position of the Jews in the divine plan” can be seen underpinning much of his thought, but at the end of his life, this position was perhaps causing concern about his orthodoxy.<sup>2</sup> In a letter written in 1200 to assert his orthodoxy and defend himself, Joachim quietly renamed his *Exhortatorium Judeorum* as *Adversus Judeos*.<sup>3</sup> As Robert Lerner has shown, the renaming was apparently an expedient of the moment — the title appears in none of the manuscripts of the *Exhortatorium* itself, a work in which Joachim had argued that “the time for having compassion on [the Jews]” was now at hand.<sup>4</sup> Both in his own writings and in those of an array of disciples (themselves often in trouble with the authorities) over the next two or three hundred years, tolerance of Judaism flourished in the transmission of apocalyptic thought. The result was pluralist millenarianism, a genre that generally exhibited more tolerance of Judaism than many other medieval genres, in part because of Joachim’s influence, but in part, too, because of the exegetical and irenic nature of many of the biblical sources for apocalypticism itself. Although it could be appropriated for various kinds of polemic, dire and otherwise, it could also be a more optimistic and generous genre than, for instance, hagiography (the ostensible genre of “The Prioress’s Tale”) with its required cast of persecutors. Apocalypticism has persecutors, too, but — especially in the broader Joachite tradition — they could come from both outside and *inside* the Church. In the latter case, non-Christians or schismatic Christians could as easily become friends as enemies. In all cases, they played an important role (whether good or evil) in the End Times.

My purpose here is to offer a listing of Joachite manuscripts of English provenance and briefly sketch some of the ideas and ideals it transmitted. I stress *briefly*, because the

- 
- 2 Here as elsewhere in this brief sketch, I owe a great debt of gratitude most especially to Robert Lerner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham*, from which the above quotation is taken (p. 33), and to Professor Lerner himself for generously reading this paper and offering detailed advice. I am also grateful to Denise Despres for kindly reading the essay prior to publication, and to Heather Reid for meticulous help with copy-editing. Finally, I warmly acknowledge Christoph Egger’s and Sylvain Piron’s help with points of information in the List below.
  - 3 Marjorie Reeves discusses Joachim’s “almost painful” submission in his letter of 1200 (Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 29), and Lerner (*The Feast of Saint Abraham*, 33-35) surveys the evidence for Joachim’s strategy anew, especially in relation to his *Exhortatorium Judeorum*. This work has been newly edited by Patschovsky, *Joachim . . . Exhortatorium Judeorum*; for the text of the letter, see Daniel, ed., *Liber Concordia*, 4-6.
  - 4 Lerner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham*, 34, citing the *Exhortatorium*; for the manuscript evidence regarding the name of the text, see Lerner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham*, 34 and 138 n. 65.

issues are complex, the list itself is long, the range of materials wide, and I am not a specialist in medieval Judaism. But I can make information about these manuscripts available to those who are. In the paragraphs which follow, I am especially indebted to the distinguished new book by Robert Lerner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham: Medieval Millenarians and the Jews*. Lerner's is largely and quite properly a study of Continental authors and manuscripts; the contribution of the present piece is to show how this kind of work may be extended to the English corpus.

Aided by St. Paul (of all people), who had promised that upon completion of the mission to the Gentiles, all Israel would be saved ("donec plenitudo gentium intraret, et sic omnis Israel saluus fieret," Romans 11:25-26),<sup>5</sup> thoughtful exegetes had for centuries mused on the role of the Jews in God's plan for Salvation History. This crucial passage (which, we must note, strongly implies *universal salvation* for the Jews) has a long exegetical history. St. Bernard and others even used it at times as an argument for allowing the Jews a peaceful co-existence with medieval Christians, since it suggested that it was God's will that they *not* be converted until the end.<sup>6</sup> While this kind of reasoning will not meet modern standards of mutual respect between religions, it was, by medieval standards, a big step in the right direction. Joachim — perhaps himself Jewish in origin and certainly attacked as such<sup>7</sup> — had done better still. He envisioned Christians and Jews as having an *equal* share in the mission of the Holy Spirit during the coming *Tertium Status* (roughly, "Third Age") of history. The centrepiece of Joachim's originality as an exegete was his division of Salvation History into consecutive but overlapping Trinitarian periods of the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit respectively, each of which he called a *status* (that is, *state or condition*).<sup>8</sup> Joachim, a visual thinker, diagrammed this

5 In this discussion I am indebted to Daniel, "Apocalyptic Conversion," and Daniel, *The Franciscan Concept of Mission*.

6 Bernard of Clairvaux, writing in 1146, appealed to prophecies of the final salvation of the Jews in condemning the persecution against them initiated by the monk Rudolph (Epistles 263 and 265); cited in Daniel, "Apocalyptic Conversion," 137 (from *PL* 182.567-68 and 570-71).

7 In *The Feast of Saint Abraham*, Lerner details the intriguing if fragmentary evidence, including Joachim's unusual name, his apparent knowledge of some Hebrew liturgy and exegesis, and, most stunning, Geoffrey of Auxerre's attack on Joachim as "Judaic" in his perspectives and thus not fully Christianized. For Geoffrey's attack, see the edition by Grundmann, *Ausgewählte Aufsätze*, 2:358-60.

8 In chapter four of the *Liber concordia*, Joachim explains these three periods, initially using the word *tempus*, and then consciously shifting to *status*: "Thus the harvest or the particular property of the first *tempus* — or as we ought better say of the first *status* — lasted from Abraham to Zachary, the father of John the Baptist"; translated by Daniel, who helpfully preserves the Latin for each term throughout, in McGinn, *Apocalyptic Spirituality*, 124. On Joachim's use of the term *status*, see Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 87-89 and 220-23.

idea as intertwining branches of Jewish and Gentile generations growing out of Shem and Japheth, the sons of Noah who respectively begot the two nations (see *Figure 1*). As the Trinitarian “tree” indicates, the foliage on the left outgrows that on the right as the Hebrew people excel the Gentiles in divine illumination during the age of the Father; they reverse roles during the age of the Son and come to a glorious equality during the age of the Holy Spirit. Even during the lean generations of each nation, as Lerner shows, Joachim did what he could to suggest that spirituality was not inactive (so, for instance, Ruth and Job help account for some *viriditas* on the Gentile side during the Old Testament period). The fructification in this, the earliest extant *Liber figurarum* manuscript anywhere (which is known to have been in England by the sixteenth century and plausibly by the fifteenth or earlier), may even have been made in Fiore under Joachim’s direction. The Florentine order (that is, the order that Joachim himself founded) owned English properties, and there were numerous Florentine connections with English monasteries; some especially documentable with St. Augustine’s, Canterbury, which, as early as the mid-thirteenth century, may have been a conduit for Insular Joachite manuscripts.<sup>9</sup> Whether it was by this route at any point during the intervening centuries or finally in consequence of the dissolution of the Florentine monasteries in the sixteenth century, this late twelfth- to early thirteenth-century treasury of Joachim’s original visual thought was bequeathed to Corpus Christi College by an Oxford student who began his studies in 1594 and whose grandfather was known to have collected Canterbury manuscripts (see List below for Oxford, Corpus Christi College, MS 255A).

By the later thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, the writings of several disciples and pseudonymous imitators were also in broad transmission in England, carrying some version of Joachim’s message into a variety of venues. These items could range from boldly Judeo-centric writings (like that by Pseudo-John of Lignano in Cambridge University Library, MS Dd.i.17) to vague prophecies of the peaceful conversion of the Jews during the End Times. In addition to the many anonymously transmitted works — by far the safest medium for Joachimism after the Franciscan Spiritual movement became the target of John XXII’s bloody vendetta — a number of works by named authors can be found in English libraries. As the List below indicates, the names of Franciscan Spiritual-influenced Joachites like Peter Olivi, John of Rupescissa, and Arnold of Villa Nova

---

<sup>9</sup> See Wannemacher, *Hermeneutik*, 279-81, esp. n. 68, summarizing the findings of Italian historians of Joachim’s order on exchanges with the Canterbury monastery. Beatrice Hirsch-Reich, in Tondelli, Reeves, and Hirsch-Reich’s introduction to Joachim’s *Il libro delle figure*, 20, argued for a fifteenth-century arrival.



Figure 1. Joachim of Fiore's diagram of the intertwining branches of Jewish and Gentile generations, ending in a glorious equality during the final age of the Holy Spirit. Reproduced by permission of the President and Fellows of Corpus Christi College, Oxford.

all appear in English collections, even though evidence of censorship exists in each case, as do pseudonymous attributions.<sup>10</sup> A fourth, less well known Continental prophet, John of Bassigny, also wrote an empathetic text that circulated in England (“Tacui et semper silui” [I have been silent and have always kept still]), originally arising out of his close personal relationships with Jews, as Lerner shows.<sup>11</sup> Having borrowed from Jewish exegesis in calculating coming apocalyptic events,<sup>12</sup> Arnold of Villa Nova was explicitly attacked for “crypto-Judaism” (in Lerner’s succinct phrase) in England in 1313 by Oxford Chancellor Henry of Harclay. This reception history, however, betrays an almost comic irony: in works which are not known to have been transmitted in England, Arnold had actually expressed anti-Jewish sentiments, but his Insular reputation for “Judaic tendencies” was likely furthered there by his *Tractatus de mysterio cimbalarum ecclesiae*, which cites a prophecy (of uncertain authorship) called “Ve mundo in centum annis” predicting the coming of a great reformer or “novus David.”<sup>13</sup> Arnold’s writings survive, for instance, in an Oxford composite manuscript, likely at Queen’s College in Wyclif’s day (see Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Lat. Misc. c. 75 below).<sup>14</sup> The English transmission of John of Rupescissa’s *Vade mecum* is a more interesting though complex case. John recreated Joachim’s see-sawing *translatio studii* by showing that, even though Christ had shifted the seat of the Church from Jerusalem to Rome in the age of Jewish “unbelief,” in the final age Jerusalem would recover its glory under the Jews. The holy city would then be led by an “Augustus from the seed of Abraham,” a holy world emperor guiding the newly converted Jewish forces, which would destroy Rome.<sup>15</sup> John, it should be noted, spent much of his adult life imprisoned by ecclesiastical authorities and had a severe case of the classic Franciscan Spiritualist disillusionment with the institutional (i.e., Roman) Church. Admittedly, what he is describing is the conversion of Jews to Christianity, though in ecumenical terms very similar to those Langland would use

---

10 For a fuller treatment of the censorship issues in relation to England, see Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, chap. 2.

11 See List below under London, British Library, MS Cotton Cleopatra C.IV and MS Lansdowne 762; for John’s relationships with Jewish people, see Lerner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham*, 83-88.

12 Pelster, “Die Quaestio.”

13 Discussed in Kerby-Fulton, *Reformist Apocalypticism*, 182 and n. 77, especially in relation to other such prophecies. The “Jewish tendencies” which Arnold was accused of are mentioned by Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 316.

14 See Lerner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham*, 133n, for relations between thirteenth-century Hebrew exegesis and Arnold’s method of apocalyptic calculations. See Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, 104 and 194-95, for further details about the manuscript’s complex history.

15 Lerner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham*, 79-81, citing *Liber secretorum*, 192-93.

just two decades later, terms, that is, which retain Jewish perspectives (as in *Piers Plowman* C. III. 453-55, discussed below). But no matter how he imagined the conversion to proceed, John of Rupescissa's giving the Jews the leading role in the last act of the world is powerful testimony to Joachite influence. These ideas, from his *Liber secretorum eventurorum*, are quite watered down in his *Vade mecum in tribulatione*, the work best known in England. But the *Vade* does speak directly of a "David futurus," a great reformer who will chastise the negligent clergy and usher in a utopian period of spirituality.<sup>16</sup> In all his works, the anger with the present Christian Church that feeds this striking *translatio studii* is evident.

England could also boast native Joachite writers: Henry of Costesy (or "Cossey") and probably Walter Brut, both respectful or hopeful of the role of Jews in the Latter Age. One of the more conservative of the Joachite treatments, Henry's *Commentarius super Apocalypsim*, was especially popular in England, with eight medieval library citations and five extant copies (see below). Having survived citation to Avignon on heresy charges during John XXII's reign of terror, Henry is less adventurous, but he still downplays the traditional apocalyptic role of the Jews in the vanguard of Antichrist and instead focuses on a pouring out of the Holy Spirit in the coming age which will newly illuminate the Bible and allow a "certain order" (doubtless his own Franciscans) to convert the Jews by preaching.<sup>17</sup>

Joachite notions of Judaism are, of course, tied closely to ideas about the *Tertium Status*, ideas which, because of their perceived dangerousness, are frequently downplayed in Insular manuscripts from the 1250s onwards or sometimes even directly suppressed. In some cases the disapproval dates back to 1215, when the Fourth Lateran Council condemned a technical aspect of the abbot's Trinitarian thought.<sup>18</sup> But it would be wrong to assume that these ideas did not circulate in England; in fact, they often circulated anonymously. The popular *Columbinus Prophecy*, which survives in at least ten manuscripts,<sup>19</sup> prophesies that Christ will "kill" Antichrist "by the spirit of his mouth

---

16 See the *Vade mecum*, 502, ed. Brown (see note 75 below) on Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Rawlinson D. 339), discussed in more detail in Kerby-Fulton, *Reformist Apocalypticism*, 182.

17 Burr, *Olivi's Peaceable Kingdom*, 256, citing Oxford, Bodleian Library, Bodl. Misc. 85, fols. 110v-115r; Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, 81-87 and 100-103.

18 Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, chap. 2. See, for instance, the discussions of London, British Library, MSS Harley 3969 and Royal 8.FXVI below.

19 For the full list and multiple editions, see Kerby-Fulton and Daniel, "English Joachimism, 1300-1500," esp. 335-36 for the text quoted below, from London, British Library, MS Cotton Cleopatra C.X; Lesley Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 253, lists an unnoticed copy in London, British Library, MS Additional 14251, fol. 216v, *incipit* "Attende secundum Eusebium." I have not yet seen this manuscript.

on Mt. Sinai,” whereupon “all peoples will know the power of our Lord Jesus . . . and there will be one sheepfold and one shepherd and the rest of Israel will be made free” (“et tunc erit unum ovile et unus pastor et reliquie Israel solvere fient”). The prophet then pours scorn on the Roman Church, which will suffer the humiliation of being reduced to three cardinals and of seeing wild animals (“bruta animalia”) feast upon the altars of Saints Peter and Paul (in Rome). Perhaps one of the most exciting among English finds is the rare Pseudo-John of Lignano prophecy, appearing in Cambridge University Library MS Dd.i.17. Genuinely Joachite in its privileging of Rachel and Leah as the keys to understanding Salvation History, the prophecy promotes Rachel, not Mary, as the mother of universal redemption.<sup>20</sup> It is significant for Middle English specialists that this prophecy appears in a large compilation, entirely written in the hand of one scribe, which also contains *Piers Plowman*, *Mandeville’s Travels*, and other works on marvels and history, selected in part, apparently, for their alternative views of salvation.

When Langland thinks of the Jews, he has a tendency to think (like the compiler of Dd.i.17) apocalyptically. Thus, in Passus III, Conscience prophesies a period of peace so astonishing “That Iewes shal wene in her wit and wexen so glade / That here kyng be ycome fro þe court of heuene, / That ilk Moises or Messie, þat men ben so trewe” (C. III. 453-55).<sup>21</sup> This coming period is one of unity under one holy world leader, as in the *Columbinus Prophecy*, a future type of David (line 440), as in John of Rupescissa’s *Vade mecum* and in Arnold’s “Ve mundo.” This great event will be preceded by evil times during which, nonetheless, “the myddell of þe mone shal make þe Iewes turne / And Saresines for þat syhte shal syng *Credo in spiritum sanctum*” (C. III. 479-80). The new order, then, will begin at the time of the Paschal moon (an ecumenical image), expressed with a Joachite-style emphasis on the Holy Spirit (*in spiritum sanctum*) in the final age of history.

