BARBARA, WHERE ARE YOU?*

PATRICIA WILLIAMSON

“Barbara Allen” is probably the most popular of all the Child ballads. A daunting number of variants can be found in Britain, the United States, and in this country, many with a striking local flavour. The Canadian examples are almost all from the Maritimes, where the collection of ballads has been going on longer than in other parts of the country.

They vary in length from 18 verses to fragments. Of the 33 versions under discussion, 8 have words only, since ballads were often “recited,” not sung. MacKenzie, working in Nova Scotia in 1919-20, found three versions—one with a tune, one with words only, and one “from the singing and recitation of Alexander Harrison.” Of the 25 variants with music, 18 fit into the Bronson categories A, C, and D, but 7 others appear to be entirely original.

Number 1, recorded by Barbara Cass-Beggs in Forget, Saskatchewan, has Molly Galbraith as the informant. The form is ABCD, with a six-note scale and octave range. The first two phrases are very similar to “Seven Gypsies on Yon Hill,” with a change of mode from transposed aeolian to a gapped six-note scale with a major mode flavour. Fowke says that “Seven Gypsies” was probably brought from Ireland in the early part of the nineteenth century, by the great-grandfather of Mr. Robert Campbell. Molly Galbraith learned “Barbara Allen” from her father, who was a singer in Ballylennon, County Donegal, so the tunes possibly have common Irish roots.

Number 2, recorded by Creighton and Peacock in Middle River, 1952, is in Maritime Folk Songs. This is the only version in the Dorian mode. Twelve of the verses have four lines, and two have six, presumably repeating the last two lines of music, since no indication is given by the editors. The form is ABCD, with a seven-note scale and octave range. The tempo is “slow” and the metre irregular. The motion is almost entirely stepwise. There are only three leaps—one of a fifth, and two of a fourth. The flavour is distinctly modal, and quite different from all of the others.

Numbers 19, 20 and 21, collected by Peacock in Newfoundland, will be considered together.

Number 21 can be analyzed as ABACD. The predominant motif in the first three phrases is similar to the motif in the C phrase of #20 and the A phrase of #19. There is also some similarity between the “D” phrase of #20, “D” of #21 and C and D of #19.

* This is part of a longer paper prepared in the Institute of Canadian Studies at Carleton University. Of the thirty-three Canadian versions of “Barbara Allen” studied in that paper, some were of particular interest, and these are discussed in this article.
Since #21 contains more repetitive material than any of the others, perhaps part of it has been lost. The first three phrases lean on A material (ABAB), and the last two on C (CDC).

There are other similarities between 19 and 21: they both have five lines (by repetition of the last line of 21), and both can be analyzed as ABACD. There is probably a family relationship among all three. Nineteen and twenty are in the major mode, each with a seven-note scale. Peacock speaks of the "aeolian flavour" of 21, although it has only a six-note scale. All three variants show some similarity to Bronson C.

Number 27, collected by Fowke, was sung by Mrs. Vera Keating. The form is ABCD, and the piece is quick, light, and lyrical, partly due to the pleasant quality of the informant’s voice. Rhythmically it is sung very freely, and has the widest range of all the variants (12 notes). There is a lot of stepwise motion, but also the leap of an octave and a sixth. The tune could have been taken over from another ballad. The last phrase, with the leap of a sixth has an Irish flavour.

Number 28, recorded by Creighton, has Dan Livingstone as the informant. The piece is lively—almost dance-like—with its dotted rhythm. The form is ABAC, and the A phrase is transposed down a fourth for the repetition, reminiscent of a double tonic. A is composed of two notes only, an ascending minor third, and bears some resemblance to A in “Moody to the Rescue.” Phrases B and C both have descending scale passages, so, coupled with the sparse material of A, the tune is attractive and easily remembered. It could be a dance tune, or even a child’s game tune.

Number 32, recorded by Fowke, was sung by Phyllis Zimmerman. This version has a strong triple beat, and is very rhythmical. The musical phrases are ABAC. The A phrase is repeated, and C has elements of B, so there is not much material. The octave leap at the beginning of A is unusual. #28 and #32 could be partially remembered tunes “rounded out.” Both are very rhythmical, good for dancing, and not entirely suitable to the sombre story of the ballad. They could both have been adapted from other genres.

None of the tunes collected seems to be of great antiquity. None has a scale of less than six notes, nor a range of less than seven. Most have four balanced phrases, ABCD, although few have five, six, or seven. Some of the texts, however, appear to be very old indeed, and it is tempting to speculate as to how they got here.
In *The Quest of the Ballad*, Mackenzie observes that his informant, in common with the great majority of ballad singers, had not the least disposition to attempt a patching-up process. “They simply sang the ballads—or supposed they sang them—exactly as they had heard them delivered by some old or authoritative singer.” He goes on to say that most of these were simple old women or men, who sang “in the unquestioning belief that they were detailing faithful records of actual events.”

