

Literary Legacies and Afterlives of Samuel Hearne

CAROLE GERSON

BECAUSE OF SHIFTING NOTIONS of significance among different communities of reception, explorer and author Samuel Hearne (1745-92) occupies a curiously complex position in the Canadian cultural canon. Historians recognized the magnitude of his exploits by honouring him with designation as a National Historic Person in 1920; fifteen years later Fort Prince of Wales (near present-day Churchill, Manitoba), his primary locale in British North America, was named a National Historic Site and has since been restored. Official recognition continued when the Canadian government marked the bicentenary of Hearne's arrival at the mouth of the Coppermine River with a commemorative postage stamp in 1971. In the cultural realm, however, he is valued for his published narrative rather than for his physical accomplishments, "as if [he] went through that land for a book," in the words of poet John Newlove (429). While Hearne's overland journey across the tundra in 1770-72 was an epic achievement, it did more to enlighten the Hudson's Bay Company about northern resources than to contribute to the later formation of the Canadian nation. Hence, Hearne stands in contrast to other western Canadian explorers whose written narratives are secondary to the sites and outcomes of their travels, such as Simon Fraser, whose voyage down the river that bears his name demonstrated that it was not navigable for trade, and George Vancouver, whose friends' names dot the landscape that would become the major urban centre of Vancouver.¹ But Hearne produced a more readable account of his travels, lavishly published in 1795, with the result that his book has long been a consistent component of Canada's national heritage.

Although his name is not preserved on significant landmarks,² Hearne provides a reference point for subsequent Arctic travel narratives,³ as does his association with the Coppermine River and the Bloody Falls massacre of a band of sleeping Inuit by his Dene-Chipewyan guides in 1771.⁴ The ongoing power of this story has recently been addressed by historical geographer Emilie Cameron, who argues that

“Bloody Falls has a remarkable capacity to gather and order Qablunaaq experiences and relations with the North and with Inuit” (10-11). Her decolonizing study *Far Off Metal River: Inuit Lands, Settler Stories, and the Making of the Contemporary Arctic* (2015) restores Kugluk, the Inuinnaqtam name for the rapids more commonly known as Bloody Falls (xiv), to its Indigenous inhabitants by documenting their knowledge of the history and reality of the region, along with their resistance to imposition of the Hearne narrative in its many manifestations, including historical plaques.⁵ When the canon of Canadian literary texts expanded in the 1970s and 1980s to include documentary non-fiction, Hearne’s narrative became a prominent representative of exploration writing and the subject of numerous studies involving postcolonial, textual, gender-based, and other critical approaches by scholars such as Ian MacLaren, Kathleen Venema, and Bruce Greenfield. Alongside the work of these critics, this essay approaches Hearne from yet another angle that involves patterns of reception and reconception, formulated in part through the lens of book history. By following three modes of representation — editions of his text, non-fictional retellings of his story, and his appearance in works by creative writers — we can see how Hearne has been constructed in Canada’s print and literary histories over more than a century and how the complex afterlife of his narrative offers a window into Canadians’ shifting notions of cultural value.

While historians have elucidated the factual aspects of Hearne’s narrative, questions surrounding his authorship have intrigued textual scholars; as well, the complexity of his self-representation and the appeal of his storytelling have inspired creative writers. Issues that enmesh Hearne include his subject position as narrator, his representation of Indigenous people in one of the first detailed contact narratives about the northernmost reaches of British North America (including his description of cultures soon to be decimated by smallpox), and questions of authorial reliability stimulated by MacLaren’s hypothesis that another hand polished the narrative’s climactic description of the massacre of 17 July 1771 — in particular the compelling image of the dying Inuit girl, pinioned by her attackers’ spears and twining herself around Hearne’s legs as she begged to be spared. In her 2002 dissertation based upon careful examination of all surviving archival documents written by Hearne, historian Heather Driscoll countered that Hearne “was capable of writing the text, had the motivation and opportunity to do so, and

therefore was, indeed, the author” (ii). The debate about Hearne’s literary ability also colours Ken McGoogan’s defensive biography, *Ancient Mariner* (2003). On the creative side, Hearne’s story has inspired a number of literary efforts, the most recent being Pauline Holdstock’s novel *Into the Heart of the Country* (2011). Aimed at different readerships, these various works develop different strategies to address Hearne’s personality and experiences.

After receiving youthful training in the Royal Navy, which Samuel Hearne entered at the age of eleven, he joined the Hudson’s Bay Company (hereafter HBC) in 1766, at the age of twenty-one, and was posted to Fort Prince of Wales, a principal site in the development of the northern fur trade. Assigned to pursue rumours of copper deposits somewhere to the northwest, he undertook three separate overland journeys into the northern barrens. After the first two efforts of 1769 were aborted, the third expedition accomplished its goal. Over the course of nineteen months in 1770-72, Hearne and his Dene-Chipewyan informants made a return journey of some 3,500 miles, travelling on foot to the mouth of the Coppermine River, where it drains into the Arctic Ocean. Without European companions and utterly dependent on his Indigenous guides, Hearne carefully recorded the region’s geography, natural life, and ethnography in field notes and work logs that belonged to the HBC but no longer survive. In the eyes of the HBC, the results were mostly negative: Hearne found virtually no copper, and he established that there was no viable Northwest Passage below the latitude of sixty-eight degrees, thereby demolishing “a centuries-old will-o’-the-wisp of the European imagination,” in the words of Victor G. Hopwood (154).⁶ Nonetheless, Hearne’s intelligence and fortitude demonstrated his value to the HBC, and he rose to become governor of Fort Prince of Wales in 1776. During these years, he began to mine his memory and the details of his logbooks for a book-length narrative that received considerable recognition while still in manuscript form. In 1782, when Hearne surrendered Fort Prince of Wales to French forces led by Comte de Lapérouse, the latter agreed to take care of the manuscript and duly returned it on the assurance that Hearne would seek publication. After ill health prompted his return to England in 1787, Hearne obtained access to his HBC records and devoted his final years to completing his account of his experiences with guidance from his old friend, scientist William Wales, “widely assumed to be Hearne’s ghostwriter” (Craciun,

“Writing the Disaster” 447). In 1792, when Hearne died of dropsy at the age of forty-seven, he left a manuscript for which he had been promised two hundred pounds upon publication (never paid because of his premature death). Three years later, his book was handsomely produced by Strahan and Cadell⁷ as *A Journey from Prince of Wales’ Fort in Hudson’s Bay, to the Northern Ocean . . . in the years 1769, 1770, 1771, and 1772*, joining that publisher’s list of significant exploration narratives by such canonical authors as James Cook and George Anson.