Langland, of course, imagines conversion as either miraculous (as here) or elsewhere as reasoned but never forced (and the same is true for his treatment of the Muslim peoples).<sup>22</sup> This represents the kind of ‘channel crossing’ which both Delany and

20 See Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, Case Study 1. In “Asneth and Other Hebrew Mothers,” Reid discusses the Middle English translation known as *The Storie of Asneth* in relation to the miraculous conception attributed to Rachel, her identification with the Jewish synagogue, and the question of Joachite influence.

21 For further discussion of this passage in Langland, see Kerby-Fulton, *Reformist Apocalypticism*, 180-83.

22 As to the latter, Metlitzki refers to Langland as highly tolerant for his time; Metlitzki, *The Matter of Araby*, 197-209.

Nisse, in different ways, have wisely insisted we try harder to understand. Walter Brut, another late medieval English author who exhibits a strong familiarity with Continental apocalypticism, also shows striking respect for Jewish thought.<sup>23</sup> Like the author of the John of Lignano prophecy, and like Arnold of Villa Nova, he dares to calculate numerically the coming of Antichrist and demolishes the popular legendary notions of his birth (“quod fabula illa ab errore ymaginancium [*sic*]”). This he does by demonstrating that they are unbiblical and by extending the same kind of respect toward non-Christian peoples as does Joachite thought.<sup>24</sup> For instance, he assures the reader that the Jewish people would never be so foolish as to be seduced by a Messiah claiming to be from the tribe of Dan; they know, he says, that their messiah will be from the tribe of Judah and will be peaceful, not warlike (“quod esset pacificus, non bellicosus”). Here he gives an eloquent and moving description, based on the Old Testament prophets, of the Messiah the *Jews* expect. In short, Walter Brut considers the Jews a good deal more intelligent than the multitude of Christians who have fallen for Antichrist *fabulae*. As Curtis Bostick has shown, paralleling Mary Dove’s work in Delany’s collection, this friendliness toward Jewish thought and exegesis was, to some extent, a feature of Wycliffite dissent; Wycliffites used it to reach back before present occlusions. Langland used it, I might add, *to get out ahead* of them.

Joachite thought also influenced some of the English political prophecy of the day, with its own habitual and partisan channel crossings, normally in the form of projections about an English king becoming the Last World Emperor and uniting the world under one shepherd, often in Jerusalem.<sup>25</sup> There were, then, as many ways to use Joachite material as there were authors. What they all have in common, ultimately, is their origin; Joachim had believed that the Jews would have an *equal* role in building the New Jerusalem, and that is why the question of Joachite influence in all these areas of Insular thought commands our attention and respect.

---

23 See Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, chap. 5.

24 *Registrum Johannis Trefnant*, 296-97.

25 For much vaguer dissemination of Joachite-style ideas, see some of the short, more politically charged prophecies listed in several of the manuscripts below, like “Flamine Romano,” “Ter tria lustra,” and “Gallorum levitas.” Copies of these texts are legion, and I have not attempted to register all of them. For detailed listings, see Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, “Handlist of Manuscripts,” 239-80, and her index. Coote’s interest, however, is in political history, and thus she does not much discuss the Joachite dimensions of these texts.

## List of Joachite Manuscripts of English Origin or Provenance before 1600

### ***A Note on Using this Chart***

My goal in this list has been to provide key information in a simple format and reserve detailed comments for the footnotes. Also, given the limited space available here, I have tried to highlight mainly the features of a manuscript's contents that will be of interest to those who study Joachimism, prophecy, apocalypticism, or related issues of Church history like Judaism and conversion. Where a published description of a manuscript is available, a footnote refers the reader to that source; where the description is inadequate, I have tried to supplement it in the footnotes; where a description does not exist, a footnote gives a brief description, including contents, booklet structure, or collation. Where a manuscript is made up of separate booklets, the date refers to the booklet containing the Joachite material. Due to space limitations, information on modern editions, where they exist, may not always be directly cited here, but can be found in the further scholarship cited in the footnote. Modern editions of Joachim's writings, or of those by Pseudo-Joachite writers not explicitly mentioned here, may be found in the second edition of Marjorie Reeves' *The Influence of Prophecy*, Appendix A: The Genuine and Spurious Works of Joachim, or in Select Bibliography I and II. I follow the titles Reeves uses for these works throughout.<sup>26</sup> Those published since 1993 may be found in the list of editions in Julia Eva Wannemacher, *Hermeneutik der Heilsgeschichte*, 357-64, or at <http://oliviana.revues.org>.

---

26 I would like to thank especially Robert Lerner for kindly looking over this chart for me and offering several suggestions and points of information, as well as Christoph Egger and Sylvain Piron for their careful reading and advice.

## Copies of English Provenance before 1600

Shelfmark	Joachite Contents	Earliest Known Owner or Provenance	Date and Origin
London, British Library, Harley 3049 <sup>27</sup>	Joachim's <i>Enchiridion super Apocalypsim</i> , ff. 135-218v (new foliation), <sup>28</sup> defective, and spurious <i>extracta</i> claiming to be "de Expositione Abbatis Joachym super ysaiam," ff. 253v-254 <sup>29</sup>	William Ebchester, Prior of Durham 1446-56, <sup>30</sup> d. 1448	1446-56

27 See *A Catalogue of the Harleian Manuscripts*, no. 3049, which, however, cites the old foliation. The first leaf of Joachim's piece has been removed (before fol. 135 [old fol. 137]). There is also a leaf cut out between fols. 129 and 130 (new foliation) at the beginning of Jerome's commentary on the Apocalypse, and the leaf containing Jerome's comments on the number of the Beast has also been cut out between fols. 134 and 135. The book is large (measuring 10" × 15") and has splendid, but rather rudely executed decoration in green, blue, ochre, and gold leaf on initial folios of individual works. It is composed of quires of twelve with quire signatures often visible. It contains, in addition, several works by St. Ambrose (including *De Spiritu Sancto*), two by Jerome (including a "brevis explanatio super Apocalypsim"), two by Isidore, and a collection of items, a number by friars, relating to the power of the papacy (mostly in the *questio* genre). At the end, just before the spurious item attributed to Joachim, is a list of the seats of the archbishops and bishops of the world. The manuscript has been very carefully corrected in a bastard secretary hand; corrections were first written in a cursive hand in the lower margin and were meant to be cropped (see, e.g., fol. 163); the main text is in a secretary hand.

28 Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 26 n. 3 and bibliography listed there on textual matters.

29 This claim is brazen (see the discussion in Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, 88-89 and 433 n. 57); the full heading reads, "Hec extracta sunt de expositione abbatis Joachym super ysaiam vbi agit de onere babilonis," a title which mixes allusion to *Super Esaiam* and *De oneribus prophetarum*. The little piece, however, is largely about the Waldensians, the Wycliffites, and the Hussites and their doctrine of clerical possessions (making Joachim very far-sighted for a twelfth-century prophet!). But it is worth noting that Joachim himself discusses heresy (the Cathars) in the *Expositio in Apocalypsim* (Venice, 1527), fols. 130v-135, which may have emboldened the pseudonymous writer. On the latter, see Paolini, "Italian Catharism and Written Culture," 90-91. I am grateful to Marjorie Reeves for advice on this passage.

30 A note on fol. 1v at the opening of the Table of Contents says that Ebchester "fecit hunc librum fieri" while he was Prior of Durham. For Ebchester's career, see Emden, *Biographical Register of the University of Oxford*, 1:622.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
London, British Library, Harley 3969 <sup>31</sup>	Joachim's <i>Praephatio super Apocalypsim</i> , ff. 216-24 (defective) <sup>32</sup>	Emmanuel College <sup>33</sup>	s. xiii with annota- tion in hand of s. xiv
Oxford, Corpus Christi College 255A <sup>34</sup>	Joachim's <i>Liber figurarum</i> , ff. 4-14	May have arrived in England between s. xiii and s. xv; it is first known to have belonged to Bryan Twynes, who arrived at Oxford in 1594	Italian, late s. xii / early s. xiii <sup>35</sup>

- 31 Described in *A Catalogue of the Harleian Manuscripts*, and discussed in more detail in Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, 88-92. There is a Table of Contents on the flyleaf in a contemporary hand, fol. 233v. In addition to the grammatical, classical, and medical texts in the manuscript, there are several historical items, including William of Malmesbury, and items on marvels and prognostications, including "De presagiis temporum," fol. 224, and *De septem mirabilibus mundi*, often given this title and attributed to John of Salisbury, as in this manuscript (see also note 118 below). For its correct title, *De septem septenis* and attribution to Robert de Curzon, see Sharpe, *Handlist*, 310. Harley 3969 measures 8.5" × 12.5" and is ruled to accommodate professional marginal annotation such as the reader guides throughout the Joachim piece, supplemented in a later medieval hand. It has professionally executed initials and decoration similar to those in Sloane 156.
- 32 Collated in the edition of this text by Selge, "Eine Einführung Joachims von Fiore," 85-131. The folio carrying the opening of the text has been torn out (between fols. 215 and 216) with the result that the text begins defectively at line 28, p. 103 of Selge's edition, thereby omitting the primary discussion of the three *status*, which opens the text.
- 33 Under "List of Manuscripts Now Missing," James prints a detailed description of a manuscript exactly like Harley 3969 from an eighteenth-century catalogue of Emmanuel College, Cambridge; see MS 257 in James, *Western Manuscripts... Emmanuel College*, 157. All twenty items of the contents agree exactly with the contents of Harley. Most important for students of Joachim is the system of rubrics, marginal guides, and later annotations, all of which attempt to trace Joachim's concords.
- 34 Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 518; Tondelli, Reeves, and Hirsch-Reich, *Il libro delle figure*. For its English provenance, see Wannemacher, *Hermeneutik*, 279-81.
- 35 Many of the manuscripts from Canterbury came into the possession of Bryan Twyne's grandfather, John Twyne, which strengthens the possibility of an earlier Canterbury route of transmission; see Watson, "John Twyne of Canterbury," 133-51. For the argument that the manuscript was produced at Fiore, see Troncarelli, "A Terrible Beauty," 7-40, and the discussion in Lerner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham*, 27-28 and 134n. I am grateful to Robert Lerner for his advice on the provenance of this manuscript.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
London, British Library, Royal 8. F.XVI, Part A <sup>36</sup>	Part A: “Liber excerptionum abbatis Joachim,” containing excerpts from the <i>Liber Concordia</i> , f. 1; the Prologue and “Introductio in Expositionem Appocalypsis,” f. 24; Joachim’s “Epistola Universis Christi Fidelibus,” ff. 35-37, from the <i>De oneribus prophetarum</i> , and ff. 38-44; <sup>37</sup> “Expositio Iezechielis Prophete,” f. 44; followed by a copy of the very rare Protocol of Anagni, f. 45v, <i>inc.</i> “Et notauimus” <sup>38</sup>	Richard Kilvington, Dean of St. Paul’s, 1353-61, signed his name on every bifolium of the manuscript	s. xiv (med.)

36 For description, see Warner, *Catalogue of Western Manuscripts in the Old Royal and Kings Collections*, 1:273; for detailed discussion, see Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, 89-94 (and see the next note). The first and last leaves of Part A, fol. 1 and fol. 54v, were once outer leaves and are very stained and dirty. The decoration looks English and is by the same hand throughout. The manuscript has been very carefully corrected by the main scribe and especially checked for wrongly expanded abbreviations (e.g., fol. 20v and fol. 34), showing that the scribe was comparing his work with yet another exemplar of this rare text. There are annotations in both a contemporary hand (e.g., fol. 2v and fol. 3) and a later hand (e.g., fols. 27, 29, and 29v), sometimes using a system of signs. The only note in the Protocol section is, significantly, “Super Bestia.”

37 The text largely follows the one in Holder-Egger, “Italienische Prophetieen...III,” 96-187, but is a different redaction. One exception striking in an Insular context appears on fol. 39r, where a large piece of text is missing, corresponding to Holder-Egger, “Italienische Prophetieen...III,” 152: “A pressurarum igitur oneribus...” in which it runs to the beginning of the heading *Secunda distinctio*, Holder-Egger, 171. Since this has the effect of removing the section called “De statibus” in other manuscripts, one can only assume that the omission may have been deliberate. Moreover, Bériou identifies this version of the text as a copy of a redaction by Pierre de Limoges, now in Paris, Bibliothèque nationale Française, MS Lat. 16397, and notes that neither copy is collated in Holder-Egger’s edition; see Bériou, “Pierre de Limoges,” 65-107, esp. 74. I would like to thank Robert Lerner for mentioning Bériou’s study to me.

38 Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 521.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
London, British Library, Sloane 156 <sup>39</sup>	John of Rupescissa, <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 19v (once f. 150v), <i>De oneribus</i> , f. 34, <sup>40</sup> followed by <i>Ioachim in maiori</i> <sup>41</sup> <i>libro de concordanciis</i> on f. 41		s. xv
London, Cotton Tiberius B.V, Part II <sup>42</sup>	<i>Praemissiones</i> , ff. 89-91; <i>Super Esaiam</i> , ff. 92-117; followed by an unnoticed copy of <i>De oneribus prophetarum</i> , ff. 118-138v <sup>43</sup>	Unknown before Robert Cotton	s. xiv

- 39 London, British Library, MS Sloane 156 is largely unstudied and has only been partially described; see Scott, *Index to the Sloane Manuscripts*. It is briefly mentioned by Bloomfield, *Piers Plowman*, Appendix I. Fol. 1 contains a Table of Contents in a late hand, fols. 2-6 a prophecy in English in a later (i.e., secretary) hand, followed by some medical texts (fol. 7 “Remedia contra morbos,” fol. 9v “De ponderibus medicorum”). Most of the rest of the manuscript is apocalyptic in nature: in addition to the Joachite texts mentioned in the table above, on fol. 11 begins “Tractatus de Antichristo et fine mundi,” a short work of conventional eschatology. On fol. 41v, in copying “Ioachim in magno libro,” the scribe apparently switched to an older exemplar, because after the date 1347, he starts imitating an older anglicana hand. A catchword (“in terram”) on the bottom of fol. 41v makes clear that something is missing between that leaf and text that follows on fol. 42, suggesting the following collation: i<sup>6</sup> | ii<sup>4</sup> | iii<sup>8</sup> (wants 1) iv – vii<sup>8</sup> | viii<sup>11</sup>. In an email message dated 26 Oct. 2006, Robert Lerner kindly provided me with the following information: “I might add that I take the MS to have been copied c.1350, that the Rupescissa *Vade mecum* may be one of the best surviving, and that the opening Antichrist text (missing the opening part) is the Antichrist section from Hugo Ripelin.”
- 40 “Incipit liber Joachimi abbatis florentis. Henrico sexto inclito Romanorum augusto frater Joachim, abbas florentis. Pie petis aliquid de propheciis qui vel tempora tua respiciunt . . .” and ends, fol. 41v: “dolor dabit super miseram egiptu.” It appears to be an abridgement of the text as edited by Holder-Egger, “Italienische Prophetieen . . . III.”
- 41 Here “magno.” This text forms part of a small collection of short prophecies added on to the *De oneribus*, among them, on fol. 40v, a text of the Tripoli prophecy not mentioned in Lerner, *Powers of Prophecy*.
- 42 Planta, *Catalogue of . . . the Cottonian Library*, and Smith, *Catalogue of . . . the Cottonian Library*.
- 43 I follow here the older foliation to coincide with Reeves’ description. The opening of *De oneribus* is not clearly marked, and therefore Reeves thought the entire text was *Super Esaiam*, but the “Onus phylis-tini” of *De oneribus* begins on fol. 118, the “Onus Moab” on fol. 118v, the “Onus Damasca” on fol. 120, and so on, until fol. 138, where we read, “Explicit tractatus honerum prophetarum.” (Cf. Holder-Egger’s edition in his “Italienische Prophetieen . . . III,” which is ordered slightly differently.) Moreover, a brief new text, “Ecce ab honeribus omnibus expediti quibus orbis in suis urbibus . . .” begins on fol. 138v.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Bodley 40 <sup>44</sup>	“Creditis, O fratres, hec omnia?” a poem on the condemnation of Joachim in 1215 provoked by his Trinitarian dispute with Peter Lombard <sup>45</sup>	Owned by Alexander, Austin Prior at Canons’ Ashby, Northampton, (fl. 1220s)	s. xiii (in.)
Cambridge, Corpus Christi College 321 <sup>46</sup>	Peter Olivi’s <i>Postilla super Mattheum</i> copied as anonymous, but attributed to William of Auvergne in a contemporary note	“R-ye,” i.e., Ramsey Abbey <sup>47</sup>	Late s. xiv
Oxford, New College 49 <sup>48</sup>	Olivi’s <i>Postilla super Mattheum</i> , ascribed as “Petrus Iohannis,” with <i>caveat lector</i> warning of Olivi’s status as “hereticus” and “unus complicitibus Ioachimi abbatis heresiarche” <sup>49</sup>	John Whethamstede, <sup>50</sup> Abbot of St. Albans	s. xv, (1420-1440) <sup>51</sup>

44 See Hunt, Madan, and Craster, *Summary Catalogue of Western Manuscripts in the Bodleian Library*.

45 For a transcription and discussion, see Bloomfield and Reeves, “The Penetration of Joachism,” 784-85.

46 Described in James, *Catalogue... Corpus Christi College, Cambridge*.

47 Douie, “Olivi’s Postilla,” 67, for description; a folio (s. xi) containing an Anglo-Saxon dialogue of Bede’s is interpolated, suggesting English provenance.