The Canadian versions, while varying greatly in length, tell all or part of the same story. A dying man sends a message to his beloved. She comes, looks coldly upon him, and says: “Young man, you’re dying.” He asks her for a kiss, which will save his life, but she refuses, since he has slighted her in the tavern, or some similar location. In some versions he offers her a gold watch, gold chains, or other rewards for her love. She refuses, he turns his face to the wall to die, and she leaves. As she makes her way home, she hears the church bells announcing his death, and they seem to be saying: “Hard-hearted Barbara Allen.” She meets people carrying his corpse to the graveyard, and asks to look at it. In some versions she is filled with remorse, while in others she laughs uncontrollably. She goes home and asks her mother to make her a bed, usually long and narrow (a grave), and she dies the next day. In most Canadian versions, the two lovers are joined in death with a lover’s knot, made by the entwining of a rose growing from his grave, and a briar from hers.

The location varies considerably: London Town, Bedford Town, New York, Scarlet Town, Charlotte Town, and Moncton Town. (The last two could be authentically Canadian, although “Scarlet” could have mutated into “Charlotte.”) The young man comes from “The West Country,” “The North Country,” the “Western States,” and #17, collected in Nova Scotia, begins: “In New York city where I was born, And Cambridge was my dwellin’.”

In several versions, the season or the month is mentioned. Spring and May are the overwhelming favorites, although Christmas and Martinmas also appear. An example from Ontario, #10, with its Scottish words, is particularly lovely:

All in the merry month of May  
When the merle and mavis were singing,  
Sir John Graeme in the West Country  
Fell in love with Barbary Allen.

The names of the main characters also vary. The girl is “Barbara Allen,” “Barb’ry Allen,” “Ellen” or “Helen,” “Barbru Allen,” “Elinor,” and “Dave Allen’s daughter from New York.” The “young man” is sometimes just that. In other versions he is “Willie” (Nova Scotia and Newfoundland), “Jimmy Groves,” and Sir John Graeme or Sir James the Graeme. There are really three sets of names in play here: Willie/William; John/James and Graeme/Groves. This could mean that two main ballad sources are being drawn upon, or that names from other ballads have been added through oral transmission.

The young man communicates with Barbara by sending a servant, servants, or a letter. Two versions are tied together with a chilling phrase at this point: In #8, the servant tells Barbara:

And death is painted in his cheeks,  
And o’er his heart is stealing.

In #20 Barbara says:

Oh death is pictured in your face,  
And sorrow is gone from you.”
The phrase "slowly, slowly she got up" occurs in most of the examples, and when she arrives at his deathbed, she pulls the curtain aside and utters the best-beloved sentence in the whole ballad: "Young man, I think you're dying," or "Young man, you are a 'dyin'." This line occurs in all versions except the fragments.

The action continues, as the young man asks her for one kiss, which will magically cure him (14 versions). She refuses, and brings up the reason for her cruel rejection—he toasted the other ladies, but left her out. This takes place in several different locations. A tavern or an ale house is the most common, but three versions have a poignantly North American flavour—a "bar-room" in #19, or "the cabin" in #30. In #2 he dances with the other ladies in the "dance-hall," but not with her. In many of the examples there are mirror verses at this point: "Do you remember? ..." "Yes, I remember. . . ."

Various gifts are proffered to help change her mind. The most popular are a gold watch and chain, a ring or jewels, a satchel containing a gold watch and forty pounds. These are enclosed in a silk tie, a napkin, a knapsack, or a satchel. A gold bowl filled with tears, a basin of tears, a gold bowl filled with innocent blood, and a basin or napkin with heart's blood are other offerings.

In one version, (#9), a verse is interpolated at this point which seems to have no connection with the story—perhaps it has wandered in from another, older ballad, since it has an internal rhyme in line 3:

```
Look out, look out at the raging sea
You'll see three ships a-sailing,
They are not mine, they are not thine,
So fare you well, dear Willie.
```

The young man turns his head to the wall and bids his friends "Adieu, adieu," or "Be kind to Barbara Allen" (how forgiving he is!), or "God, have mercy on me!" In all the complete versions she leaves the house, and hears the death-bell tolling or knelling, or she hears the birds saying: "O, cruel Barbara Allen."