The story of Hearne’s canonicity and afterlife in relation to the interventions of publishers, editors, scholars, and popular and creative writers begins with his book’s publishing history. During the 1780s, Hearne was well aware that “several learned and curious gentlemen are in possession of manuscript copies of, or extracts from, my Journals” (xxx). Direct manifestations of their interest include Thomas Pennant’s references to Hearne’s experiences in his *Arctic Zoology of 1784* (clxxv-clxxii), Andrew Graham’s citation of an “extract from [Hearne’s] Journal” in his 1791 manuscript later issued as *Andrew Graham’s Observations on Hudson’s Bay 1767-91* (196-202), and Dr. James Douglas’s description of Hearne’s northern trek in his introduction to the 1784 edition of Cook’s *A Voyage to the Pacific Ocean . . .* (xlvii-l). This advance circulation created such a strong appetite for the full volume that, according to one historian of European knowledge, “The subsequent posthumous publication of Hearne’s journals in 1795 is arguably more historically significant than Hearne’s journeys themselves” (Binnema 103). The first London edition of Hearne’s narrative was quickly followed by a reprint in Dublin in 1796 and translation into German (Berlin 1797, Vienna 1803), Dutch (The Hague 1798), Swedish (Stockholm 1798), French (Paris 1799), Danish (Copenhagen 1802), and Russian (St. Petersburg 1808). An abridgement appeared in volume 17 of William Fordyce Mavor’s series of selected exploration writings, issued in London in 1797 and reprinted in Philadelphia in 1802 (see Mavor), and another version was issued by Sir R. Phillips in London in 1809 (see Phillips). Hearne remained visible during the nineteenth century with extensive citations in popular volumes, such as John Barrow’s *Chronological History of Voyages into the Arctic* (1818) (see Craciun, “Writing the Disaster”). John Franklin carried a copy of Hearne’s hefty *Journey* on his first venture into the Arctic, the ill-fated Coppermine Expedition of 1819-22 (an omen of his later catastrophic voyage of 1845-47); his resulting

Narrative of a Journey to the Shores of the Polar Sea in the Years 1819, 20, 21, and 22 (1823) frequently references people and sites described by Hearne as well as his own visit to Bloody Falls (350). In *Writing Arctic Disaster: Authorship and Exploration*, Adriana Craciun argues that in Victorian England the wide circulation of Hearne's narrative — especially his prefatory account of James Knight's doomed 1719 expedition in quest of the Northwest Passage — played a major role in “the popularization of Arctic disaster, and specifically in the Franklin disaster to come” (25). British attention returned to Hearne in 2009 at the hands of Ray Mears, whose book *Northern Wilderness*, alongside an episode in the BBC television series *Ray Mears's Northern Wilderness*, gave Hearne extended attention as one of the “explorers who should be household names in their native Britain, but who are now as little known as the land they encountered” (2).

In the literary realm, Hearne is credited with having inspired Wordsworth's “Complaint of a Forsaken Indian Woman” (1798), which in turn lies behind Duncan Campbell Scott's well-known 1905 poem “The Forsaken” (Beckmann), and with having influenced Poe and Thoreau.⁸ Canadian author Ken McGoogan titled his biography *Ancient Mariner* to enhance his argument that Hearne's travels and continuing sense of guilt about the massacre informed Coleridge's well-known poem “The Rime of the Ancient Mariner” (1-3, 273-74, 290-94). Although John Livingstone Lowes confirms that Coleridge owned a copy of the Dublin edition of Hearne's *Journey* (449) and that Coleridge's poem “The Three Graves” indirectly drew on Hearne's accounts of Native witchcraft (117), there seems to be little reason to argue with his identification of Coleridge's source as George Shelvocke's *A Voyage Round the World by Way of the Great South Sea* (1726), a book that Wordsworth drew to Coleridge's attention and that includes a description of Captain Simon Hadley's senseless shooting of an albatross (485-86; also see Fowke).

The Canadian Context: Full-Length Versions of Hearne's Narrative

Hearne's significance in the Canadian context was confirmed in 1911 when the first Canadian edition of his *Journey* was issued in Toronto by the Champlain Society as the sixth volume in its ongoing series of significant documents in Canadian history. Founded in 1905 and still active today, this organization aims “to increase public awareness of,

and accessibility to, Canada's rich store of historical records"⁹ by issuing a wide range of published and manuscript materials in limited scholarly editions with a usual print run of five hundred copies. Hearne's *Journey* was prepared by J.B. Tyrrell, a geologist and cartographer with the Geological Survey of Canada who described himself as "the only one since Hearne who has conducted explorations in the country lying between Fort Churchill and the eastern end of Great Slave Lake and south of latitude of 63 [degrees] N" (ix). His diplomatic edition records the pagination of the original edition of 1795, with Hearne's notes and illustrations supplemented by additional notes, maps, and illustrations, including fifteen documentary photographs from Tyrrell's own expeditions, along with a bibliography and index. The Champlain Society returned to Hearne in 1934 with the publication of his manuscript journals of inland travels in 1774-75, still held in the HBC archives, as part of its volume 21. Also edited by Tyrrell, this text provides a fine example of an HBC employee's logbook, reporting daily movements and activities in abbreviated notation with minimal narrative.