48 Described in Coxe, *Catalogi*.

49 “Erat quidam Petrus Iohannis hereticus, unus complicitibus Ioachimi abbatis heresiarche, cum ergo non constat cuius Petri Iohannis hoc opus sit, non alienum putavi ab offitio meo imprudentem lectorem admonere,” (fol. 159v; the rest is erased); see Douie, “Olivi’s Postilla,” 68 n. 9; and for discussion, see Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, xiv and 95-99. Dating the hand that created this note is not easy. Coxe says only that it is “recentior” than the hand that copied the manuscript. It looks like a slightly, but not fully humanist-influenced hand of the mid or late fifteenth century. In fact, there are several examples of such hands in English manuscripts even during Whethamstede’s lifetime; see Watson, *Catalogue of Dated and Datable Manuscripts in Oxford Libraries*, plate 453 of St. John’s College 35, fol. 9v, dated as England, 1447; plate 415 of Balliol College 122, fol. 265, dated as Oxford, 1442; plate 426(b) of Bodley 742, fol. 302, dated as England, 1444. There is no sign of classicized Latin orthography in the note (e.g., “hereticus” and “heresiarche” are not classicized), suggesting that the hand, whatever its date, is medieval, not Renaissance.

50 On Whethamstede, see Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, 100-103.

51 Made during Whethamstede’s first tenure as abbot of St. Albans, during which period he paid 60 shillings for having it done. Unlike the other extant books he commissioned during this period, this one contains no explicit mention of his ownership, and the flyleaves have been deliberately excised. However, the “lamb and flag” decoration associated with him, and the evidence of library chaining which closely resembles that of Worcester College 233, show that there is no doubt it was donated to Gloucester College, Oxford, by Whethamstede. See Watson, *Catalogue of Dated and Datable Manuscripts*, 141.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Rome, Vatican Library, Urb. Lat. 480	A collection of Franciscan writings, containing the following by Olivi: <i>Postilla in Ecclesiastem</i> , ff.1-20; <i>Questio</i> , “Quomodo autem diligere christum sit melius quam...” (on Matt. 9), ff. 20v-22; <i>Postilla in Iob</i> , ff. 22-105v; <i>Expositio super regulam s. Francisci</i> , ff. 109-122; <i>Expositio in Dionysii de angelica hierarchia</i> , ff. 122-165v; <i>Postilla in cantica canticorum</i> , ff. 168-183 <sup>52</sup>	Written in an English hand	s. xiv (in.)
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Bodley 52 <sup>53</sup>	Olivi’s <i>De contractibus</i> , in an anthology dealing with a range of reformist and dissenting works by Ockham, William of St. Amour, and including Wycliffite materials	Written by John Maynesford, a fellow of Merton College	c.1420-30
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Laud Misc. 85 <sup>54</sup>	Henry of Costesy, <i>Commentarius super Apocalypsim</i> , ff. 67-172 (defective; mutilated; identified by a post-medieval hand) <sup>55</sup>	Pembroke College, Cambridge <sup>56</sup>	s. xiv (med.)

52 For a full description, see Stornajolo, *Codices Vrbinate Latini*, vol. 1, no. 480. The manuscript also contains works by Hugh of Digne and St. Bonaventure. Stornajolo notes that “tituli, fortasse marginibus excisis, desunt,” but that a sixteenth-century hand supplies a listing of Olivi’s works. I have not seen this manuscript, but this description fits the pattern of excision and erasure in Olivi’s other extant works of English provenance, discussed in Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion* (see note 49 above for further details). Olivi’s commentary on Pseudo-Dionysius (starting on f. 122) is currently being edited by Sylvain Piron; see Piron, “Deplatoning the Celestial Hierarchy.” Professor Piron tells me that the “English hand” of this manuscript may be that of an Aquitaine friar trained under English tutelage when the region was under English influence (private correspondence, 22 July 2008).

53 See Hunt, Madan, and Craster, *Summary Catalogue... Bodleian Library*, no. 1969. I am most grateful to Sylvain Piron for this reference. On Olivi’s work in this manuscript, see his “Marchands et confesseurs.”

54 For full description, see Coxe, *Bodleian... Laudian Manuscripts*, no. 85. And see the entry for Henry of Costesy (Cossey) in Sharpe, *Handlist of Latin Writers*, 166, for a full list of manuscripts and medieval attestations (see also the list of attestations below). The other authors it contains are Pecham, Grosseteste, and William of Auvergne; the Henry of Costesy commentary is copied by Hand 2, the most active of three hands in the manuscript, and also the corrector. It was once part of a much larger manuscript; the first item, the opening of the Pecham text, now fol. 1, was once fol. 175. Reader’s symbols like those designed by Grosseteste and used in university manuscripts appear, e.g., fol. 155v. The tendency, presumably Henry’s own, to use a great many informal handwritten diagrams of a Joachite kind to

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
St. Bonaventure, N.Y., St. Bonaventure University, (formerly Convent of the Holy Name) MS 69 <sup>57</sup>	Henry of Costesy, <i>Commentarius super Apocalypsim</i> , ff. 1r-(116), attributed to Petrus Aureolus		s. xiv
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Rawlinson C.16 <sup>58</sup>	Henry of Costesy, <i>Commentarius super Apocalypsim</i> , ff. 131-221 (identified only by a fifteenth- century hand)	Friar's <i>vade mecum</i> <sup>59</sup>	s. xiv

illustrate his points is evident in other Costesy manuscripts listed below (such as Rawlinson and Harley), but rarely used in Laud.

- 55 The Henry of Costesy commentary is defective at the end (its final words are “Sed genus, quia addit temporalis nativitatis”). It has also been deliberately mutilated in at least two ways: the opening rubric has been carefully cut away on the first folio (fol. 67v), that is, both the upper margin and the side margin (the places where authorship or other identifying annotation would be most likely to occur) have been removed. The decorative flourishing in the manuscript is of the most utilitarian sort. (This is a very plain Franciscan text, judging by the surviving opening pages, adorned only with standard blue capitals and red flourishing.) There would therefore have been no aesthetic temptation to make these cuts (see fol. 32, the Grosseteste opening, for a surviving instance of decoration). The knife used also injured, but did not remove, sections of fol. 66 and fol. 65. Secondly, there is a stub of a folio between what are now fol. 122 and fol. 123 which once contained most of the portion of the text on the name of the Beast; what now survives is a little of the inner margin and a note: “notate bestia.”
- 56 For the reasons why the book is likely to have originated in the Franciscan House at Cambridge, see Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, 84 and fig. 5, p. 85.
- 57 Originally Convent of the Holy Name, Washington, D.C., MS 69, now kept at St. Bonaventure University, St. Bonaventure, New York. Described in De Ricci and Wilson, *Census of Medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts in the United States and Canada* (vol. 1, section “District of Columbia – Holy Name College,” p. 481, no. 69), as written in England, but in modern times obtained from Germany. Significantly, the text is attributed in this manuscript to Petrus Aureolus; 24 × 18 cm in size.
- 58 Described in Macray, *Catalogi Codices Manuscriptorum... Ricardi Rawlinson*, Part 5, Vol. II. This tiny, heavily abbreviated, and roughly written text contains Bonaventure's *Breviloquium*, starting on fol. 1 (in a hand of s. xiii), in addition to the Henry of Costesy text (s. xiv, in fact, contemporary with Henry's lifetime). It is heavily annotated. On fol. 224v is a third short text, “De significatione symbolica forme jus jurandum imponende.” The text of Henry's commentary differs significantly in Rawlinson from the one in Laud. The text was only explicitly identified as Henry's in a hand of the fifteenth century, which wrote “lectura costeseye super Apocalypsim” on fol. 131 (i.e., the opening page). The same hand wrote “Cantelowe” in the lower margin of the page and also on the opening page of the Bonaventure text. This may be the name of a fifteenth-century owner.
- 59 As the contents and the tiny size suggest; see previous note on possible fifteenth-century ownership.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
London, British Library, Harley 7401 <sup>60</sup>	Henry of Costesy, <i>Commentarius super Apocalypsim</i> , ff. 1-117 (unattributed) <sup>61</sup>	Friar's <i>vade mecum</i>	s. xiv (med.)
London, Lambeth Palace 127 <sup>62</sup>	Henry of Costesy, <i>Commentarius super Apocalypsim</i> , ff. 117r-199 (defective)		s. xv
Dublin, Trinity College 244 <sup>63</sup>	"The Last Age of the Church," a vernacular Pseudo-Joachite tract, <sup>64</sup> <i>inc.</i> "Alas forsorwe grete prestis"	Called "De ultima aetate Ecclesiae," by John Bale <sup>65</sup>	s. xiv (ex.)- xv (in.)
London, Lincoln's Inn, Hale 73 <sup>66</sup>	John of Rupescissa's <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 134, embedded in the middle of the <i>Eulogium historiarum</i> , a chronicle with evident Franciscan emphaties which treats Joachim positively	Given by Bartholomeus Brokesby in 1437 to the Augustinian Priory of Kirby Bellars <sup>67</sup>	s. xiv (ex.)

60 Described in *A Catalogue of the Harleian Manuscripts*; see also Sharpe, *Handlist*.

61 Harley 7401 is a tiny, palm-size manuscript, undoubtedly a Franciscan *vade mecum* book. There are some summary annotations in the original scribe's hand (e.g., "stelle cadunt" on fol. 57v); there are also extensive sixteenth-century annotations. It is a utility-grade manuscript in every sense; Henry's many figures are simply and informally executed here, and it is in poor condition, apparently having been unbound for a long time early in its life.

62 *Catalogue of the Archiepiscopal Manuscripts...Lambeth Palace*, and see Sharpe, *Handlist*, and James, *A Descriptive Catalogue...Lambeth Palace*.

63 The manuscript is a large collection of vernacular Wycliffite materials, for a description of which, see Abbot, *Catalogue...Trinity College, Dublin*.

64 Pseudo-Joachite works cited by name (in Middle English translation) are: *De oneribus prophetarum*, *De semine scripturarum*, *Vaticinia de Summis Pontificibus*. "Gallorum levitas" is also cited as by the "Sibille"; see Kerby-Fulton, *Reformist Apocalypticism*, 184-86. The treatise is edited by Todd (who mistook it for a work by Wyclif; see Todd, *The Last Age*, xxi-xxxvi).

65 Bale gives the *incipit* in Latin translation, "Sacerdotes, proh dolor!" and also refers to the tract as "De Simonia Sacerdotum, lib. 1. Heu magni Sacerdotes in tenebris," in *Scriptorium Brytanniae Catalogus*, 1:453. See Todd, *The Last Age*, xvi.

66 See the description in Ker, *Medieval Manuscripts in British Libraries*, 1:127.

67 Perhaps originally written for a member of the Brokesby family, whose arms appear on fol. 27, although this may have been a later addition. Given to the Augustinian Priory of Kirby Bellars, Leicestershire,

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Cambridge, Trinity College 740 <sup>68</sup>	John of Rupescissa's <i>Vade mecum</i> , p. 393, embedded in the middle of the <i>Eulogium historiarum</i> (as in Hale 73 above)	Probably from Malmesbury	s. xiv
Dublin, Trinity College 497 <sup>69</sup>	John of Rupescissa's <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 1, <sup>70</sup> copied alongside the <i>Eulogium historiarum</i> , f. 9 (cf. Hale 73 and Trinity, Cambridge 740 above)	Unknown before Robert Cotton (f. 1)	s. xiv (ex.)
London, British Library, Royal 13.E.IX <sup>71</sup>	John of Rupescissa, letter to Archbishop of Toulouse (Stephanus Aldobrandi), <i>inc.</i> "Vos misistis" <sup>72</sup>	St. Albans	c.1400

by Bartholomew Brokesby (d. 1448) in 1437, which is significant because the continuation of the *Eulogium* (for 1356-1534) was done at Kirby Bellars, probably by Canon William Wymondham, whose colophon is on fol. 26v. The *Eulogium* mentions Joachim positively, both in the original version and in the continuation.

68 See James, *Western Manuscripts... Trinity College*, Cambridge, no. 740; and see Bignami-Odier, *Etudes sur Jean de Roquetaillade*, 245.

69 See Colker, *Trinity College... Dublin... Mediaeval and Renaissance Latin Manuscripts*.

70 Heavily glossed with marginal annotations and even drawings (e.g., fol. 3), concerning disendowment, the Franciscan order, earthquakes, Antichrist, and the coming "reparator orbis" (fol. 4) predicted by Rupescissa.

71 For the most recent and detailed description of this manuscript and its important copy of Walsingham's *St. Albans Chronicle* (which shows evidence of having suppressed sensitive political narrative at the accession of Henry IV), see Taylor et al., *The St. Albans Chronicle*, Appendix One. However, the editors still follow the *Royal Catalogue* description in not identifying the letter on fol. 94v, col. b, written by "an imprisoned friar to Pope Innocent VI" in 1356, as in fact Rupescissa's. The manuscript, which also contains *mirabilia* literature, *Mandeville's Travels*, the ubiquitous vision of Becket at Sens, and other chronicles, was made at St. Albans c.1400. On the manuscript context, see Kerby-Fulton, "Langland's Reading." On the letter itself ("Vos misistis") and on some of the textual differences between it and the printed version, see Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, 211 and 429 nn. 29, 30, and 34. The letter is printed from an English manuscript in Brown, pp. 404-406 of his London 1690 *Appendix ad Fasciculum rerum expetendarum et fugiendarum* by *Ortvinus Gratius*. On its occurrence in the *Prima Vita Innocentii VI*, see Robert Lerner's introduction to the text of Rupescissa's *Liber secretorum eventuum*, ed. Morerod-Fattebert, 40 n. 59.