In several examples, she then goes a specific distance—half a mile, "two miles from time," or three or five miles. Other variants specify the place where she meets the corpse or the time of day: "through and through the town," in the garden, or on the highway. In #22, the narrator steps in with: "As I was walking up London Street, I heard the bell a-tolling." This is probably a line that has wandered in from a broadside.

In 5 versions she then "looked to the east, and looked to the west," and in 4 she sees the corpse being carried towards her. Harrington suggests that this could be a line from a children's game, common in the United States. It does not appear in any of the Child versions.

Another remarkable figure of speech then occurs in many of the examples, pointing back to a very ancient form of the ballad, using alliterative verse. They speak of a "cold corpse a'comin'," or a "cold, cold corpse," or a "corpse of clay," or a "cold corpse of clay" (14 examples). This phrase has obviously had a very wide appeal. Barbara's reaction to the corpse's appearance varies. She asks to gaze upon him (the almost universally favoured verb). In 3 versions, "the more she gazed, the more she laughed," although, at the same time her "poor heart is breaking" in #19. In #21, she appears to be even more callous:

```
She looked to the east, she looked to the west,
She saw his corpse a-coming,
Saying, "Put him down, my little boys,
That I may gaze upon him." (twice)
```

---

- 6 -
The more she looked, the more she laughed.
Till a-further she got from him.
Till all her friends called out, "for shame,
Hard hearted Barbr'y Ellen." (twice)

In other versions she "pressed the cold form to her heart," or breast, and
sometimes said: "God, have mercy on him."

After this, in versions that include the incident, she repents of her cold treatment
of her dead lover, returns home and asks her mother to make her a long or soft or
neat and narrow bed, or in one case, asks her father to dig her grave. She is preparing
to die tomorrow, which she does.

At this point, many versions stop. In those that continue, the overwhelmingly
popular ending unites the lovers in death, although not always in the same churchyard.
They are joined by a true-lover’s knot, made by the entwining of a rose and a briar
growing from their respective graves and sometimes reaching as high as the steeple. The
rose grows from his grave, breast or ribs, or out of her grave, or from an unspecified
grave.

Number 32 has a cold, Nova Scotian ending:

So in the churchyard they both were laid
Those two and only lovers.
And out from his grave there grew a stone,
And out from hers another. (14)

Some possible broadside connections can be made. Several versions begin in
typical broadside manner, in the first person singular, usually specifying a place of birth:
"In London City where I was born, And Cambridge was my dwelling" (#17). Numbers
15 and 28 both have an "admonishing" ending, in the broadside style, reminiscent of
Child B. In #15, after asking her mother to make her bed, she repents and says:

"Hard-hearted creature that I was,
Who loved me so dearly.
O that I had more kinder been
When he was alive and near me.

"Come young and old, both great and small
And shun the fall I fell in:
Henceforth take warning by the fall
Of cruel Barbary Ellen."

The last three lines of #28 are identical with those of #15 above, and very likely
came from the same broadside source.

Six of the Canadian variants show ancient roots in the choice of words, or
incorporate parts of other, similar ballads. In #11, verse two is of particular interest:

"Come bridle me a milk-white colt,
Come saddle me a pony,
That I may ride to his bedside
And see if he is dying."

This is the only example of a conceit in the collection. It could be a line that has
crept in from another ballad (milk-white steeds are popular in Child ballads), but this is
the only auxiliary method of transportation that appear in the Canadian versions.

In the next verse of the same version, instead of "slowly, slowly, she got up,"
we have:
So quickly she put on her clothes,
So slowly she rode to him,
And as she rode up to his bedside
She says, "Young man, you're dying."

Here are the vestiges of "slowly, slowly" mixed with probable remnants of another ballad. The next line puts us back into the basic Barbara Allen story, with the "Young man, you're dying" phrase, beloved by all.

This version also has a golden bowl filled with tears at his bedside, as well as a gold watch and chain, both common properties in ancient ballads. When she meets the corpse, the encounter is horrifying:

The more she gazed, the more she laughed,
Till she could not gaze for laughing.

Bronson suggests that the versions in which Barbara laughs at the corpse are the older ones, and that her character has been softened over the years to make her somewhat more palatable. If this is the case, then this ballad, with its conceit, passing change in plot, and its golden bowl filled with tears, may be part of a much older version of the ballad which we know today.

Number 13 is the longest of all the versions (18 verses), and #16 is close, with 15. These two seem to come from the same source. They are the only ones taking place in November, at Martinmas time. The young man is named "Sir John Graham from the West Country," and "Sir James the Graeme, in the West Countrie." In #13, Barbara's beauty and modesty are mentioned in verses 2 and 3 (the only instance of this in all the versions). Both #13 and #16 then have an identical verse:

O see you not yon seven ships
So bonny as they are sailing?
I'll make you mistress of them all,
My bonny Barbara Allen.