The 1950s proved to be a distinctive decade in the dissemination of Hearne's story with new book-length versions contributing to the fresh national consciousness of the postwar era signalled by such milestones as the 1951 report of the Massey Commission, the 1955 Canadian Writers' Conference at Queen's University, and the creation of the Canada Council in 1957. Two different representations of Hearne's journals, both published in 1958, established his narrative's ongoing appeal to different readerships. Drawing on new research in both the United Kingdom and the HBC archives in Winnipeg, historian Richard Glover issued a scholarly edition with Macmillan of Canada that remains the definitive text for academics even though it was last reprinted in 1972. Throughout this edition, Glover draws comparisons between Hearne's published volume and the Stowe manuscript in the British Library, which he characterizes as Hearne's "original report of 1772" (41).¹⁰

In the same year, Canada's other major press of the era, McClelland and Stewart, published a volume under the name of popular naturalist author Farley Mowat titled *Coppermine Journey: An Account of a Great Adventure — Selected from the Journals of Samuel Hearne*. Drawing on his own experience in the Arctic and retaining some flavour of Hearne's style, Mowat streamlined the text and modernized its punctuation and syntax in order to return Hearne to what Mowat characterized

as Hearne's intended "Everyman" readership ([xi]). Then at the beginning of his career, Mowat demonstrated his gift for narrative organization (much superior to Hearne's) by consolidating information that is dispersed in the original version, transferring information about Indigenous life from Hearne's copious footnotes and final encyclopedic chapters into the primary narrative, and explaining the enmity between Dene and Inuit before the occurrence of the massacre. He also restructured Hearne's chapters so that several conclude with strategic highlights, such as placing Hearne's comments about cannibalism at the end of the second chapter and his reflections on the negative impact of European contact on the Native population at the end of the fifth chapter. Mowat's interventions enliven the narrative by reducing its scientific and cartographic content and highlighting the human element to create a drama of three major characters: Moses Norton, the nasty governor of Fort Prince of Wales; Matonabee, Hearne's outstanding Dene-Chipewyan guide; and Samuel Hearne himself, the determined, long-suffering hero. However, in removing material outside the timeline of Hearne's three ventures of 1769-72, Mowat deleted two significant sections concerning 1782-83, when Fort Prince of Wales was temporarily in French hands. Missing are Hearne's dispassionate account of Matonabee's suicide when the latter believed that the British had forever abandoned Fort Prince of Wales¹¹ and his touching description of his beloved Mary Norton, the mixed-race daughter of Governor Moses Norton, who starved to death during Hearne's absence in the winter of 1782-83. (As discussed later in this essay, Mary's story would be taken up by novelist Pauline Holdstock in 2011.)

The work of eminent book designer Frank Newfeld, the first edition of Mowat's book featured endpapers with a map of Hearne's journeys and a repeated internal image based upon an Inuit harpoon. Using the orange of copper, the blue of water, and the white space of arctic snow, the dust jacket artistically references the book's climactic massacre with a stylized illustration of Aborigines killing Inuit (here fully clothed, though Hearne specified that they were nude), along with images of travelling by canoe and dogsled — the latter a means of transportation that Hearne and his companions never used and whose presence demonstrates the tendency of illustrators to rely on conventional notions of northern Indigenous cultures. Notwithstanding Mowat's scornful description of the "Eskimo harpoon" motif as "a delightful scholastic

joke” (Letter) because of its inappropriateness to Hearne’s story, this edition represents the best of Canadian commercial book production in the 1950s and 1960s. When the text was reissued in 1990 as a small mass-market paperback, its front cover, dominated by the name of Farley Mowat, proclaimed his celebrity status over that of Hearne, whose name is almost invisible. Insouciance rather than accuracy governed the selection of this version’s cover image, taken not from one of the engravings in Hearne’s original volume but from a sixteenth-century woodcut of Inuit kayakers that originally illustrated Martin Frobisher’s voyage of 1577 (see Frobisher).¹²

Contrasting with Mowat’s popular account is the handsome 1971 edition of Hearne’s *Journey* produced by Mel Hurtig in his Canadiana Reprint Series of more than two dozen “facsimile reproductions” of “classics of Canadian history and literature,” to cite the publisher’s blurb on the back of the dust jacket.¹³ In line with the centennial nationalism of the late 1960s through the 1970s, this series demonstrated Hurtig’s commitment to celebrating Canadian accomplishments by building resources such as the *Canadian Encyclopedia*. Introduced by historian Leslie Neatby, Hurtig’s edition of Hearne’s *Journey*, priced at twenty dollars, includes nearly full-size reproductions of the engravings and multicolour fold-out maps of the first edition of 1795. Hurtig retained the font size of Hearne’s original text but reduced the volume’s stately quarto dimensions by trimming the margins and deleting some bottom-of-the-page information such as printers’ signatures and production dates of plates.¹⁴ Although the text appears to be an exact photographic replica of the 1795 original, MacLaren has drawn attention to Hurtig’s silent corrections of printing errors listed in the “errata” sheet of the first edition and cautions us about the assumed reliability of a “facsimile reprint” (“Notes” 29).¹⁵

In 2007, Hearne’s journal returned to print in a handy paperback from TouchWood Editions, a press in Victoria specializing in works about the Pacific Northwest. Characterized on the front cover as “The Adventures of Samuel Hearne,” this version features modernized spelling; as well, the original footnotes have been changed to endnotes so that Hearne’s often extensive commentary is no longer set up in conversation with the primary text. Despite its many typographical errors and muddy reproductions of the original maps and illustrations, this

book is helpfully indexed and useful as a basic text for general readers and undergraduate classes.

Popular Accounts of Hearne's Story

Tyrrell's 1911 edition of Hearne's *Journal* facilitated widespread general attention to his narrative in the first half of the twentieth century. Popular retellings tend to highlight the extremities of Hearne's experience with a focus on privation and violence; all depict him as a stoic hero but vary in their assessment of Indigenous life and attention to the massacre. A taste for romance underpins some renditions, such as the chapter on Hearne in Morden H. Long's *Knights Errant of the Wilderness* (1920) and the 1930 pamphlet *Samuel Hearne*, written by Lloyd Roberts for Ryerson Press's series of Canadian History Readers.¹⁶ Other early-twentieth-century accounts invoke tropes of Anglo-Saxon fortitude in a land of savagery and depict the massacre as an example of "Indians" being "faithful to their character for faithlessness" (Hyrst 20)¹⁷ to justify the European conquest of British North America. In her highly dramatized chapter on Hearne in *Pathfinders of the West* (1904), Agnes Laut¹⁸ generalized about "the thirst for blood which is as insatiable in the redskin as in the wolfpack" (265). This perspective reappeared in Paul L. Haworth's *Trailmakers of the Northwest* (1921), which describes the massacre as "typical of hundreds of terrible massacres in the almost constant warfare of tribe upon tribe in the America of that day," a pattern of conflict that would only be resolved through "white influence" (41). In contrast, Stephen Leacock took a relatively dispassionate approach in his little-known 1922 volume *Adventurers of the Far North: A Chronicle of the Arctic Seas*, presenting Indigenous violence as an extension of the overall inhospitality of the harsh northern environment braved by Hearne, who possessed "the obstinate pluck of his race" (41). Celebration of the heroic rather than disparagement of the Indigenous likewise informs a 1935 article on "Christmas with Samuel Hearne," which discusses the threat of starvation courageously faced by Hearne and other explorers "who were a robust-minded race, to whom self-pity was a stranger" (Jefferys 269).