72 I am grateful to Robert Lerner for advice about this. For another copy, see Cambridge, Corpus Christi College, MS 404 (below).

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Oxford, Bodleian Rawlinson D. 339 <sup>73</sup>	The copy of “Vos misistis,” f. 545, used by Edward Brown, followed by a second letter of Rupescissa’s, “Reverendissime Pater”	Copied or commissioned by William Crashaw (father of the poet Robert Crashaw)	c.1600
Oxford, Corpus Christi College 47 <sup>74</sup>	A very early copy of John of Rupescissa, <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 1 <sup>75</sup>	Donated to the college by Sebastian Benfield in 1605 <sup>76</sup>	s. xiv (med.) <sup>77</sup>
London, British Library, Royal 8.E.VII <sup>78</sup>	John of Rupescissa, <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 57, in a miscellany containing historical texts on Oxford and Cambridge, <i>questiones</i> directed against Wyclif; and “questio de duracione huius etatis mundi,” f. 73	<i>Questio</i> on f. 73 is copied “ex libris magistri Edmundi Lacy episcopi Exoniensi” (1421-1455)	s. xv
London, British Library, Harley 1008 <sup>79</sup>	Abridgement of John of Rupescissa’s <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 27, heavily annotated in relation to the Great Schism and in defence of Urban VI <sup>80</sup>		s. xiv (ex.) - xv (in.)

73 I am grateful to Robert Lerner for his advice about the dating and origin of the manuscript.

74 Described in Coxe, *Catalogi*.

75 The *Vade* is the only medieval item in the manuscript; it is bound with a printed edition of the *Speculum Ecclesiae Pontificiae Nicolaus Clemangis* (London, 1606). The text of the *Vade* contains an elaborate set of contemporary annotations made by Hand 2 (using a script of probably the second quarter of the fourteenth century). Hand 2 copied fols. 2-10v, after which Hand 3 takes over, a contemporary of Hand 2. The annotations show detailed interest in Antichrist, clerical poverty, clerical chastisement, and foreign affairs. The annotator is especially concerned with passages which predict the reduction of the clerical *modus vivendi* (e.g., fols. 3, 3v, and 4). Cropping has spoiled some of the annotator’s work, but it remains a very interesting example of contemporary marginalia.

76 “Liber Collegii Corporis Christi ex dono Sebastiani Benfield Bacchalaurei in S. Theologia socii ejusdam Collegii, 1605.”

77 Hand 1 of Corpus 47, which copied only fol. 1-1v of the text, writes a very early script, consistent with someone taught to write earlier in the fourteenth century. This text would have to have been written in England by a contemporary of John of Rupescissa and almost certainly before his death (not long after 1365).

78 Warner, *Catalogue of Western Manuscripts in the Old Royal and Kings Collections*, 1:253.

79 Described in *A Catalogue of the Harleian Manuscripts*.

80 See, e.g., the annotation on fol. 34v; on fol. 40v is the “Epistola soldani” and response. On fol. 40 is “Ter tria lustra,” a short prophecy of Church reform (on which see Kerby-Fulton, *Reformist Apocalypticism*, 187) and then a “Disputatione sompniorum” on fol. 44, all copied by Hand 3 of the manuscript.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
London, British Library, Cotton Cleopatra C.IV <sup>81</sup>	“Gallorum levitas,” f. 80; prophecy of John of Bassigny, “Tacui et semper silui,” f. 81v; <sup>82</sup> abstract of John of Rupescissa’s <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 113	Owned by Thomas Ulveston (or Wuluerston), fl. 1556 <sup>83</sup>	s. xv (ex.)
London, British Library, Lansdowne 762 <sup>84</sup>	Prophecy of John of Bassigny, “Tacui et semper silui,” f. 54		s. xvi (in.)
London, British Library, Royal 7.A.IX <sup>85</sup>	Extract from John of Rupescissa’s <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 3, ( <i>inc.</i> “Surget tunc popularis iusticia”) and a short treatise on the <i>Vade</i> , f. 4v ( <i>inc.</i> “Intellectio est” [defective])	Austin Priory, St. Mary’s, Southwark <sup>86</sup>	s. xv
London, Wellcome Institute 506 (Misc. XI) <sup>87</sup>	Extracts from Rupescissa’s <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 1		s. xv

On fol. 81, Hand 3 becomes active again and copies several political prophecies, including “Lilium regnans,” followed by a key and “Gens erit australis.”

- 81 A collection of largely political prophecies, for a full listing of which see Ward, *Catalogue of Romances*, 1:310-11; see also Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 256. The manuscript also includes the so-called *Bridlington Prophecies*, fol. 100, on which see Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 254-56, who reads them very astutely as a kind of secular Joachimism.
- 82 Called “John of Bessagoria” in this manuscript, an astrological prophet who gained a reputation in the mid-fourteenth century for foretelling the Black Death and whose prophecy here predicts an angelic pope; see Thorndike, *History of Magic*, 3:312-14. I would like to thank Robert Lerner for kindly sharing information with me about the “Tacui” prophecy and its author; on the manuscript, see Lerner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham*, 157-58 n. 39, and on his interest in the Jews, 83-88.
- 83 A letter of his appears on fol. 122v, in which he loans the book to M. Chester, hoping that he will profit by it because “I have no understandyng of yt butt a lyttyll.” (The modern reader empathizes!)
- 84 See Lerner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham*, 157-58 n. 39. I would like to thank Robert Lerner for advice about this.
- 85 Bignami-Odier, *Etudes sur Jean de Roquetaillade*, 250.
- 86 I would like to thank Robert Lerner for this piece of information.
- 87 Robert Lerner alerted me to this copy.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Cambridge, Corpus Christi College 404 <sup>88</sup>	A large anthology of prophetic texts, incl. an excerpt from Ralph of Coggeshall concerning Joachim's views on Antichrist, f. 6; <sup>89</sup> <i>Columbinus Prophecy</i> , f. 7v; <sup>90</sup> the <i>Pentachronon</i> collection of Hildegard's prophecies, f. 9; vision of John the Hermit, f. 39; <i>De Semine Scripturarum</i> , f. 43v; <sup>91</sup> <i>Oraculum Cyrilli cum Expositione Abbatis Joachim</i> , f. 67; <sup>92</sup> <i>Vaticinia de Summis Pontificibus</i> , f. 88; <sup>93</sup> <i>Joachim in maiori libro de concordanciis (Corruent nobiles)</i> , f. 100; <sup>94</sup> <i>Visio fratris Johannis</i> , f. 100; letter by John of Rupescissa, <i>inc.</i> "Vos misistis," f. 103 <sup>95</sup>	Benedictine house of Bury St. Edmunds, compiled largely by Henry of Kirkestede, librarian	s. xiv (med.), except <i>Vaticinia</i> : s. xiv. (in.)

88 Described in James, *A Descriptive Catalogue...Corpus Christi College*. MS 404 is an important and extensive anthology of prophetic texts gathered over a period of years by the Benedictine librarian at Bury St. Edmunds, Henry of Kirkestede, author of England's first union catalogue (see above). See *Henry of Kirkestede, Catalogus de libris authenticis et apocrifis*, ed. Rouse and Rouse, lxxvii-lxxxii; Lerner, *Powers of Prophecy*, 93-101; and Kerby-Fulton, *Reformist Apocalypticism*, 25, 209-210, and 237-38. I have listed here only the obviously Joachite pieces in the anthology, although there are others which are arguably relevant to or influenced by Joachimism. I have also mentioned Gebeno of Eberbach's compilation of Hildegard's prophecies, known as the *Pentachronon*, this being an especially interesting text of it (on which see Kerby-Fulton, "Prophecy and Suspicion"). Charl Harper and E. Randolph Daniel have kindly shared with me their forthcoming paper, "Henry of Kirkstede and the 'De Seminibus Scripturarum,'" which deals with this manuscript in detail. For a full listing of the political prophecies in this manuscript, see Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 241, and Holdenried, *Sybil*, 74.

89 For which see Ralph's *Chronicon Anglicanum*, ed. Stevenson, 67-70, and Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 12-14. See also Lerner's discussion of Henry of Kirkestede's version of the passage, important because Henry copied it into Corpus 404 from a manuscript at Coggeshall itself, and because it confirms that the interview between Joachim and Adam of Perseigny took place in 1195; see Lerner, *Powers of Prophecy*, 94 n. 21. As Lerner points out, Henry may have suppressed Joachim's name here. Christoph Egger has kindly communicated to me that the right form of Adam's name may be "Perseigne" (a Cistercian monastery in Maine, France), and that an alternative dating of the episode, if argued from the text as contained in Corpus 404, is likely.

90 Kerby-Fulton and Daniel, "English Joachimism, 1300-1500."

91 Called here *De Seminibus Litterarum*.

92 Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 523.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Cambridge, Corpus Christi College 138 <sup>96</sup>	<i>Vaticinium Sibillae Erithreae</i> , pp. 179-82, followed by political prophecies, and <i>Ioachim in maiori libro de concordanciis</i> ( <i>Corruent nobiles</i> ), p. 183, further political prophecies, and an excerpt from John of Rupescissa “ <i>abreviata de libro qui intitulatur ostensor futurorum</i> ”	Norwich, <sup>97</sup> and by 1545-1558, Cambridge <sup>98</sup>	s. xv
Cambridge, University Library Mm.I.16	<i>Vaticinium Sibillae Erithreae</i> , ff. 24-46, various political prophecies, and <i>Flamine romano</i> , f. 155 <sup>99</sup>		s. xiv

- 93 Containing the first fifteen only (*inc.* “Genus nequam”), and a very early copy; see Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 524, and Lerner, *Powers of Prophecy*, 96-98. For a helpful survey of the literature, see Lerner, “Recent Work on ‘Genus nequam’ Prophecies,” mentioning this manuscript.
- 94 Cited in Reeves as *Ioachim in maiori libro de concordanciis*, elsewhere often as *Corruent nobiles*; see Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 50, for the text of the prophecy, and Lerner, *Powers of Prophecy*, 58 n. 39, and 98 n. 33 (for Corpus 404), 120 n. 14 for all English copies joined to the Tripoli prophecy, and 193.
- 95 See also London, British Library, MS Royal 13.A.IX above.
- 96 Described in James, *Descriptive Catalogue...Corpus Christi College*; for a listing of the political prophecies, see Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 240.
- 97 A single leaf of vellum is inserted with entries in a hand of s. xiii after p. 216 with material relating to the bishop of Norwich. Corpus 138 contains items from chronicles and various items associated with the Avignon papacy, including the letters of 1333 relating to the Beatific Vision controversies, p. 157.
- 98 James notes that the flyleaf contains a table made for Parker (whose collection forms the basis of Corpus Christi’s present collection) by Robertus Recorde, M.D. Cambridge 1545, died 1558.
- 99 Copied in one hand; see description in *Catalogue of...Library of University of Cambridge*, and Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 520. For political prophecies, see the listing in Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 248, and Holdenried, *Sibyl*, 159. There is no record of when Cambridge, University Library MS Mm.I.16, which is of Spanish provenance, came to England; see Jostmann, *Sibilla Erithea Babilonica*, 411. I would like to thank Robert Lerner for his advice on this.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Oxford, Balliol College, 149 <sup>100</sup>	<i>Columbinus Prophecy</i> , f. 205v, followed by “Tractatus brevis de periculis” (William of St. Amour), ff. 206-18 <sup>101</sup>	Robert Thwaytes, Master of Balliol College (1450-56), and Chancellor of Oxford (1446) <sup>102</sup>	s. xiv (med)
Cambridge, Gonville and Caius College 230/116 <sup>103</sup>	<i>Flamine romano</i> , f. 22v <sup>104</sup> in the commonplace book of John Whethamstede, who commissioned the Olivi Matthew <i>Postilla</i> (see Oxford, New College 49 above)	Whethamstede, Abbot of St. Albans, c.1420-1440 <sup>105</sup>	s. xv
Oxford, St. John’s College 202 <sup>106</sup>	“De prophetia abbatis Ioachim,” f. 153v		s. xiv (in.)

100 Described in Mynors, *Catalogue...Balliol College, Oxford*.

101 These two items appear in the second booklet of the manuscript (which begins at fol. 107) and is a generation earlier than the first booklet (which was written not long after 1381). The first booklet contains mainly sermons but also a fragmentary copy of Uthred de Boldon’s defence, *Contra querelas fratrum*, fol. 63. The second booklet contains correspondence relating to the papacy, a commentary (“Moralitates quedam super librum Apo.” fol. 192), and a sermon. For a fuller discussion, see Kerby-Fulton, “Langland’s Reading” and *Reformist Apocalypticism*, 229; see also note 19 above.

102 A note on the flyleaf records that the volume was given to Balliol “ex legato magistri Roberti Thwaites quondam magistri eiusdem domus.”

103 Described in James, *Catalogue...Gonville and Caius Library*, vol. 2. The commonplace book of John Whethamstede, distinguished abbot of St. Albans and Benedictine representative at international Church councils. The book also contains, among other interesting entries, an article on papal power by Whethamstede himself, citing Dante, *De Monarchia*, and Marsilius of Padua, *De Ecclesiastica Potestate*, fol. 142 (*inc.* “Papa presidem supremus in ecclesia”), and an excerpt from John of Lignano on the Schism, fol. 167.

104 The prophecy does not mention Joachim explicitly, but it has a vaguely Joachite form of optimism and often travels with other Joachite or ecclesiastical reformist materials. It prophesies a “pax finalis” throughout the world, “unita fide simul et unitur ovile” (quoting here from the copy in Gonville and Caius 230, fol. 22v).