Number 13, the fuller version, eschews the tavern—they are drinking wine in an undisclosed location when he slight her. She shuns his letters. His manservant volunteers to go on a daring mission with yet another letter, entreating her to come to his deathbed and save him. She laughs at the letter, not the corpse:

O when she looked the letter upon,
With loud laughter gie'd she,
But ere she read the letter through,
The tears blinded her eye.

In #16, verse 7, her reaction is somewhat the same:

She took the letter in her hand
.............................. smilin'.
But ere she'd read the letter through
With tears her eyes were blindin'.

In both #13 and #16, the next verse recalls #11, in the speedy way that she puts on her clothes.

Number 13 also mentions the sea again. Sir James the Graeme says:

"O, I am sick, and very sick
My mast is at the breaking."

This could, once more, be another wandering line from another ballad, but it might be a homely, Nova Scotian metaphor.
Later in both versions, #13 and #16, the favorite phrase “Slowly slowly” occurs, in an identical example of alliterative verse:

And slowly, slowly rose she up,
And slowly, slowly left him,
And, sighing, said she could not stay,
Since death of life had reft him.

The language throughout these two versions is somewhat more formal than in the others, and loses some of its picturesque bite. Instead of clasping a cold corpse to her bosom, in #13, Barbara is much more genteel:

Now when the virgin heard the sound,
Sure she was greatly troubled.
When in the coffin his corpse she viewed,
Her sorrows all were doubled.

“What, has thou died for me!” she cried,
“Let all true lovers shun me.
Too late I may this sadly say,
That death has quite undone me.”

These two versions are more “poetic,” more “genteel” than the others. They both have a rhyme scheme, ABCB, that is quite closely adhered to, and an identical example of alliterative verse, as well as being more specific as to time and the name of the hero. Number 13 has separate dramatic inserts (the meeting, the cry for someone to rush off to bring Barbara to save him). Both have seven ships given as a bribe or enticement. Surely some of these points of style and incidents are added from other ballads, either of the Child type, or from broadsides, or indicate a separate, common source for the two versions.

Number 21, sung for Peacock by Freeman Bennett, begins part way through the story, at “O, death is pictured in your face.” The first four verses tell the familiar story of the death bells and the corpse-a-coming, Barbara’s laughter, and the judgement of her friends: “For shame, hard hearted Barbr’y Ellen.” Then Barbr’y Ellen abruptly changes to Ellinor in verse five:

Johnny died that night be the day,
And Ellinor died to-morrow,
And Johnny he did die for love,
And Ellinor died for sorrow.

In the next verse, she becomes “Ellen” again, and the last verse is very repetitive, as if part of it has been lost:

It growed till it growed to a true-love’s knot,
It growed till it couldn’t grow no higher;
It growed till it growed to a true-lovers knot,
And the rose growed round the briar.

The last two lines of each verse are repeated, like a refrain.

This version bears a strong resemblance to “Lord Thomas and Fair Eleanor” (Child 73), as collected by Sharp in 1904. In it the hero is also weak, and the Fair Eleanor is haughty. They are united in death with the symbol of the rose and briar. Verse 6 and 7 of “Barbara Allen” and verses 17 and 18 of “Lord Thomas and Fair Eleanor” are very similar.
“Barbara Allen:”

O Johny was buried in the low church-yard,
And Ellinor was buried in the higher;
And out of Johny’s breast sprung a rose,
And out of Ellen’s a brier.

It growed till it growed to a true-love’s knot,
It growed till it couldn’t grow no higher;
It growed till it growed to a true-love’s knot,
And the rose growed ’round the brier.

“Lord Thomas and Fair Eleanor:”

Lord Thomas was buried in the church,
Fair Eleanor in the choir,
and out of her bosom there grew a red rose,
And out of Lord Thomas a brier.

And it grew till it reached the church steeple top
Where it could grow no higher,
And there it entwined like a true lover’s knot
For all true loves to admire.

As pointed out in the musical analysis, the tune for this version of “Barbara Allen” contains more repetitive material than the others (AB ACD), and also has some resemblances to #19 and #20. It seems possible, therefore, that this is a combination of two or perhaps more Child ballads that have become mixed or blended in the informants’ repertoire—perhaps for generations.

Many other ballads have common elements with the Canadian “Barbara Allen” versions, but perhaps the most striking is “Mother, Mother, Make my Bed,” collected in 1906 in Sussex by Anne Gilchrist. Many incidents are the same, although the dying person in this case is the girl.