More complex inferences about Hearne's personality characterize later interpretations. In Laurence Burpee's *The Discovery of Canada* (1948), which aimed to "drive away the dullness that had seeped into

Canadian history" (v), Hearne comes across as a wry raconteur about Indigenous life and Arctic animals, and the massacre is reduced to one incident among many.¹⁹ Three decades later, popular historian Pierre Berton, who spent much of his life in the Yukon, identified with Hearne as "an uncommonly sensitive and sensible man" and one of the few early explorers whom he "would care to invite for dinner" (65). With some disregard for chronology, Berton opined that the massacre was "no more savage than [the treatment] visited upon the Aztecs of Mexico about the same time by the Christian conquistadores of Spain or upon heretics and witches of Europe who were consumed by slow fires in full public view" (77). Not surprisingly, Hearne figures as a frequent source in Peter C. Newman's journalistic history of the HBC, *Company of Adventurers* (1985). Foregrounding Hearne's ability to "take pleasure out of even the most disconcerting experiences" (261), Newman heightens these events and frequently "dips his pen in the purple patch" (MacLaren, "Exploring" 97) to fascinate modern readers with the extremities of Hearne's account, including the massacre. Among these popular historians, Newman is the only author to address Hearne's relationship with Mary Norton and to expand on Matonabbee, declaring that Matonabbee and Mary were the "soulmates . . . who had defined [Hearne's] life" (285). Balancing these heroic narratives, eminent mineralogist Edward W. Nuffield took a more scientific approach by situating Hearne's experiences within the wider context of Arctic exploration in a 2001 book for general readers and high school students that contains an informative chapter on Aboriginal uses of copper (see Nuffield).

In the first half of the twentieth century, Hearne was included in many surveys of northern history addressed to the classroom and/or the general public, but it was not until the 1950s that several book-length versions of his story appeared for the school-aged market, joining that decade's production of Glover's scholarly edition and Mowat's entertaining narrative. Richard S. Lambert's *North for Adventure: How Samuel Hearne Crossed the Arctic Desert* (1952) and Ronald Syme's *On Foot to the Arctic: The Story of Samuel Hearne*²⁰ (1959; into its third printing in 1967) present Hearne's story as a heroic adventure, with somewhat differing treatments of characters and events. Rather reticent about the massacre, Lambert offers sympathetic portrayals of both Mary Norton and Matonabbee, whereas Syme frequently quotes from Hearne's jour-

nal with little effort to protect young readers from the brutalities of Hearne's experience, including Matonabee's suicide (182). Aimed at younger children, Mary Hamilton's beautifully illustrated *The Sky Caribou* (1980) is told through the eyes of a fictional eleven-year-old son of Matonabee. Informative about Hearne (with maps on its endpapers) and Native customs and perspectives, this gentler version avoids the massacre entirely because the women and children, including the young narrator, stay behind when the men go off to fight.

Hearne seems to have had little traction in French Canada until recently. In 1995, in *Samuel Hearne: Le marcheur de l'Arctique* (number eight in a series of fifty historical *biographies romancées* addressed to younger readers), Daniel Poliquin fictionalized Hearne's story such that his secret love for young Marie Norton is presented as one of his motives for embarking on his epic journey (31-32), notwithstanding that, when Hearne first set out in 1769, he was twenty-four years old and Marie was about nine. Two decades later, in April 2015, Radio-Canada's Montreal morning show recommended *Le piéton du Grand Nord: Première traversée de la toundra canadienne (1769-1772)*, issued in Paris in 2002 and the first French version since 1799, as one of "100 livres d'ici à lire une fois dans sa vie."²¹ In making adjustments to accommodate the "lecteur d'aujourd'hui" (43), translator Marie-Hélène Fraïssé took fewer liberties than Mowat in modernizing Hearne's language and trimming cartographic and scientific detail for a mass-market audience.

From 1960 on, the image of Hearne as the enduring adventurer — "the eighteenth-century's equivalent of Laurence of Arabia" in Newman's words (288) — was challenged by the persona of Hearne as witness of the massacre, largely because of the prevalence of this episode in the many anthologies developed primarily for university-level Canadian literature courses during the ensuing five decades. Not all of these anthologies include Hearne, but with just one exception (see Francis²²), whenever Hearne appears, so does the massacre. In some collections, he is represented by only these pages from his *Journey* (see Daymond and Monkman; Moyles; and Toye), whereas others also include selections that focus on Matonabee or Indigenous customs (see Smith; and Warkentin). Most recently, editors Cynthia Sugars and Laura Moss selected sections that concern the role of the Hudson's Bay Company in the North (see Sugars and Moss). This concentration on a single aspect of Hearne's entire experience has been abetted by lively

scholarly discussion about the likelihood of editorial intervention in dramatizing his published account, a question first raised by MacLaren, whose analysis has recently been supported by Craciun (“Writing the Disaster” 447-48). From his examination of the Stowe manuscript, which lacks much of the sensational and emotional detail of the published version, MacLaren posits that another hand polished the text to represent Hearne as a tearful man of feeling and to attract readers of gothic fiction (“Samuel Hearne’s Accounts”; see also Greenfield).²³

Hearne’s most vigorous defender against MacLaren’s analysis has been McGoogan in his biography *Ancient Mariner* and his foreword to the 2007 TouchWood edition of Hearne’s *Journey*. Decrying MacLaren’s application of “postmodernist literary theory” (Foreword xxii) to discredit Hearne’s authority, McGoogan’s creative biography constructs Hearne as a multi-dimensional individual with the wit and education to have composed his entire narrative without assistance. A frequenter of London’s coffee houses and a reader of Diderot, Rousseau, and Voltaire (*Ancient Mariner* 69), this literate and cultivated Hearne adds “favourite books by Defoe and Voltaire” (85) to the library at Fort Prince of Wales. McGoogan argues that Hearne’s fictionalized account of the fate of the doomed Knight expedition demonstrates that Hearne possessed the imagination to similarly dramatize his account of the massacre (89-92; repeated almost verbatim, Foreword xiv-xvi). To add further sympathy, McGoogan picks up Hearne’s lengthy note about his beloved Mary to construct a betrothal scene that is pure fantasy (207-09).