105 Whethamstede’s first tenure as abbot.

106 See the description in Hanna, *Catalogue...St. John’s College, Oxford*. I would like to thank Robert Lerner for alerting me to this manuscript.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Cambridge, Gonville and Caius College 249/277	An extensive collection of prophecies, incl. "Gallorum levitas," f. 182; "Ioachim in libro de honoribus," f. 183 (see also Trinity College Dublin 516); and an unnoticed extract from Robert of Uzès ("robertus de sey"), f. 183v; an abstract of John of Rupescissa's <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 216v; followed by the compiler's own treatise, f. 217, comparing Rupescissa's predictions with those of other prophets incl. "Joachimi" <sup>107</sup>	Compiled by Harryson <sup>108</sup>	c.1443-1473

- 107 One of the very few named compilers of such materials, John Harryson (or Herryson) was a Cambridge student and doctor of medicine, whose compilation is largely made up of historical texts (including a history of Cambridge) and prophecy. He is very interested in natural disasters, which partly explains his interest in apocalypticism. His comments on the *Vade mecum* passage take note of Rupescissa's predictions of floods, epidemics, tempests, and the moral effects of Antichrist's triumph (noting especially *intentio quinta*). His commentary asserts that Rupescissa's predictions are confirmed by a host of other prophets, whom he lists, and among whom is Joachim. Since James' *Catalogue* gives a very incomplete and sometimes inaccurate list of the short prophecies, and since Coote lists only the political prophecies (*Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 242-43), I shall give all *incipits* here; even though many items are simply political prophecies, several have been noticed in all three of Holder-Egger's "Italienische Prophetien" and elsewhere in modern Joachite studies: fol. 181 "Extincto herede regnans," fol. 181v "Tolle capud," fol. 182 "Regnum Scotorum," "Ter tria lustra" (see above, Harley 1008), and "Cambria carnerwan Anglie," fol. 182v "Gens normanorum," "Anglorum regnum," "Quando sambucus" (which includes "Gallorum levitas" here), "Veniet aquila" (see Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 534, who says it may be derived from *Super Heremiam*), and "Regina austri," fol. 183 "Catulus linxus in lupum," "Quoniam superbus," "Draco maxime fidet," "Sub gallo hispano," "In novissimo temporibus princeps," followed by "Ioachim in libro de honeribus: Ve tibi vitula eligans & gallus & galiam stupefcunt..." ending "propter tores superabit." (I have not found this in Holder-Egger's edition and suspect it is pseudo-pseudo-Joachim, to coin a term, especially since it is followed by "Surget leo," which is also claimed to be from *De oneribus*.) This is followed by "Pagani habentes vaticinia quam plura" and, on fol. 183v, "Veniet ab occidente," "Cedrus alta libani" (i.e., the Tripoli prophecy; see Lerner, *Powers of Prophecy*, 101 n. 42 and 222), "Denique de latero," "A longe petra veniet," "In occidus partibus," "Misterium hominis cuius," "Deposito diademate," followed by a rare Robert of Uzès extract, "Post hec factum est verbum domini ad me dicens: Serve meus congregati sunt..." ending "columba ingemiscet" (cf. Bignami-Odier, "Les Visions," 282). This is followed by "Gallus rex francie." On fol. 217, after the Rupescissa commentary, there are a few more prophecies: "Quando ego Thomas," fol. 217v, "Arbor fertilis," with a comparison to "Mortuo leone," and then the verses "*Bruti posteritas albanis associate*" (a correction to James, "Beati posteritas"), followed by "Lilium regnans," and "Lilium rex Francie." For the vernacular political prophecies that follow, see Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 243.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Paris, BNF Lat. 4126 <sup>109</sup>	<i>Oraculum Cyrilli cum Expositione Abbatis Joachim</i> , ff. 282-94 <sup>110</sup>	York Carmelites, compiled by Robert Popilton	s. xiv (ex.)
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Lat. Misc. c. 75 <sup>111</sup>	Arnold of Villa Nova(?), “Apologia de versuciis atque perversitatibus pseudo- theologorum at religiosorum,” f. 122 (begins defectively); <sup>112</sup> “Prophecía Venerabilis Abbatis Joachim contra religiosos tenentes ordinem mendicum. Insurgent gentes,” ff. 124v-125r; “Prophecía magistri Arnaldi de Villa Nova magistrum in medina ad bonefacium...,” f. 125r (in fact three letters by Arnold and “Quoniam scriptura,” in which he lists his previous titles on the question of pseudo-prophets, f. 126v); <sup>113</sup> <i>Epistola Cyrilli ad Abbatem Joachim</i> , f. 132, attributed here to Arnold	Franciscan convent, Oxford?/ later Queen’s College, Oxford	s. xii-xv

108 See Emden, *A Biographical Register of the University of Cambridge*, 290, who corrects the earlier assumption that Harryson had been chancellor of Cambridge (based on a misreading of the list of chancellors given in this manuscript, fol. 131v). Harryson writes here that he incepted “in sacris medicinis, licet indignus” in 1457. From 1449 to 1450, he was chaplain to the nuns of St. Radegund’s Priory in Cambridge, a vocational interest that may account for the notes on holy women related to the apostles “Nota quod S. Petronilla virgo...,” flyleaf.

109 Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 523. For the political prophecies in the manuscript, see Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 279.

110 The manuscript also contains Hildegardian material.

111 A large anthology made of booklets from more than one period, of which Booklets D and E are of concern here. These are described in the *Sotheby’s Sale Catalogue* of November 1973. Booklet D, containing 68 leaves, deals predominantly with the mendicant controversies of the thirteenth century, largely from a Franciscan perspective; it also contains excerpts from William of St. Amour’s *De periculis*, fol. 56. On the connections of this manuscript with the Franciscan house at Oxford, and, more certainly, with Queen’s College, see Kerby-Fulton, “Prophecy and Suspicion.” Booklet E, beginning at fol. 122, contains the Joachite material listed here. For a detailed description of the manuscript, see Kerby-Fulton, Hayton, and Olsen, “The Pseudo-Hildegardian Prophecy.” See also the earlier discussion and list in Little, *Frater Thomae*. Especially unusual is the attribution of “Insurgent gentes,” a piece almost universally (pseudonymously) attributed to Hildegard of Bingen, here attributed to Joachim. A copy of the material in Booklet E, or something very like it, was once a part of London, British Library, MS Cotton Vitellius E.II, which was badly damaged in the Cotton Library fire. See attestations below.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Dublin, Trinity College 347 <sup>114</sup>	<i>Ioachim in maiori libro de concordanciis</i> ( <i>Corruent nobiles</i> ), ff. 388v-389; "Dixit Ioachim quod primus status seculi," f. 398-398v <sup>115</sup>	Franciscan, Irish provenance	s. xiii (med.)
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Bodley 761 <sup>116</sup>	<i>Ioachim in maiori libro de concordanciis</i> ( <i>Corruent nobiles</i> )	Compiled for Thomas de Walmesford, <sup>117</sup> dependant of the Bohun family	s. xiv (2)
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Douce 88 <sup>118</sup>	<i>Vaticinia de Summis Pontificibus</i> , f. 138, illustrated		s. xiii

112 Moreover, the leaves of the quire are disarranged.

113 "Quoniam scriptura" lists three works, which the scribe has highlighted, and notes on fol. 126v: "1. Prophecia Catholica incipit Homines pestilentes; 2. Apologia de pseudo-theologorum et religioses; 3. Eulogium de noticia verorum & pseudo-apostolarum." In "Quoniam scriptura" Arnold lists "XII spurcicias" (*sic*, written over erasure; cf. "De spuracii" in the running headings) revealed to "Cirille" the hermit. Arnold's list seems to owe a great deal to Hildegard's Cologne letter and to "Insurgent gentes," which precedes it here, in informing the public about ways to distinguish pseudo-prophets.

114 Colker, *Trinity College...Dublin...Medieval and Renaissance Latin Manuscripts*, 2:976-1002; Kerby-Fulton, *Reformist Apocalypticism*, 210 and 240.

115 Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 529. The prophecy explains the three *status* but is mainly interested in the two orders. In fact, the rubric at the end of the prophecy reads, "Explicit prophecia ioachim de ordine fratrum minorum et predicatorum." On the official Franciscan content of the manuscript, see Esser and Olinger, *La Tradition*. The "Dixit Joachim" is genuinely Joachite in exegetical method; it is followed appropriately by an extract from Eusebius, fol. 389v (a writer who figures in the *Columbinus Prophecy*, on which see Kerby-Fulton and Daniel, "English Joachimism, 1300-1500"). On fol. 393 is the Wyenne Prophecy, which mentions that the teachers of theology at Paris will cease in 1255, and that in 1270 a pope will abandon Rome to be replaced by another. The interest in the Paris theology faculty in 1255 must stem from mendicant concern about the issues surrounding the condemnation of the radical Franciscan Joachite, Gerard of Borgo San Donnino, and William of St. Amour's attack on the friars.

116 Hunt, Madan, and Craster, *Summary Catalogue* II, Pt. 1, 413-15.

117 A rector of Sherfield in 1328. See also Lerner, *Powers of Prophecy*, 118 n. 6, for further bibliography on Bodley 761.

118 See Hunt, Madan, and Craster, *Summary Catalogue*, no. 21662, Booklet E. The manuscript also contains a treatise on monsters and portents, followed by *De septem mirabilibus mundi*, fol. 115v, and excerpts from the *Polycraticus* of John of Salisbury, fol. 116v. See also Kerby-Fulton, "Langland's Reading," 243, and *Reformist Apocalypticism*, 24, 209, and 240; and Lerner, "Recent Work on 'Genus nequam'"

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Cambridge, University Library Gg.iv.25	Extract from <i>De oneribus prophetarum</i> , f. 65, <i>inc.</i> “Quando sub egipti filia”; <sup>119</sup> <i>Ioachim in maiori libro de concordanciis (Corruent nobiles)</i> , f. 67	A note on f. 57v records birth of William Carpenter in 1573	s. xv <sup>120</sup>
Cambridge, University Library, Dd.i.17 <sup>121</sup>	Joachite exegetical prophecy attributed to Pseudo-John of Lignano, ff. 203vb-204rb, <i>inc.</i> “Regnum spiritus sancti distinguntur in iacob” <sup>122</sup>	Austin Friars’ convent, York (likely)	s. xiv (ex.) - xv (in.)

- 119 Compare Holder-Egger’s edition in “Italienische Prophetieen...III,” 140. The excerpt ends, “vt manus magis attrahat quam extendat.” The collection also contains the Becket prophecy, “Quando ego Thomas,” fol. 61v, and a Brigettine prophecy, fol. 62 (*inc.* “Cum essem orando vidi qualiter,” that is, the famous political vision involving “Beatus dionisius,” which made Bridget more popular in England than in France). On fol. 63v is a prophecy that plagiarizes the Tripoli prophecy (see Lerner, *Powers of Prophecy*, 134); on fol. 66v follows “Cesaris imperium” and, on fol. 67, “Anglia transmittet” (the latter two being popular prophecies that often travel with Joachite works). See Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 247, for a full listing.
- 120 An originally separate booklet of the twelfth century is bound in with this one, starting at fol. 94. Contrary to what the *Catalogue of the Manuscripts Preserved in the Cambridge University Library* says, 169, the collection of prophecies, fols. 63v-67, is in fact in a different hand (Hand 1), but of the same period as the previous item (*Liber Methodius*, fol. 58) and the item that follows it (*De Mirabilibus Rome civitatis*, fol. 68), both copied by Hand 2. Hand 1 began the manuscript and copied up to fol. 12, including a chronicle from Creation to 1447 (which records the important events of recent history, especially the plague, the windstorm of 1362, and the Rising of 1381). Hand 1 was very interested in history, prophecy, and the ages of the world; he copied *De sex etatibus* from fol. 4ff. Collation (of s. xv section): i<sup>10</sup> | ii<sup>14</sup> (14 cancelled) iii-vii<sup>12</sup> | viii<sup>12</sup> (wants 10 and 12).
- 121 Described most recently in Benson and Blanchfield, *The Manuscripts of Piers Plowman: The B-Version*, 33-38.
- 122 On this very exegetical Joachite prophecy, unnoticed before, see Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, Case Study 1, 109-24. I am grateful there and here to Robert Lerner for advice on the connection between this prophecy and the *Belial* text by Jacobus de Theramo (on whom see note on Digby 218 below).

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Digby 218 <sup>123</sup>	<i>Ioachim in maiori libro de concordanciis (Corruent nobiles)</i> , f. 107; followed by <i>Flamine romano crescit britannicus honor</i> <sup>124</sup>	Owned by John Dee, s. xvi <sup>125</sup>	s. xiv
London, British Library, Cotton Vesp. E. VII <sup>126</sup>	<i>Ioachim in maiori libro de concordanciis (Corruent nobiles)</i> , f. 70v; <sup>127</sup> <i>Flamine romano</i> , f. 112; an abridged version of John of Rupescissa's letter to Innocent VI, "Vos misistis," f. 122, and an excerpt from his <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 123v		s. xv

123 The manuscript is made up of various booklets and looks like a working university compilation of the late thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. The same hand copied all the prophecies, items 17-20 in Macray's *Catalogi... Digby*, and items 21 and 22, where 197b should read 107b. In the margin on fol. 107 is the prophecy of the holy oil of Thomas Becket, followed by the Tripoli prophecy (for which see Lerner, *Powers of Prophecy*, 118 n. 6; Lerner dates the copying of fol. 107 by notes on the verso about the chronology of English events c.1400). Fol. 107 is a singleton bound into the manuscript at a later date, but it is worth noting that the manuscript contains several texts relating to reformist issues. The prophecy was bound in beside the Council of Vienne constitutions of Clement V (promulgated by John XXII in 1318), implicating beguines and followers of Olivi in heresy. Earlier in the manuscript is a copy of the controversial *Belial*, or "Jacobi de Tharamo liber dictus Consolatio Peccatorum" (or sometimes "Processus Luciferi contra Jesum"), here fol. 25. This was the text that the Joachite author of the Pseudo-Lignano prophecy borrowed from extensively (see Cambridge University Library MS Dd.i.17 above).

124 This little known prophecy, here in a verse version, I have noticed in two manuscripts of English provenance (see also Cambridge, Gonville and Caius College, MS 230/116 above, for a prose version). The entirely positive apocalyptic note on which it ends may suggest Joachite influence. On its political aspects, see Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 212 and 223.

125 James, "Lists of Manuscripts formerly Owned by John Dee," showing that Dee owned Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Digby 218 and also Digby 192, which he signed in 1576.

126 Contains numerous prophecies; see Lerner, *Powers of Prophecy*, 101-103, 179, and 224-25.

127 Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 51 n. 1; for a full listing of political prophecies, see Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 261-62. There is also an excerpt from Bridget of Sweden on fol. 116v.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Hatton 56 <sup>128</sup>	An extensive collection of prophecies, incl. the <i>Columbinus Prophecy</i> or <i>De septem signaculis</i> , (inc. “Attende secundum Eusebium”) f. 33r; extracts from John of Rupescissa’s <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 8, mainly concerning the papacy. <sup>129</sup> In addition, extracts from Bridget of Sweden, f. 1, Hildegard of Bingen, ff. 27 and 28, <sup>130</sup> the Bridlington prophecies, f. 11, and “Revelatio anni nostri mccccxlvij,” f. 6v, mentioning Joachim		c.1450
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Digby 176 <sup>131</sup>	<i>Ioachim in maiori libro de concordanciis</i> ( <i>Corruent nobiles</i> ), f. 38 <sup>132</sup>		s. xiv
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Ashmole 393 <sup>133</sup>	<i>Columbinus Prophecy</i> , f. 80		s. xv

128 Described in Hunt, Madan, and Craster, *Summary Catalogue*, as no. 4062. See Kerby-Fulton and Daniel, “English Joachimism, 1300-1500”; Kerby-Fulton, *Reformist Apocalypticism*, 209-10; Lerner, *Powers of Prophecy*, 118 and 227ff; and for the political prophecies, Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 276 (with different foliation).

129 Bignami-Odier, *Etudes sur Jean de Roquetaillade*, 249.

130 Her “Justicia” prophecy from the *Liber divinorum operum* and her Cologne prophecy; on both of these, and on Hatton, see Kerby-Fulton, “Prophecy and Suspicion.”

131 Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 84.

132 See Kerby-Fulton and Daniel, “English Joachimism, 1300-1500.” On the attack by John of Eschenden because its predictions for 1357-65 were unfounded, see Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 84, and see Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Ashmole 393 (below) and Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Digby 218, fol. 107.

133 Described in Black, *Descriptive... Catalogue of... the Manuscripts bequeathed... by Elias Ashmole*. A collection of five manuscripts, the first of which, written in a rough cursive fifteenth-century hand, is a personal collection, largely astrological in nature. *Columbinus* is preceded, on fol. 79, by “Aschyndene de tribus conjunccionibus” (an astrological prophecy by John of Eschenden), followed by “Pronosticum Milonis Toletani de conjunctione facta anno 1357,” fol. 80v. On fol. 96, extracts from Chaucer’s *Treatise of the Astrolabye* begin. See Kerby-Fulton and Daniel, “English Joachimism, 1300-1500,” 432-33, for the Ashmole text. Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Ashmole 192 contains an eighteenth-century transcript of this text (p. 102).