Creative Responses to Hearne

Poets and playwrights have shown less interest in Hearne’s story than have prose writers. Don Gutteridge’s long poetic narrative, *Coppermine* (1973), which has received scant attention, uses the white spaces of the page to accentuate Hearne’s sense of isolation in a massive winter landscape. Described by Keith Garebian as “a Canadian version of the El Dorado myth” (30) and by MacLaren as both “gratuitously” (“Notes” 22) and “shamelessly” (“Exploring” 98) obscene — a view shared by Cameron, who finds it “a deeply violent, misogynistic, and racialized celebration of rape” (59-60) — this poem foregrounds the sexual violence that lurks beneath the surface of Hearne’s text and constructs Matonabee as a mystical repository of much that was unknowable

and unrecognized in Hearne's encounter with the otherness of the land and its human cultures. Also focusing on Hearne's Indigenous guide, E.H. Carefoot's poetic tragedy *Matonabbee* alters the historical record by changing the return date of Hearne's expedition from 1772 to 1774 and presenting an account of Matonabbee's suicide that differs substantially from Hearne's. This play was staged in Saskatoon in 1980 and, if the reviews are to be trusted, deservedly rests in the library of the Twenty-Fifth Street House Theatre held in the archive of the University of Saskatchewan. In this version, Matonabbee is haunted by his role in the murder of an elderly Inuit woman during the massacre. Concluding with even more on- and off-stage corpses than *Hamlet*, Carefoot's play dramatizes the deaths of Matonabbee's seven wives, Governor Norton, and Matonabbee himself, leaving Hearne and Mary Norton as the only characters still able to stand and speak.

Like all of the creative writing that addresses Hearne, John Newlove's much-anthologized single poem "Samuel Hearne in Wintertime" (1968) contemplates gaps in Hearne's published narrative. Its self-reflexive, present-day speaker celebrates Hearne's desire for knowledge, in contrast to the dying Inuit girl who is "never to know" (430); concluding the poem with a reference to the massacre contributes to the highlighting of this episode in Hearne's canonical identity. A similarly climactic ending appears in Robin McGrath's poem "They Came in Early Spring" (1998), which represents the massacre as a conflict between Inuit and "Indians" congruent with the mythical stories of Navarana that McGrath investigated in her scholarly article "Samuel Hearne and the Inuit Oral Tradition." Representing Hearne's presence obliquely, the poem mentions him only as "the trader who made it possible" and "dreamed of copper" (24), suspending confirmation of his identity until the concluding words "Bloody Fall" (27). Given the endurance of such references, it is scarcely surprising that in 1991 it seemed to MacLaren that "the figure of Hearne in Canadian literature cannot free himself from the Inuit girl who is always there" ("Exploring" 106). However, in Holdstock's novel, Mary Norton displaces the Inuit girl as a significant female victim of Hearne's intrusion into the North.

In *Into the Heart of the Country*, Holdstock sidesteps critical controversy about Hearne's authorship and exploits the liberty of fiction to foreground Mary (renamed Molly) as a principal narrative consciousness. To appreciate Holdstock's accomplishment, it is helpful to compare

her novel with John Steffler's *The Afterlife of George Cartwright* (1992). Although historical fiction abounds in Canada, literary fiction about the men venerated as explorers is relatively rare, a singularity that might account for the substantial critical attention paid to Steffler's book. A settler/explorer little known outside Newfoundland and Labrador, where he attempted to establish himself as a trader in the late eighteenth century, Cartwright published his journals in London in 1792. Before the appearance of Steffler's version, Cartwright's descriptions of his entrepreneurship in Labrador failed to attract much national notice, even during the 1970s and 1980s, when a number of scholars brought exploration and settlement narratives into the arena of Canadian literary studies; hence, Cartwright does not appear in any of the mainstream Canlit anthologies from those decades. Some critics note the dimension added by Steffler's attribution of a minority voice to the secondary character of Cartwright's partner, Mrs. Selby (see Renger), but the Indigenous figures with whom Cartwright interacted remain opaque. Hence, I concur with Sugars that the "varied and contestatory readings of the novel reveal the profoundly ambivalent nature of the novel's assessment of Canada's settler invader legacy," resulting in a work that is "laudable and yet hopelessly compromised" (699).

In contrast to Steffler, Holdstock responded to the quandary of how to narrate the history of colonization in this postcolonial era by shifting the focus from the original primary storyteller to characters at the margins. From the beginning, she decentres Hearne by fleshing out the characters of Mary's grandfather and father, English-born Richard Norton and his mixed-race son Moses, as well as naming and acknowledging the many Indigenous women ignored by the official historical record. This decentring is evident as well in the book's physical design: as its cover image and to mark section breaks, the first hardback edition used a modified image from the side rather than the centre of Hearne's well-known engraving *A Winter View of Athapuscow Lake*. Telling the story of Fort Prince of Wales through characters other than Hearne, from its founding in 1717 until his return to the site of its destruction in 1783, Holdstock defers reference to the massacre until Hearne attempts to write about it and finds himself unable to do so (148, 171-76). The novel's extended focus sympathetically depicts Hearne as "SAM, wanting / to know, to do a job" (Newlove 429) and movingly details the dilemmas confronted by Indigenous people as they attempt to cope with

the changes wrought by European contact with fragile cultures that had developed their own ways to survive in harsh conditions. In this telling, disease and betrayal prove to be far more deadly than the dramatized encounter of one massacre.