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Digby 196 <sup>134</sup>	<i>Columbinus Prophecy</i> , f. 18, <i>inc.</i> "Attende secundum Eusebium," and "Gallorum levitas," f. 24; <sup>135</sup> in an anthology containing eschatology, ecclesiology, and politics (incl. the Rising of 1381)		s. xv (2)
London, British Library, Cotton Cleopatra C.X <sup>136</sup>	<i>Columbinus Prophecy</i> , ff. 157-58, to which is added the <i>Post Celestinum Prophecy (inc. "Papa cedet")</i> <sup>137</sup>	Thomas Allen (1540-1632)	s. xiv (in.)

134 Hunt, Madan, and Craster, *Summary Catalogue*, no. 1797, and described in Macray, *Catalogi...Digby*; see also Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 275. An 8.5" × 11" manuscript of 197 leaves, many of which are singletons, this is a much rearranged collection to which several hands have contributed, with a Table of Contents from late s. xvi, containing chronicles, prophecies, and *mirabilia*. The hand that copied *Columbinus* is the main hand of fols. 18-22 (even though fols. 20-23 are on smaller sheets of paper) and continues to fol. 29. On these pages he created a small anthology of political and ecclesiastical prophecy, to which he also added the macaronic poem concerning the Rising of 1381 on fol. 20v, *inc.* "The taxe hath tened us alle, / Probat hoc mors tot validorum." The same scribe's hand appears elsewhere in the manuscript sporadically, e.g., on fols. 53-54, where he copied Macray's item 41 "De sex aetatibus mundi" (which is not Joachite) and item 42 "De vestibus sacerdotum." He also copied item 54 on the English churches, "Tabula ecclesiarum cathedralium et abbatialium," fol. 73, and item 91 "De Antichristo scire volentibus primo nomen notabimus," fols. 194-194v. See also the entry for this manuscript in Horner, *Index of Middle English Prose*.

135 On "Gallorum," see Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 528; on *Columbinus*, see Kerby-Fulton and Daniel, "English Joachimism, 1300-1500."

136 Described in Planta, *Catalogue of...the Cottonian Library*, 582. It is the earliest English copy of the *Columbinus Prophecy*, in a fragmentary quire assembled with unrelated materials likely by Thomas Allen (b. 1540). This version of the prophecy likely preserves an allusion to Joachim's *Enchiridion super Apocalypsim*, which also circulated in England (see Harley 3049 above); see Kerby-Fulton and Daniel, "English Joachimism, 1300-1500," 322-23.

137 See Kerby-Fulton and Daniel, "English Joachimism, 1300-1500," 331 n. 35; and see Lerner, *Powers of Prophecy*, 90 n. 11.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Oxford, Bodleian Library, Bodley 397 <sup>138</sup>	<i>Columbinus Prophecy</i> , f. 43, together with exegetical items, incl. Hugh of St. Victor, and preceded by a note on history and tropological interpretation, same folio <sup>139</sup>	St. Mary's, Reading, "ex dono Johannes Sarum" <sup>140</sup>	s. xiii (ex.)
Lincoln, Cathedral Library 66 <sup>141</sup>	<i>Columbinus Prophecy</i> , f. 123-r-v <sup>142</sup>		s. xv
Aberystwyth, National Library of Wales, Peniarth 50 <sup>143</sup>	<i>Columbinus Prophecy</i> , pp. 166-69, in an anthology of prophecies in Latin, Welsh, and English, largely political	Welsh in origin	s. xv
London, British Library, Additional 14251	<i>Columbinus Prophecy</i> , f. 216v, with various political prophecies and works on English history <sup>144</sup>	East Yorkshire or Lincolnshire	1421

138 Three manuscripts, the first two of which were brought together fairly soon after they were made, judging by the consistent rubrication throughout. Moreover, the list of contents on the flyleaf mentions *Columbinus* as the last item. See Hunt, Madan, and Craster, *Summary Catalogue...Bodleian Library*, no. 2228.

139 See Kerby-Fulton and Daniel, "English Joachimism, 1300-1500."

140 "Iste est liber sancte Marie de Radynga ex dono Johannes Sarum de quo qui fraudem fecerit nouerit se excommunicatum," written on the flyleaf, c.1300, with Table of Contents in the same hand. See Coates, *English Medieval Books*, 67, 116, 136n, 141n, 161. I would like to thank Christoph Egger for his advice on this.

141 Described in Woolley, *Catalogue...of Lincoln Cathedral Chapter Library*, no. 66. See also Thomson, *Catalogue...of Lincoln Cathedral Chapter Library*, no. 66, pp. 47-49.

142 A version very close to that found in Digby 96 and which appears to understand the Joachite interpretation of the sixth seal; see Kerby-Fulton and Daniel, "English Joachimism, 1300-1500."

143 Described in Evans, *Historical Manuscripts...in the Welsh Language*, 389-99, and see Kerby-Fulton and Daniel, "English Joachimism, 1300-1500," notes 48 and 49. This is a maverick version of the prophecy made deliberately obscure to fit the political prophecy genre.

144 Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 253; Coote refers to "the apocalyptic 'Attende secundum Eusebium'" (i.e., an unnoticed copy of the *Columbinus Prophecy*). I have not seen this manuscript.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Cambridge Gonville and Caius College 388/608 <sup>145</sup>	<i>Oraculum Cyrilli cum Expositione Abbatis Joachim</i> , ff. 103-25 <sup>146</sup>	“liber Roberti Tomsun” (early xiv), “Thorelby” (xv-xvi), also copied in Greek letters	s. xiv (in.) <sup>147</sup>
Oxford, Balliol College 274 <sup>148</sup>	Excerpts from the <i>Vaticinium Sibillae Erithreae</i> , f. 255, and “In ultima etate humiliabitur,” f. 257 <sup>149</sup>	Brought to England by William Gray, Bishop of Ely	Before 1442-44; script and decora- tion are Rhenish
Oxford, Balliol College 296 <sup>150</sup>	<i>Liber contra Lombardum</i> , ff. 219-49, in a collection incl. Abelard, Bernard, and other twelfth-century theologians	In an English hand “with a touch of court hand” <sup>151</sup>	s. xiv (in.)

145 Described in James, *Catalogue of...Gonville and Caius Library*, 2:448-49. The portion of the manuscript containing the *Oraculum* is a booklet beginning at fol. 85, where an imperfect text of “Jacobus de Cessolis de ludo Scaccarum” begins, followed by Isidore on the patriarchs, fol. 87, followed by the *Oraculum*. The manuscript suggests a very interesting context for Joachite thought, perhaps among the clerks of the civil service; prior to this booklet, the collection includes statutes and annotations mentioning London.

146 See Cambridge, Corpus Christi College, MS 404 above.

147 This date applies to the booklet containing the Joachite material, not the whole manuscript.

148 See the description in Mynors, *Catalogue...Balliol College*, mentioning that Gray travelled to Cologne in 1442-44 and brought this manuscript back. It was copied by “Pauli de Mertenich.” It contains, in addition, John of Wales’ *Communiloquium* and *Breviloquium*, works by Peter the Blessed, Walter Burley, a letter of Bernard’s, and notes on Arthur and Methodius.

149 See Holder-Egger, “Italienische Prophetien...I,” 161-66.

150 Mynors, *Catalogue...Balliol College*, no. 296, points out that the *Liber contra Lombardum* is spurious and not identified as by Joachim in the manuscript, but that a seventeenth-century hand supplies the title: “Joachimi abbatis (ut a quibusdam supponitur sed falso) contra Lombardum.” The piece originally ended on the now lost fol. 246 (which may have had an *explicit* identifying the work). The manuscript is described in the edition by Ottaviano, *Joachimi Abbatis*, 67ff. But see also Robb, “A Late Thirteenth-Century Attack,” 112-14. I would like to thank Christoph Egger for his advice on this.

151 Mynors, *Catalogue...Balliol College*, no. 296. The date of the earliest official record of its presence in Balliol is 1654.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Cambridge, University Library li.vi.25 <sup>152</sup>	<i>Ioachim in maiori libro de concordanciis</i> ( <i>Corruent nobiles</i> ), f. 107v, set out here as six consecutive prophecies for the years 1350, 1354, 1357, 1360, and 1365, followed shortly by the statute suppressing the Templars <sup>153</sup>	Collection of statutes probably made for civil service or legal use <sup>154</sup>	s. xiv (in.)
London, British Library, Harley 3724 <sup>155</sup>	“Fata monent,” f. 49v <sup>156</sup>	Anglo-Irish	s. xiii (ex.)
Cambridge, Corpus Christi College 288	“Fata monent” <sup>157</sup>	Christchurch, Canterbury	s. xiii

152 Described in the *Catalogue of the Manuscripts Preserved in the Cambridge University Library*, 2:521-24, to which should be added the collation: a<sup>8</sup> (wants 1,4,6) i-ii<sup>8</sup> | iii<sup>6</sup> | iv-xiv<sup>8</sup> | xv-xviii<sup>8</sup> | xix-xxii<sup>8</sup> | xxiii<sup>8</sup> (8 cancelled) xxiv<sup>6</sup> (wants 6).

153 The manuscript is primarily a collection of statutes in Law French and Latin. The prophecy and the miscellaneous items that follow it, including the statute concerning the Templars, were added at the end of a booklet (see collation above). On the facing page (fol. 108) is a copy of the statute announcing the suppression of the Templars: *Statutum novum de terris Templariorum*. 17 Edward II. (The order was suppressed by papal decree in 1312.)

154 See the annotations in Law French, e.g., on fol. vii. A prayer precedes the prophecy (*inc.* “Anima Christi sacrificia me”). These various items were added by the same hand (one of two active in the manuscript) but at different times. The small size of the manuscript (6.5" × 4") suggests a circuit judge or civil servant. I am grateful to John Van Engen for his advice on this.

155 On this manuscript, see Kerby-Fulton and Despres, *Iconography and the Professional Reader*, 56, 99, 101, and figure 63.

156 Herrmann, “Spätmittelalterliche englische Pseudoprophetien,” esp. 90 and n. 10; Holder-Egger, “Italienische Prophetieen...III,” 106, for the text. This is a supposed exchange between Frederick II and the Pope.

157 For the text, see Holder-Egger, “Italienische Prophetieen...III,” 106; for the description, see James, *Descriptive Catalogue...Corpus Christi College*, and Kerby-Fulton, “Langland’s Reading,” 246-47.

## A Small Sampling of Manuscripts Containing Brief or Flyleaf Joachite Entries

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
London, British Library, Harley 1280	“Cum fuerint,” f. 427, <sup>158</sup> in a Bible	Bury St. Edmunds	s. xiii
Oxford, Merton College 202	“Cum fuerint,” f. 85v, preceded by “Gallorum levitas,” <sup>159</sup> f. 85, both added to a manuscript of Bonaventure	Friar’s <i>vade mecum</i> <sup>160</sup>	s. xv, s. xiv for additions, s. xiii for main text
London, British Library, Royal 8.D.11 <sup>161</sup>	“Cum fuerint,” copied at the end of an article on Antichrist in the Wycliffite compilation, the <i>Floretum</i> <sup>162</sup>	In family of John Theyer, s. xvii	s. xv
Dublin, Trinity College 497	A collection of prophecies containing a version of “Gallorum levitas” with four extra verses referring to 1325 and the persecution of followers of Peter Olivi <sup>163</sup>		s. xiv

158 Introduced by the following two lines: “Hoc Cistercienni Joachim predixit in anno/Quo Saladinus sanctum sibi subdidit Urbem, /Cum fuerint...” See Todd, *The Last Age*, xxiv; and see Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 49 n. 4, 51 n. 1, and 84 n. 1, for a listing of several “Cum fuerint” texts and other short prophecies in England.

159 On “Gallorum,” see Holder-Egger, “Italienische Prophetien...III,” 125-26, and Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 528. The text of “Gallorum” is cropped and “Cum fuerint” is here called “Sancti Edmundi archepiscopi prophetia de antichristo.”

160 Apparently, from the small size (6" × 4.5") and the contents.

161 Described in Warner, *Catalogue of Western Manuscripts... Old Royal and Kings*, 1:240.

162 Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 50 n. 3. The article begins, “Beatus qui exspectat et prevenit vsque ad dies 1335.”

163 The lines are (following the usual last line, “Papa cito moritur, Cesar regnabit ubique”):

Anno millesimo C. ter vicesimo v. dabit ether  
Blada vina fractus fiet pro principe luctus;  
Una columpna cadet, quae terram schismate tradet  
Gens periet subito, *Petro testante perito.*

See Todd, *The Last Age*, xxxiii and 9, who compares it with records in Limborch’s *Liber Sententiarum Inquisitionis Tholosanae*.

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Washington, D.C., Folger Library 546 <sup>164</sup>	Vernacular prophecy attributed to John of Rupescissa, f. 2, on the future of papacy and voluntary poverty	Copy said to be found in an "auncient house in plymothe in Cornewell"	c.1540
Dublin, Trinity College 516 <sup>165</sup>	ff. 48r-48v: "Ioachim in libro de honoribus"; "Gallorum leuitas," ff. 48v-49; <sup>166</sup> excerpt from Rupescissa's <i>Vade mecum</i> , f. 111	John Benet's Chronicle for 1400-1462, <sup>167</sup> in his own hand	s. xv (med.)
London, British Library, Royal 8.C.IV <sup>168</sup>	<i>Ioachim in maiori libro de concordanciis (Corruent nobiles)</i> , f. 66, <sup>169</sup> in a manuscript containing many Franciscan materials	Bury St. Edmunds, partly in Kirkestede's hand (but not <i>Corruent nobiles</i> )	s. xiii (ex.)

164 Nothing has been published on this. In London, British Library, MS Additional 24663, there is also an English translation of John of Rupescissa's *Vade mecum*, fol. 11.

165 Colker, *Trinity...Dublin...Catalogue*, 2:976-1002.

166 The manuscript contains a large number of prophecies, among which the following often travel with Joachite materials: on fol. 48r is one attributed to Joachim, claiming to come from the *De oneribus*: "Ioachim in libro de honoribus. Ve tibi uitula eligans et gallus et gallina stupescunt et tendunt pectora"; on fol. 47v, "Tria lustra tenent cum semi tempora sexti" and "Versus Vaticinales De Normania De Sexto. Anglia transmittet leopardum"; on fol. 48v, "Gallorum leuitas." See Coote, *Prophecy and Public Affairs*, 250-51, for the full list of political prophecies.

167 Harriss and Harriss, "John Benet's Chronicle." Benet was vicar of Harlingdon, Bedfordshire.

168 Described in Warner, *Catalogue of Western Manuscripts...Old Royal and Kings*, 1:231; see also Bloomfield and Reeves, "The Penetration of Joachimism," 788.

169 Copied between a commentary on Genesis and one on Exodus, the prophecy appears in a quire of eight beginning on fol. 69; it is copied in a tiny hand of the late thirteenth century. There is considerable interest in Franciscan issues in the manuscript, which includes pertinent papal bulls and what Pelster described (in a note on the manuscript, written in 1932) as a fragment of the first known commentary of the Franciscan school at Oxford (by Richardus Cornubiensis). There is also, unusually, a diagram of a plow on fol. 41 with English glosses to Latin words. Kirkestede copied the "Ars fidei catholice" on fol. 8 and the Seneca item on fol. 24.