Conclusion: Minding the Gaps

In the course of assembling the many references discussed in this article, my research on the afterlife of Samuel Hearne encountered significant gaps. Much has appeared in print in various genres, yet his story does not seem to have inspired many workers in other media, such as painting and music (see MacQuarrie).²⁴ To my knowledge, the only film about Hearne was created by Virginia Barter, a Métis filmmaker based in Toronto, who produced a short film in 2010 and hopes to do something longer in the future.²⁵ Two “outsider” (Cameron xiv) scholars — Emilie Cameron and Robin McGrath — have reversed the colonial gaze by approaching Hearne’s story from the Inuit side; however, given the recent surge of Indigenous artistic and cultural activity and the frequency with which Aboriginal writers have addressed the past by writing back to key historical figures (e.g., Armand Ruffo’s poems about D.C. Scott, Susanna Moodie, and Grey Owl, as well as Marilyn Dumont’s poem about Sir John A. Macdonald), I find it curious that no Indigenous writer seems to have taken up Hearne or Matonabbee. On the national level, Matonabbee received formal recognition when he was designated a National Historic Person in 1981 and honoured with a plaque at Fort Prince of Wales from the Historic Sites and Monuments Board, a gesture followed by a commemorative postage stamp in 1989. Yet, on the creative side, he has been scarcely visible. His amplified story would enhance the spectrum of constructions of Hearne, to date variously represented as a heroic adventurer, an eighteenth-century knowledge seeker, or a destructive precolonialist whose intrusions were not only responsible for bringing Dene attackers into Inuit territory but also heralded the long-term destruction of northern Aboriginal peoples. In the sea of shifting stories that swirl around the historical figure of Samuel Hearne, there are narratives and counternarratives waiting to be written.

AUTHOR'S NOTE

I would like to thank my colleague Betty Schellenberg for prompting this project by inviting me to participate in the annual conference of the Canadian Association for Eighteenth-Century Studies when it met in Vancouver in 2015. An earlier version of this essay was delivered in Paris in 2016 at the annual conference of the Society for the History of Authorship, Reading, and Publishing. I am grateful to the many colleagues, librarians, and archivists (at McMaster University, the University of Alberta, and the University of Saskatchewan) who answered my questions and assisted with various aspects of this research, supported by an Insight grant from SSHRC.

NOTES

¹ These places include Burrard Inlet, Point Grey, Point Atkinson, and Howe Sound; see Akrigg.

² Whereas Alexander Mackenzie, Simon Fraser, and David Thompson gave their names to mighty rivers, Samuel Hearne's few namesakes are Hearne Lake, a small lake near Fort Smith, Northwest Territories; Cape Hearne in Nunavut near Kugluktuk, "a large promontory" on the Arctic Ocean christened by John Franklin (347); Samuel Hearne Middle School in Scarborough, Ontario; and Samuel Hearne Secondary School in Inuvik, demolished in 2013 to make way for a super school named East 3 (<<http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/north/demolition-of-samuel-hearne-secondary-school-in-inuvik-1.1391695>>, accessed 6 Feb. 2017).

³ For example, in his account of his 1911 prospecting venture in search of copper ore, George M. Douglas references Hearne in the title of his book *Lands Forlorn: A Story of an Expedition to Hearne's Coppermine River* (1914).

⁴ In *Bloody Falls of the Coppermine* (2005), McKay Jenkins recalls the Hearne association in his gripping account of the 1913 murder of two priests at a site not far from Bloody Falls, an event that otherwise has nothing to do with Hearne.

⁵ Bloody Falls National Historic Site was formally recognized in 1978. Interestingly, the current official description describes its significance in Indigenous history without any reference to Samuel Hearne (<http://www.pc.gc.ca/apps/dfhd/page_nhs_eng.aspx?id=321>, accessed 13 May 2017).

⁶ In *Samuel Hearne and the Northwest Passage* (1963), Gordon Speck asserts that Hearne's greatest historical contribution was to prove that a Northwest Passage through the American continent was a myth, albeit others continued in futile pursuit.

⁷ See "The Age of Strahan" (Craciun, "Oceanic Voyages" 179-83).

⁸ Bruce Greenfield argues that Hearne's narrative "can be considered part of American literary heritage" because "his travels took place in 1769-1772, before the revolution," and therefore "contributed to what was an international literature of science and exploration focusing on the Americas and the Pacific Ocean"; moreover, his book was noted by Thoreau and Poe ("Idea" 207).

⁹ <<http://www.champlainsociety.ca/about-us/>>, accessed 6 Feb. 2017.

¹⁰ Elsewhere Glover states that this "transcript of Hearne's third journey . . . can be dated by internal evidence as having been written before 1782" (xxxiv); according to MacLaren ("Samuel Hearne's" 28), the Stowe copy is dated 1791. Disagreement surrounds the reliability of the Stowe manuscript, "Mr. Hearne's Narrative," which contains an account of Hearne's third journey in a hand not his, and it is now housed in the British

Library (66-89, 307 ff.). Whatever its date, this version precedes the publication of Hearne's book and differs in many respects. See Craciun, "Writing the Disaster"; Driscoll; Glover; MacLaren, "Samuel Hearne's"; McGoogan, *Ancient*; and Rollaston.

¹¹ In his Chapter 4, Mowat incorporates information about Matonabbee that appears at the end of Hearne's Chapter 9, but he stops short of recounting Matonabbee's death.

¹² I would like to thank Philip Tromars for identifying the source of this image. Mowat recycled an abridged version of his *Coppermine Journey* text in *Tundra: Selections from the Great Accounts of Arctic Land Voyages* (1971).

¹³ Somewhat bizarrely, a facsimile of the 1795 edition of Hearne's *Journey* appeared in 1968 as the twenty-fifth volume in the seventy-five-volume Bibliotheca Australiana, described as "a series of facsimile editions of the most significant journals and histories relating to Pacific exploration, from Magellan's circumnavigation at the beginning of the 16th century to the meticulously prepared scientific expeditions at the end of the 19th" (Day 320).

¹⁴ They are all dated 1 Jan. 1795 with the exception of plate viii, *Slude River*, dated 1 Jan. 1794.

¹⁵ MacLaren claims that Hurtig's edition lacks "the map of Hearne's route, which is positioned facing the title page in the first edition" ("Notes" 29), but my copy of Hurtig includes this map in precisely this location.

¹⁶ See Campbell 269-71. Pierce collected these pamphlets into a series of eight volumes titled *Our Dominion: Stories of Character and Incident*. Roberts's chapter on Hearne appeared in the second volume, *Stories of Adventure* (1932).

¹⁷ Hyrst's chapter on Hearne contains an extraordinary number of errors.

¹⁸ This volume features three photographs of "Eskimos," disregarding the actual identities of the people with whom Hearne travelled and traded. Laut's errors include describing Moses Norton as "a full-blooded Indian" (246), whereas his father was English, and Matonabbee as suiciding by "[blowing] his brains out" (272); according to Hearne, he hanged himself.

¹⁹ In the same year, there appeared an American account on the other side of the cultural spectrum in Robert E. Pinkerton's gruesome exaggeration of the violence encountered by Hearne, in "Far Off Metal River," written for the pulp magazine *True: The Man's Magazine*; see Cameron 55-57.

²⁰ Also published as *Trail to the North* (1959).

²¹ <<http://ici.radio-canada.ca/nouvelle/722285/liste-pdf-100-livres-canadiens-incontournables>>, accessed 24 Nov. 2016.

²² Addressing the general reader, Daniel Francis selected Hearne's efforts to understand the conjurers.

²³ Both Pennant and Graham include more detail about the massacre than appears in the Stowe manuscript but without giving Hearne the tearful "man of feeling" persona of the published volume.

²⁴ Cameron claims that Hearne has been "memorialized in . . . murals . . . and street names" (9) without providing further details.

²⁵ See <http://www.virginiabarter.ca/?page_id=281>, accessed 8 Feb. 2017; personal email exchange with Virginia Barter in 2016.

WORKS CITED

- Akrigg, G.V.P., and Helen B. Akrigg. *1001 British Columbia Place Names*. Vancouver: Discovery, 1973. Print.
- Beckmann, Susan. "A Note on Duncan Campbell Scott's 'The Forsaken.'" *Humanities Association Review* 25 (1974): 32-37. Print.
- Berton, Pierre. *My Country: The Remarkable Past*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1976. Print.
- Binnema, Theodore. *Enlightened Zeal: The Hudson's Bay Company and Scientific Networks, 1670-1870*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2014. Print.
- Burpee, Laurence J. *The Discovery of Canada*. Toronto: Macmillan, 1944. Print.
- Carefoot, E.H. *Matonabee*. 1980. TS. Twenty-Fifth Street Theatre fonds, U of Saskatchewan, University Archives & Special Collections, Saskatoon.
- Cameron, Emilie. *Far Off Metal River: Inuit Lands, Settler Stories, and the Making of the Contemporary Arctic*. Vancouver: U of British Columbia P, 2015. Print.
- Campbell, Sandra. *Both Hands: A Life of Lorne Pierce*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's UP, 2013. Print.
- Craciun, Adriana. "Oceanic Voyages, Maritime Books, and Eccentric Inscriptions." *Atlantic Studies: Global Currents* 10.2 (2013): 170-96. Print.
- . *Writing Arctic Disaster: Authorship and Exploration*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2016. Print.
- . "Writing the Disaster: Franklin and *Frankenstein*." *Nineteenth-Century Literature* 65.4 (2011): 433-80. Print.
- Day, Alan. *The A to Z of the Discovery and Exploration of Australia*. Metuchen: Scarecrow, 2009. Print.
- Daymond, Douglas, and Leslie Monkman, eds. *Literature in Canada*. Vol. 1. Toronto: Gage, 1978. Print.
- Douglas, George M. *Lands Forlorn: A Story of an Expedition to Hearne's Coppermine River*. New York: Putnam, 1914. Print.
- Douglas, Dr. James. Introduction. *A Voyage to the Pacific Ocean Undertaken by the Command of His Majesty for Making Discoveries in the Northern Hemisphere to Determine the Position and Extent of the West Side of North America . . . Performed under the Direction of Captains Cook, Clerke, and Gore . . . in Three Volumes*. By Captain James Cook. London: Strahan, 1784. i-lxxvi. Print.
- Driscoll, Heather Rollaston. "The Genesis of *A Journey to the Northern Ocean: A Dissertation Concerning the Transactions and Occurrences Related to Samuel Hearne's Coppermine River Narrative, Including Information on His Letters, Journals, Draft Manuscripts, and Published Work*." Diss. U of Alberta, 2002. Print.
- Fowke, Robert. *The Real Ancient Mariner*. Bishop's Castle: Travelbrief, 2010. Print.
- Fraïssé, Marie-Hélène. *Le piéton du Grand Nord: Première traverse de la toundra canadienne (1769-1772)*. Paris: Payot, 2002. Print.
- Francis, Daniel, ed. *Imagining Ourselves: Classics of Canadian Non-Fiction*. Vancouver: Arsenal Pulp, 1994. Print.
- Franklin, John. *Narrative of a Journey to the Shores of the Polar Sea in the Years 1819, 20, 21, and 22*. London: J. Murray, 1823. Print.
- Frobisher, Martin. *Navigatio in regiones occidentis*. Nuremberg: n.p, 1580. Print.
- Garebian, Keith. "Don Gutteridge's Mythic Tetralogy." *Canadian Literature* 87 (1980): 25-41. Print.
- Glover, Richard, ed. *A Journey from Prince of Wales's Fort in Hudson's Bay to the Northern Ocean, 1769, 1770, 1771, 1772*. By Samuel Hearne. Toronto: Macmillan, 1958. Print.