**Manuscripts Rejected for Lack of Evidence of English Provenance**

<b>Shelfmark</b>	<b>Joachite Contents</b>	<b>Earliest Known Owner or Provenance</b>	<b>Date and Origin</b>
Cambridge, University Library Mm.V.31 <sup>170</sup>	<i>Expositio secundem intellectum historicum Apocalypsim</i> (commentary on the historical sense of the Apocalypse) by Friar Alexander, with illustrations	Likely written in Germany, and still there in the 16th century	s. xiii (med.)
London, British Library, Arundel 117 <sup>171</sup>	<i>Vaticinia de Summis Pontificibus</i> , ff. 137-52; <sup>172</sup> "Gallorum levitas," f. 146v (in relation to an account of the Council of Constance)	German, from Charterhouse at Mainz <sup>173</sup>	s. xv
London, British Library, Add. 11439 <sup>174</sup>	<i>Super Hieremiam</i> , f. 2; <i>Vaticinium Sibillae Erithreae</i> ff. 73, 75; <i>Epistola Universis Christi Fidelibus</i> , f. 76; <i>Adversus Judaeos</i> , f. 78; <i>Super Esaiam</i> , f. 92; <i>Praemissiones</i> , f. 99	Likely Italian in origin, early provenance unknown	1377

170 Gilson, "Friar Alexander," 20, thought the script and illustrations to be English in character; but see also Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 177-78, and Schmolinsky, *Der Apokalypsenkommentar des Alexander Minorita*, 17-18. I would like to thank Christoph Egger for his advice.

171 Herrmann, "Pseudoprophetien," 90 n. 10.

172 Also contains items by "Telesphorus" and Henry of Langenstein.

173 I am grateful to Robert Lerner for this information.

174 See Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, Appendix A. For a very thorough description of Add. MS 11439, see *Ioachim Abbas Florensis: Exhortatorium Iudeorum*, ed. Patschovsky, 80-86.

## A Sampling of Medieval Attestations in England

<i>Location</i>	<i>Joachite Works Cited</i>	<i>Details</i>
Cambridge, University Library Add. 3470, <i>Catalogus Scriptorum Ecclesiae</i> , <sup>175</sup> entry for Joachim, p. 94	Henry of Kirkestede's inventory (s. xiv) of English libraries recording copies of Joachim's "De concordia," and "Super Apocalypsin" [ <i>sic</i> ]	Both at Library No. 168, i.e., the Oxford Franciscan House; Kirkestede also listed the following titles, for which he had no location: <sup>176</sup> <i>Super libros Prophetarum</i> ; <i>De Seminibus</i> ; <i>De moribus paparum</i> ( <i>inc.</i> "Genus nequam"); <i>De oneribus Prophetarum</i> ; <i>De duobus ordinibus</i> ; <i>Super oraculum Cirilli</i>
Exeter, Cathedral Library <sup>177</sup>	"Joachim Albas [ <i>sic</i> ] super Apocalypsim Johannis"	Catalogue of books in inventory of 1327, from Exeter Cathedral MS 3671 <sup>178</sup>
E. Bernard, <i>Catalogi Librorum Manu-scriptorum Angliae &amp; Hiberniae</i> (Oxford, 1697)	For Joachim, records three locations: one in "Bibliothecis Hiberniae," one in "Publicis ... Bibliothecis Angliae," one in Oxford Colleges	Trinity College, Dublin, no. 365 (now TCD 347, see above); no. 1348 (now Corpus Christi, Cambridge 404, see above); Oxford, Balliol College, no. 458 (now MS Balliol 149, see above)

175 This manuscript is a late seventeenth-century transcript by Tanner, now edited and annotated as *Henry of Kirkestede, Catalogus de libris authenticis et apocrifis*, by Rouse and Rouse, listed there as no. 293.

176 Three of these later appear in his own collection, Cambridge, Corpus Christi College, MS 404 (see above), that is, the *De Seminibus*, the *De moribus paparum* (or *Vaticinia de Summis Pontificibus*), and the *Super oraculum Cirilli*.

177 Bell, *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works*, 89. I would also like to thank Christoph Egger for referring me to Oliver, *Lives of the Bishops of Exeter and a History of the Cathedral*, 363, for this reference.

178 Page 373, line 31, cited from Bell, *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works*, 89 and note.

<b>Location</b>	<b>Joachite Works Cited</b>	<b>Details</b>
Ramsey Abbey, Benedictine Library <sup>179</sup>	Joachim: no. 537b “Ordo hystoriarum, cum Tabula Ioachym et tribus aliis,” no. 535e, “uisio Ioachym uno uolumine”	The Tabula may be an index to any work by Joachim, although the work it is attached to is perhaps the <i>Liber de Concordia</i> ; or the Tabula could be a figural work like the <i>Praemissiones</i> , or even the <i>Liber Figurarum</i> ; the second could be one of Joachim’s poems by this title. <sup>180</sup>
London, Dominican Convent <sup>181</sup>	“Ioachimi expositio in Apocalypsin”	As noted by John Leland in his <i>De rebus Britannicis Collectanea</i> , D7.29
York, Library of Austin Friars (and John Erghome)	“Joachim de seminibus litterarum, Joachim de oneribus prophetarum, Joachim de duobus ordinibus, Joachim de successione papali (i.e., the <i>Vaticinia</i> ), Oraculum cirilli cum expositione ioachim; excerptiones prophetie fr. Johannis de rupescissa”; <sup>182</sup> “Joachim super Apocalypsim, Joachim de concordancia testamentorum”; <sup>183</sup> “Tabula Joachim de concordancia testamentorum”; <sup>184</sup> “Liber Joachim de summis pontificibus”; <sup>185</sup> “Prophecie paparum” <sup>186</sup>	s. xiv (med.) An astonishing collection of Joachite works, including apparently genuine ones (the <i>Expositio</i> and the <i>Liber de Concordia</i> ) and no less than three copies of the spurious <i>Vaticinia</i>

179 See Bell, *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works*, 125, and *English Benedictine Libraries: The Shorter Catalogues*, ed. Sharpe et al., 407, for speculations on the identity of both items.

180 See Fleming, ed., *Two Poems by Joachim of Fiore*.

181 Bell, *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works*, 105, citing John Leland’s *De Rebus Britannicis Collectanea*, vol. 4 (London, 1774), 52.

182 James, “Catalogue of the Library of the Augustinian Friars at York,” 9; see also the further discussion in Reeves, *Influence of Prophecy*, 255; and Kerby-Fulton, *Books under Suspicion*, 101-24. The catalogue has been more recently reprinted with annotations in Humphreys, ed., *The Friars’ Libraries*, where these entries appear as numbers A8.163e-f, 306e, 330b, and 361b, c, d, i, o. See also Bell, *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works*, 152.

183 Humphreys, ed., *The Friars’ Libraries*, A8.163e-f; see also Bell, *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works*, 152.

184 Humphreys, ed., *The Friars’ Libraries*, A8.306e; Bell, *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works*, 152.

185 Humphreys, ed., *The Friars’ Libraries*, A8.330b; Bell, *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works*, 152.

186 Humphreys, ed., *The Friars’ Libraries*, A8.363d; Bell, *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works*, 152.

<b>Location</b>	<b>Joachite Works Cited</b>	<b>Details</b>
Byland Abbey, Yorkshire	Copy of “Ioachim Enchiridion super Apocalypsim”	No. Z4.4 <sup>187</sup>
York, St. Mary’s Abbey	Henry of Costesy, <i>Super Apoc.</i>	No. 561; 2 copies <sup>188</sup>
Syon Abbey Library	Henry of Costesy, <i>Super Apoc.</i>	Recorded in catalogue, and copies later seen by Bale in Richard Grafton’s printshop <sup>189</sup>
Syon Abbey Library	Peter Olivi, a commentary on Genesis (followed by an unidentified Apocalypse commentary) and, in a separate catalogue entry, a <i>quodlibet</i> by Olivi	No. 603 and No. 437 <sup>190</sup>
Syon Abbey Library	Joachim of Fiore, <i>Expositio in Apocalypsim</i>	No. 582 <sup>191</sup>
Syon Abbey Library	“Prophecia Ioachim de duobus ordinibus”	No. 977dd, brought by Johannes Bracebrige, former master of Boston Grammar School and Lincoln Cathedral School, apparently the only graduate among the brethren of Syon by 1428 <sup>192</sup>
Oxford, All Souls College	Henry of Costesy, <i>Super Apoc.</i>	Gift of Henry VI <sup>193</sup>
Norwich, Dominican Priory	Henry of Costesy, <i>Super Apoc.</i>	Seen by Leland <sup>194</sup>

187 As edited in Bell, *The Libraries of the Cistercians*.

188 See Sharpe, *Handlist*, 166, for this and all the Henry of Costesy attestations below.

189 Sharpe, *Handlist*, 166, citing numbers from Bateson, *Catalogue of Syon Monastery, Isleworth* as I.28 and I.29.

190 See Gillespie, *Syon Abbey*, nos. 603 and 437, respectively.

191 Gillespie, *Syon Abbey*, no. 582; see also Bloomfield, *Piers Plowman*, 159.

192 See Gillespie, *Syon Abbey*, no. 977dd, and note on possible *incipit*; for biography of Bracebrige, p. 570. I am very grateful to Robert Lerner for drawing this reference to my attention.

193 Sharpe, *Handlist*, 166.

194 Sharpe, *Handlist*, 166.

<b>Location</b>	<b>Joachite Works Cited</b>	<b>Details</b>
Cambridge, Pembroke College	Henry of Costesy, <i>Super Apoc.</i>	Seen by Bale <sup>195</sup>
Canterbury, St. Augustine's	Henry of Costesy, <i>Super Apoc.</i>	In library listing <sup>196</sup>
Canterbury, St. Augustine's	"Prophetia Abbatis Joachim"	Catalogue from s.xv in Dublin, Trinity College 360 <sup>197</sup>
Evesham	Henry of Costesy, <i>Super Apoc.</i>	Given by Nicholas Hereford in 1392 <sup>198</sup>
London, St. Paul's	Henry of Costesy, <i>Super Apoc.</i>	Seen by Bale <sup>199</sup>
Oxford, Merton College	Olivi's <i>Postilla</i> on Matthew	Bequeathed by William Duffield to Merton in 1453 "ad incathendum in communi libraria" <sup>200</sup>
Oxford, Balliol College	"Opera Joachimi abbatis super Hieremiam, de seminio Scriptur- urarum, de prophetia ignota, de ultimis tribulationibus, expositio super Cyrillum, de provincialibus praefagiis [perhaps <i>De oneribus prophetarum?</i> ], in Apocalypsin, in Psalterium"	As noted by John Leland in his <i>De rebus Britannicis Collectanea</i> , <sup>201</sup> this is a rich collection of Joachite works, including the genuine <i>De prophetia ignota</i> , <i>De ultimis tribulationibus</i> , and the <i>Expositio Psalterium</i> .

195 Sharpe, *Handlist*, 166.

196 Sharpe, *Handlist*, 166.

197 Bell, *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works*, 77, citing James, *Ancient Libraries of Canterbury and Dover*, 292 no. 4, cross-listed with no. 870.

198 Sharpe, *Handlist*, 166.

199 Sharpe, *Handlist*, 166.

200 Ker, *Records of All Souls College, 1437-1600*, 173 n. 1; cited in Howlett and Hunt, "Provenance of MS. New College 49," 225.

201 Bell, *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works*, 113, citing John Leland's *De Rebus Britannicis Collectanea*, vol. 4 (London, 1774), 63.

<b>Location</b>	<b>Joachite Works Cited</b>	<b>Details</b>
Oxford, Oriel College	“Excerptiones librorum abbatis Ioachim,” <i>inc.</i> “Quia labentes ac perituri seculi perurgere ruinam”	Bale, <i>Index</i> <sup>202</sup>
Oxford, Merton College	A manuscript containing six works by Arnold of Villanova: <i>Gladius</i> , <i>Allocutio</i> , <i>De versutiis</i> , <i>De mysterio</i> <i>cymbalorum</i> , <i>De adventu Antichristi</i> , and <i>Philosophia catolica</i>	Bale, <i>Index</i> <sup>203</sup>
Robert Cotton’s Library, MS Vitellius E. II, largely destroyed in Cotton Library fire	Final items in the manuscript are very similar to those of Booklet E of Bodleian, Lat. Misc. c. 75, containing the “Joachim” <i>Insurgent</i> and the Arnold of Villanova pieces (see above), according to the 1696 description <sup>204</sup>	Fragmentary and badly burnt, these items now entirely missing

### **University of Notre Dame**

- 202 Cited by Bell, *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works*, 139, from Bale, *Index Britanniae Scriptorum*, 173. Robert Lerner (private correspondence, 25 July 2008) has suggested to me that this manuscript is very likely Richard Kilvington’s (see Royal 8.F.XVI above), since Kilvington bequeathed his manuscripts to Oriel College.
- 203 Bale, *Index Britanniae Scriptorum*, 33. Robert Lerner very generously provided me with this reference (private correspondence, 25 July 2008).
- 204 Compare the description in Smith, *Catalogue of...the Cottonian Library, 1696*, ed. Tite. Only articles 22 and 23 of the original description survive. I would like to thank Robert Lerner for mentioning to me the missing Arnold items in Cotton Vitellius.

## Bibliography

- Abbot, T. K. *Catalogue of the MSS in the Library of Trinity College, Dublin*. Dublin: Trinity College, 1900.
- Bale, John. *Index Britanniae Scriptorum*, ed. R. L. Poole and M. Bateson. Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1902.
- . *Scriptorium illustrium Maioris Brytanniae Catalogus*. Basel, 1557, 1559.
- Bateson, M. *Catalogue of Syon Monastery, Isleworth*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1889.
- Bell, David N. *An Index of Cistercian Authors and Works in Medieval Library Catalogues in Great Britain*. Kalamazoo, Mich.: Cistercian Publications, 1994.
- . *The Libraries of the Cistercians, Gilbertines and Premonstratensians*. London: British Library, 1992.
- Benson, C. David, and Lynne Blanchfield, eds. *The Manuscripts of Piers Plowman: The B-Version*. Woodbridge: D. S. Brewer, 1997.
- Bériou, Nicole. “Pierre de Limoges et la fin des temps.” *Melanges de l’école française de Rome, Moyen Age – temps Modernes* 98 (1986): 65-107.
- Bigname-Odier, Jeanne. *Etudes sur Jean de Roquetaillade*. Paris: J. Vrin, 1952.
- . “Les Visions de Robert D’Uzès.” *Archivum Fratrum Praedicatorum* 25 (1955): 258-310.
- Black, W. H. *A Descriptive . . . Catalogue of . . . the Manuscripts bequeathed . . . by Elias Ashmole*. Oxford, 1845.
- Bloomfield, Morton W. *Piers Plowman as a Fourteenth-Century Apocalypse*. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers Univ. Press [1962].
- and Marjorie E. Reeves. “The Penetration of Joachism into Northern Europe.” *Speculum* 29 (1954): 772-93.
- Brown, Edward, ed. *Appendix ad Fasciculum rerum expetendarum et fugiendarum by Ortvinus Gratius*. London, 1690.
- Burr, David. *Olivi’s Peaceable Kingdom: A Reading of the Apocalypse Commentary*. Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press, 1993.
- Catalogue of the Archiepiscopal Manuscripts in the Library at Lambeth Palace*. London, 1812.
- A Catalogue of the Harleian Manuscripts in the British Museum*. London, 1808.
- Catalogue of the Manuscripts Preserved in the Cambridge University Library*. Cambridge, 1856-67.
- Colker, M. L. *Trinity College Library Dublin: Descriptive Catalogue of the Mediaeval and Renaissance Latin Manuscripts*. Aldershot: Scholar, 1991.
- Coote, Lesley A. *Prophecy and Public Affairs in Later Medieval England*. York: York Medieval Press, 2000.
- Coxe, H. O. *Bodleian Library Quarto Catalogues*. Vol. 2, *Laudian Manuscripts*. Oxford: Bodleian Library, 1973.
- . *Catalogi Codicum Manuscriptorum qui in Collegiis Aulisque Oxoniensibus*. Oxford, 1852.
- Daniel, E. R. “Apocalyptic Conversion: The Joachite Alternative to the Crusades.” *Traditio* 25 (1969): 127-54.

- . *The Franciscan Concept of Mission in the High Middle Ages*. St. Bonaventure, N.Y.: St. Bonaventure Univ. Press, 1992.
- Delany, Sheila, ed. *Chaucer and the Jews: Sources, Contexts, Meanings*. New York: Routledge, 2002.
- De Ricci, Seymour, and W. J. Wilson. *Census of Medieval and Renaissance Manuscripts in the United States and Canada*. New York: H. W. Wilson, 1935-1940.
- Douie, D. L. "Olivi's Postilla Super Matthaeum (MS New College B. 49)." *Franciscan Studies* 35 (1975): 66-92.
- Emden, A. B. *A Biographical Register of the University of Cambridge to 1500*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1963.
- . *A Biographical Register of the University of Oxford to A.D. 1500*. 3 vols. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1957-1959.
- Esser, Kajetan, and Rémy Oligier. *La tradition manuscrite des opuscles de saint François d'Assise: Préliminaires de l'édition critique*. Subsidia scientifica franciscalia 3. Rome: Istituto Storico dei Cappuccini, 1972.
- Evans, J. G. *Historical Manuscripts Commission Report on Manuscripts in the Welsh Language*, Vol. 1, Part 2. London: HMSO, 1898-1910.
- Grundmann, Herbert. *Ausgewählte Aufsätze*. Vol. 2, *Joachim von Fiore*. Schriften der Monumenta Germaniae Historica 25, 2. Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann Verlag, 1977.
- Gilson, J. P. "Friar Alexander and his Historical Interpretation of the Apocalypse." In *Collectanea Franciscana* 2, edited by C. L. Kingsford, 20-36. Manchester: Manchester Univ. Press, 1922.
- Gillespie, Vincent, ed. *Syon Abbey*. Corpus of British Medieval Library Catalogues. London: British Library, 2001.
- Hanna, Ralph. *A Descriptive Catalogue of the Western Medieval Manuscripts of St. John's College, Oxford*. Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 2002.
- Harper, Charl, and E. Randolph Daniel. "Henry of Kirkstede and the 'De Seminibus Scripturarum.'" Forthcoming.
- Harriss, G. L., and M. A. Harriss. "John Benet's Chronicle for the Years 1400-1462." *Camden Miscellany* 24. London: Royal Historical Society (1972): 151-75.
- Herrmann, Erwin. "Spätmittelalterliche englische Pseudoprophetien." *Archiv für Kulturgeschichte* 57 (1975): 87-116.
- Holdenried, Anke. *The Sybil and her Scribes: Manuscripts and Interpretation of the Latin Sibylla Tiburtina, c.1050-1500*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2006.
- Holder-Egger, Oswald. "Italienische Prophetien des 13. Jahrhunderts, I." *Neues Archiv* 15 (1890): 141-78.
- . "Italienische Prophetien des 13. Jahrhunderts, II." *Neues Archiv* 30 (1905): 321-86.
- . "Italienische Prophetien des 13. Jahrhunderts, III." *Neues Archiv* 33 (1908): 95-187.
- Horner, Patrick. *Index of Middle English Prose, Handlist III*. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 1986.
- Howlett, D. R., and R. W. Hunt. "The Provenance of MS. New College 49." *Bodleian Library Record* 10 (1978-82): 225-28.
- Humphreys, K. W., ed. *The Friars' Libraries*. London: British Library, 1990.

- Hunt, R. W., Falconer Madan, and H. H. E. Craster, et al., eds. *A Summary Catalogue of Western Manuscripts in the Bodleian Library at Oxford*. 7 vols. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1895-1953.
- James, M. R. *Catalogue of the Library of the Augustinian Friars at York, in Fasciculus J. W. Clark dicatus*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1909.
- . *Catalogue of Manuscripts in the Gonville and Caius Library*. Vol. 2. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1908.
- . *A Descriptive Catalogue of Manuscripts in the Library of Corpus Christi College, Cambridge*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1912.
- . *A Descriptive Catalogue of the Manuscripts in the Library of Lambeth Palace*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1930-1932.
- . "Lists of Manuscripts formerly Owned by John Dee." *Supplement to Transactions of the Cambridge Bibliographical Society*, no. 1 (1921).
- . *The Western Manuscripts in the Library of Emmanuel College*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1904.
- . *The Western Manuscripts in the Library of Trinity College, Cambridge*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1900-1904.
- Joachim of Fiore. *Abbot Joachim of Fiore: Liber de Concordia Noui ac Veteris Testamenti*. Ed. E. Randolph Daniel. Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1983.
- . *Joachim Abbas Florensis: Exhortatorium Iudeorum*. Ed. Alexander Patschovsky. *Fonti per la storia dell'Italia medievale – Antiquitates* 26. Rome: Istituto storico italiano, 2006.
- . *Il libro delle figure [Liber figurarum] dell'Abate Gioachino da Fiore*. Ed. Leone Tondelli, Marjorie Reeves, and Beatrice Hirsch-Reich. 2nd ed. Turin: Società Editrice Internazionale, 1953.
- . *Two Poems Attributed to Joachim of Fiore*. Ed. Marjorie Reeves and John V. Fleming. Princeton, N. J.: Pilgrim Press, 1978.
- John of Rupescissa. *Liber secretorum eventuum*. Ed. Christine Morerod-Fattebert, with introduction by Robert Lerner. Fribourg: Editions universitaires, 1994.
- Ker, N. R. *Medieval Manuscripts in British Libraries*. Vol. 1, London. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1969.
- . *Records of All Souls College Library, 1437-1600*. Oxford Bibliographical Society, n.s. 16. Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1971.
- Kerby-Fulton, Kathryn. *Books under Suspicion: Censorship and Tolerance of Revelatory Writing in Late Medieval England*. Notre Dame, Ind.: Univ. of Notre Dame Press, 2006.
- . "Langland's Reading: Some Evidence from MSS. Containing Religious Prophecy." In *The Uses of Manuscripts in Literary Studies: Essays in Memory of Judson Boyce Allen*, edited by Charlotte Cook Morse, Penelope Reed Doob, and Marjorie Curry Woods, 237-61. Kalamazoo, Mich.: Medieval Institute Publications, 1992.
- . "Prophecy and Suspicion: Closet Radicalism, Reformist Politics, and the Vogue for Hildegardiana in Ricardian England." *Speculum* 75 (2000): 318-41.
- . *Reformist Apocalypticism and "Piers Plowman"*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1990.

- and E. Randolph Daniel. “English Joachimism, 1300-1500: The Columbinus Prophecy.” In *Il profetismo gioachimita tra Quattrocento e Cinquecento: Atti del III Congresso Internazionale di Studi Gioachimiti, S. Giovanni in Fiore, 17-21 settembre 1989*, edited by Gian Luca Potestà, 313-50. Fiore: Centro Internazionale di Studi Gioachimiti, 1990.
- and Denise L. Despres. *Iconography and the Professional Reader: The Politics of Book Production in the Douce Piers Plowman*. Minneapolis: Univ. of Minnesota Press, 1999.
- , Magda Hayton, and Kenna Olsen. “The Pseudo-Hildegardian Prophecy and Antimendicant Propaganda in Late Medieval England: An Edition of the Most Popular Insular Text of ‘Insurgent gentes’” In *Prophecy, Apocalypse and the Day of Doom: Proceedings of the 2000 Harlaxton Symposium*, edited by Nigel J. Morgan, 160-193. Oxford: Blackwell, 2004.
- Klepper, Deana Copeland. *The Insight of Unbelievers: Nicholas of Lyra and Christian Reading of Jewish Texts in the Later Middle Ages*. Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press, 2007.
- Langland, William. *The Manuscripts of Piers Plowman: The B-Version*. Eds. C. David Benson and Lynne Blanchfield. Woodbridge: D. S. Brewer, 1997.
- Lerner, Robert E. *The Feast of Saint Abraham: Medieval Millenarians and the Jews*. Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press, 2001.
- . *The Powers of Prophecy: The Cedar of Lebanon Vision from the Mongol Onslaught to the Dawn of the Enlightenment*. Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1983.
- . “Recent Work on the Origins of the ‘Genus nequam’ Prophecies.” *Florensia: Bollettino del Centro Internazionale di Studi Gioachimiti* 7 (1993): 141-57.
- Limborch, Philippus van. *Historia inquisitionis: cui subjungitur Liber sententiarum inquisitionis Tholosanae ab anno Christi 1307 ad annum 1323*. Amstelodami: Apud H. Wetstenium, 1692.
- Little, A. G. *Fratris Thomae Vulgo Dicti de Eccleston: Tractatus de Adventu Fratrum Minorum in Angliam*. Manchester: Manchester Univ. Press, 1951.
- Macray, William Dunn. *Catalogi Codices Manuscriptorum . . . Ricardi Rawlinson*, Part 5, Vol. 2. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1878.
- . *Catalogi Codicum Manuscriptorum . . . Digby*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1893.
- McGinn, Bernard, trans. *Apocalyptic Spirituality: Treatises and Letters of Lactantius, Adso of Montier-en-Der, Joachim of Fiore, the Franciscan Spirituals, Savonarola*. New York: Paulist Press, 1979.
- Metlitzki, Dorothee. *The Matter of Araby in Medieval England*. New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1977.
- Mynors, R. A. B. *Catalogue of the Manuscripts of Balliol College Oxford*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1963.
- Nisse, Ruth. “A Romance of the Jewish East: The Ten Lost Tribes and *The Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs* in Medieval Europe.” *Medieval Encounters* 13 (2007): 499-523.
- . “Your Name Will No Longer Be Aseneth: Apocrypha, Anti-Martyrdom, and Jewish Conversion in Thirteenth-Century England.” *Speculum* 81 (2006): 734-53.
- . Review of Sheila Delany, ed. *Chaucer and the Jews: Sources, Contexts, Meanings. Notes and Queries* 53 (2006): 98-99.
- Oliver, George. *Lives of the Bishops of Exeter and a History of the Cathedral, with an Illustrative Appendix*. Exeter: Exeter Cathedral, 1861.

- Oliviana: Mouvements et dissidences spirituels xiii<sup>e</sup>-xiv<sup>e</sup> siècles.* <http://oliviana.revues.org>  
Ottaviano, Carmelo. *Joachimi Abbatis Liber Contra Lombardum*. Rome: Reale Accademia d'Italia, 1934.
- Paolini, Lorenzo. "Italian Catharism and Written Culture." *Heresy and Literacy, 1000-1530*. Edited by Peter Biller and Anne Hudson, 83-103. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1994.
- Pelster, F. "Die Quaestio Heinrichs von Harclay über die zweite Ankunft Christi und die Erwartung des baldigen Weltendes zu Anfang des XIV. Jahrhunderts." *Archivio Italiano per la Storia della Pietà* 1 (1951): 51-82.
- Piers Plowman by William Langland: An Edition of the C-text*. Ed. Derek Pearsall. Berkeley: Univ. California Press, 1978.
- Piron, Sylvain. "Deplatonising the Celestial Hierarchy: Peter John Olivi's Interpretation of the Pseudo-Dionysius." In *Angels in Medieval Philosophical Inquiry: Their Function and Significance*, edited by Isabel Iribarren and Martin Lenz, 29-44. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008.
- . "Marchands et confesseurs: Le Traité des contrats d'Olivi dans son contexte (Narbonne, fin XIII<sup>e</sup>-début XIV<sup>e</sup> siècle)." In *L'Argent au Moyen Age: XXVIII<sup>e</sup> Congrès de la SHMESP (Clermont-Ferrand, 1997)*, 289-308. Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 1998.
- Planta, J. *A Catalogue of the Manuscripts in the Cottonian Library, Deposited in the British Museum*. London, 1802.
- Ralph of Coggeshall. *Chronicon Anglicanum*. Ed. J. Stevenson. Rolls Series 66. London: HMSO, 1875.
- Reeves, Marjorie. *The Influence of Prophecy in the Later Middle Ages: A Study in Joachimism*. 2nd ed. Notre Dame, Ind.: Univ. of Notre Dame Press, 1993.
- Registrum Johannis Trefnant*. Ed. W. W. Capes. Canterbury and York Society 20. York, 1916.
- Reid, Heather. "Asneth and Other Hebrew Mothers: Salvation History and Conventual Currency in Medieval England." In *Women as Teachers and Visionaries in Early Literature: Essays in Memory of Margot Louis*, edited by Kathryn Kerby-Fulton. Forthcoming from Victoria, BC: English Literary Studies, 2009.
- Robb, Fiona. "A Late Thirteenth-Century Attack on the Fourth Lateran Council: The *Liber contra Lombardum* and Contemporary Debates on the Trinity." *Recherches de théologie ancienne et médiévale* 62 (1995): 110-44.
- Rouse, Richard, and Mary Rouse. *Henry of Kirkestede, Catalogus de libris authenticis et apocryphis*. London: British Library, 2004.
- Schmolinsky, Sabine. *Der Apokalypsenkommentar des Alexander Minorita: Zur frühen Rezeption Joachims von Fiore in Deutschland*. MHG Studien und Texte 3. Hannover: Hahn, 1991.
- Scott, Edward J. L. *Index to the Sloane Manuscripts in the British Museum*. (1904) London: British Museum, 1971.
- Selge, Kurt-Victor. "Eine Einführung Joachims von Fiore in die Johannesapokalypse." *Deutsches Archiv* 46 (1990): 85-131.
- Sharpe, Richard, et al. *English Benedictine Libraries: The Shorter Catalogues*. London: British Library, 1996.

- . *A Handlist of the Latin Writers of Great Britain and Ireland before 1540*. Turnhout: Brepols, 2001.
- Smith, T. *Catalogue of the Manuscripts in the Cottonian Library, 1696*. Ed. C. G. C. Tite. Cambridge: Brewer, 1984.
- Stornajolo, Cosimus. *Codices Vrbinales Latini*. Vol. 1. Rome: Vatican Library, 1902.
- Taylor, John, et al., eds. *The St. Albans Chronicle*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2003.
- Thomson, Rodney M. *Catalogue of the Manuscripts of Lincoln Cathedral Chapter Library*. Cambridge: D. S. Brewer, 1989.
- Thorndike, Lynn. *History of Magic and Experimental Science*, Vol. 3. New York: Columbia Univ. Press; New York: Macmillan, 1933.
- Todd, J. H. *The Last Age of the Church*. Dublin: Univ. Press, 1840.
- Troncarelli, Fabio. "A Terrible Beauty: Nascita ed evoluzione del *Liber Figurarum*." *Florensia* 2 (1997): 7-40.
- Wannenmacher, Julia Eva. *Hermeneutik der Heilsgeschichte*. Leiden: Brill, 2005.
- Ward, H. L. D. *Catalogue of Romances in the Department of Manuscripts in the British Museum*. London: Longmans, 1883.
- Warner, George F., et al. *Catalogue of Western Manuscripts in the Old Royal and Kings Collections*. Vol. 1. London: British Museum, 1921.
- Watson, Andrew G. *Catalogue of Dated and Datable Manuscripts, c.435-1600 in Oxford Libraries*. 2 vols. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1984.
- . "John Twyne of Canterbury (d. 1581) as a Collector of Medieval Manuscripts: A Preliminary Investigation." *The Library* 6th ser., vol. 8 (1986): 133-51.
- Woolley, Reginald Maxwell. *Catalogue of the Manuscripts of Lincoln Cathedral Chapter Library*. Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press & Humphrey Milford, 1927.