- Graham, Andrew. *Andrew Graham's Observations on Hudson's Bay, 1767-91*. Ed. Glyndwr Williams. London: Hudson's Bay Record Society, 1961. Print.
- Greenfield, Bruce. "Can Fur Traders Have Feelings? Sentiment in Samuel Hearne's *Journey to the Northern Ocean*." *Studies in Canadian Literature* 37.2 (2012): 117-40. Print.
- . "The Idea of Discovery as a Source of Narrative Structure in Samuel Hearne's *Journey to the Northern Ocean*." *Early American Literature* 21 (1986-87): 189-209. Print.
- Gutteridge, Don. *Coppermine: The Quest for North*. Toronto: Oberon, 1973. Print.
- Hamilton, Mary. *The Sky Caribou*. Toronto: PMA Books, 1980. Print.
- Haworth, Paul Leland. *Trailmakers of the Northwest*. Toronto: Goodchild, 1921. Print.
- Hearne, Samuel. *A Journey from Prince of Wales' Fort in Hudson's Bay to the Northern Ocean*. 1795. Edmonton: Hurtig, 1971. Print.
- Holdstock, Pauline. *Into the Heart of the Country*. Toronto: HarperCollins, 2011. Print.
- Hopwood, Victor G. "Samuel Hearne." *Dictionary of Literary Biography*. Vol. 99. Ed. W.H. New. Detroit: Gale, 1990. 154-57. Print.
- Hyrst, H.W.G. *Adventures in the Arctic Regions*. Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1910. Print.
- Jefferys, Charles W. "Christmas with Samuel Hearne." *Canadian Geographical Journal* 11.6 (1935): 266-72. Print.
- Jenkins, McKay. *Bloody Falls of the Coppermine*. New York: Random House, 2005. Print.
- Lambert, Richard S. *North for Adventure: How Samuel Hearne Crossed the Arctic Desert*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1952. Print.
- Laut, Agnes. *Pathfinders of the West*. New York: Grosset, 1904. Print.
- Leacock, Stephen. *Adventurers of the Far North: A Chronicle of the Arctic Seas*. Toronto: Glasgow, Brook. 1922. Print.
- Long, Morden H. *Knights Errant of the Wilderness: Tales of the Explorers of the Great North-West*. Toronto: Macmillan, 1920.
- Lowes, John Livingston. *The Road to Xanadu: A Study in the Ways of the Imagination*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1964. Print.
- MacLaren, I.S. "Exploring Canadian Literature: Samuel Hearne and the Inuit Girl." *Probing Canadian Culture*. Ed. Peter Easingwood, Konrad Gross, and Wolfgang Kloos. Augsburg: Verlag, 1991. 87-106. Print.
- . "Notes on Samuel Hearne's *Journey* from a Bibliographical Perspective." *Papers of the Bibliographical Society of Canada* 31.2 (1993): 21-45. Print.
- . "Samuel Hearne's Accounts of the Massacre at Bloody Fall, 17 July 1771." *ARIEL: A Review of International English Literature* 22.1 (1991): 25-51. Print.
- MacQuarrie, Bob. "What a Journey Samuel Hearne." *Search for a Passage*. GumBoots, 2004. CD.
- Mavor, William. *Historical Account of the Most Celebrated Voyages, Travels, and Discoveries: From the Time of Columbus to the Present Period*. 1797. Philadelphia: Samuel F. Bradford, 1802.
- McGoogan, Ken. *Ancient Mariner*. Toronto: HarperCollins, 2003. Print.
- . Foreword. *A Journey to the Northern Ocean: The Adventures of Samuel Hearne*. Victoria: TouchWood, 2007. ix-xxiv. Print.
- McGrath, Robin. *Escaped Domestic*. St. John's: Killick, 1998. Print.
- . "Samuel Hearne and the Inuit Oral Tradition." *Studies in Canadian Literature* 18.2 (1993): 94-109. Print.
- Mears, Ray. *Northern Wilderness*. London: Hodder, 2009. Print.
- Mowat, Farley. *Coppermine Journey: An Account of a Great Adventure, Selected from the Journals of Samuel Hearne*. 1958. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1990. Print.
- . Mowat, Farley. Letter to Jack McClelland. 2 Apr. 1958. TS. McClelland and Stewart fonds. McMaster University Archives and Research Collections, Hamilton.

- . *Tundra: Selections from the Great Accounts of Arctic Land Voyages*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1971. Print.
- Moyles, R.G., ed. *Improved by Cultivation: English-Canadian Prose to 1914*. Peterborough: Broadview, 1994. Print.
- Newlove, John. "Samuel Hearne in Wintertime." 1968. *Canadian Literature in English: Texts and Contexts*. Vol. 2. Ed. Laura Moss and Cynthia Sugars. Toronto: Pearson Longman, 2009. 428-30. Print.
- Newman, Peter C. *Company of Adventurers*. Markham: Viking, 1985. Print.
- Nuffield, Edward W. *Samuel Hearne, Journey to the Coppermine River, 1769-1772*. Vancouver: Haro Books, 2001. Print.
- Pennant, Thomas. *Arctic Zoology*. 1784. New York: Arno, 1974. Print.
- Phillips, Sir R. *A Collection of Voyages and Travels, from the Discovery of America to the Commencement of the Nineteenth Century*. Vol. 24. London: n.p., 1809. Print.
- Poliquin, Daniel. *Samuel Hearne: Le marcheur de l'arctique*. Montréal: XYZ, 1995. Print.
- Renger, Nicola. "'Tampering with the Truth': John Steffler's *The Afterlife of George Cartwright* in Dialogue with History." *Studies in Canadian Literature* 37.1 (2002): 69-87. Print.
- Roberts, Lloyd. *Samuel Hearne*. Toronto: Ryerson, 1930. Print.
- Rollaston, Heather. "Some Comments upon the Marked Differences in the Representations of Chipewyan Women in Samuel Hearne's Field Notes and His Published Journal." *Earth, Air, Fire, and Water: Studies in Canadian Ethnohistory*. Ed. David T. McNab. Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier UP, 1998. 263-74. Print.
- Smith, A.J.M., ed. *The Book of Canadian Prose: Early Beginnings to Confederation*. Toronto: Gage, 1965. Print.
- Speck, Gordon. *Samuel Hearne and the Northwest Passage*. Caldwell: Caxton, 1963. Print.
- Steffler, John. *The Afterlife of George Cartwright*. 1992. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1999. Print.
- Sugars, Cynthia. "The Impossible Afterlife of George Cartwright: Settler Melancholy and Postcolonial Desire." *University of Toronto Quarterly* 75.2 (2006): 693-717. Print.
- Sugars, Cynthia, and Laura Moss, eds. *Canadian Literature in English: Texts and Contexts*. Toronto: Pearson Longman, 2009. Print.
- Syme, Ronald. *On Foot to the Arctic: The Story of Samuel Hearne*. New York: Morrow, 1959. Print.
- Toye, William, ed. *A Book of Canada*. London: Collins, 1962. Print.
- Tyrrell, J.B., ed. *Journals of Samuel Hearne and Philip Turnor*. Toronto: Champlain Society, 1934. Print.
- , ed. *A Journey from Prince of Wales's Fort in Hudson's Bay to the Northern Ocean in the Years 1769, 1770, 1771, and 1772*. By Samuel Hearne. Toronto: Champlain Society, 1911. Print.
- Venema, Kathleen. "'Under the Protection of a Principal Man': A White Man, the Hero, and His Wives in Samuel Hearne's Journey." *Essays on Canadian Writing*, 70 (Spring 2000): 162-90.
- Warkentin, Germaine, ed. *Canadian Exploration Literature*. Toronto: Oxford UP, 1993. Print.