(1) The first line in the “Mother, Mother, Make my Bed” is in 11 “Barbara Allen” versions. The father makes the bed in 2 others.
(2) Messengers are sent to summon the lover to the beloved’s deathbed.
(3) The conceit in verse 6 of “Mother, Mother:” “Saddle me my milk-white horse, and bridle him so neat,” compares to that in #11, “Barbara Allen:” “Come, bridle me a milk-white colt.”
(4) The kiss in “Mother, Mother,” verse 7, is an important aspect of the reunion—for which the lover is too late.
(5) In both the ballads, the corpse is encountered on the highway.
(6) In “Mother, Mother” the corpse is kissed. In “Barbara Allen,” it is pressed to her bosom, laughed at, or gazed upon.
(7) In “Mother, Mother” they die one day after the other.
(8) The rose and brier grow until they can grow no higher, and form a true lover’s knot.

The coincidences are striking, and suggest a common source. It could be argued that the fragment, #31, is this ballad, if it were not sung to a “Barbara Allen” tune.

The rose-and-brier ending is a popular one, although it does not appear in Child’s versions of “Barbara Allen.” Besides “Lord Thomas and Fair Eleanor,” Child #74, “Fair Margaret and Sweet William,” and “Lord Lovel,” #75, among others end with this motif, as well as four versions of “Barbara Allen” quoted by Bronson.

What are the reasons for the tremendous popularity of “Barbara Allen,” with its many tunes, sets of words, and resemblances to other ballads? Why is it so
widespread? I suspect that the two main reasons are that it tells a good story, and that some unusually graphic phrases have stuck to it.

The story is dramatic enough and simple enough to catch the attention. A dying young man can be saved by a kiss, which is refused. The listener can take sides. Is he the one to blame? Surely he has suffered enough if he is. Is Barbara hard-hearted, or is she in the right? Is she being dignified, or is she being heartless? Why does she laugh in some versions? Is she hysterical? The dramatic meeting with the corpse on the road—her "gazing," or her clasping it to her bosom evokes a horrid fascination in the listener. There is a fitting romantic ending. Her mother is called to dig her grave, and she dies, to be finally united in death with her lover, like Tristan and Isolde. The old symbol of the rose and the briar entwining is the final embrace, the happy ending. The listener can feel that justice has been served, since she, too, has died—but romance has won the day.

Some phrases common to most of the Canadian versions are particularly graphic, and have really never been improved upon: "Slowly, slowly, she got up," "Young man, I think you're dying," "Adieu, adieu," "Through and through the town," "The death-bell knelling," "Cold, cold corpse a-coming," "She gazed and gazed," "Mother, mother, make my bed," "I'll die for him tomorrow," all live on. Many of these are repeated words of one syllable and are often alliterative. This seems to add a deliberate solemnity to the action—the death-bell almost tolls from the very beginning of the story.

The other incidents that float through are not really essential to the plot. Often it seems that they have become accidentally attached. Seven ships sail by, a milk-white colt gallops past, and the tavern becomes a dance hall, an ale-house, a bar, or a cabin. The great folk-song tradition carries on in another continent. Birthplaces move from Scarlet Town to Monkton to New York. The rose and the briar become cold stones on the bleak Nova Scotia coast.

The righteousness, the romance, and the crudity remain undisturbed through all these changes. This is a simple story, appealing to simple people. It adapts itself to its surroundings, as it travels across North America, and gains new vitality and relevance as it grows and changes.

Carleton University
Ottawa, Ontario

INDEX


14. Ibid. Informant: Mrs. Willard Thompson, Cape John, Pictou County.

15. Ibid. Informant: Mrs. Jacob Langille, Marshville, Pictou County.


17. Ibid. Informant: Mr. Fred Brincombe, c. 1922.


UNPUBLISHED VERSIONS OF BARBARA ALLEN
(Tapes for the following versions were obtained from the Canadian Centre for Folk Culture, National Museum of Man, Ottawa.)

27. FO-17.152. Informant, Mrs. Vera Keating.


29. BO-20.299b and BO-34.299b. (same). Informant: Mr. Walter Roast.


31. CR-146.10. Informant, Mr. Clarence Thompson.

32. FO-17.154. Informant, Miss Phyllis Zimmerman.

33. PEA 201, NO 1169. Second version, William Nash. First of two on the tape.

NOTES

2. All versions of “Barbara Allen” will be referred to by the numbers assigned in the Index.


7. FO-17.152. Tape, Centre for Folk Culture Studies, National Museum of Man, Ottawa. Transcription, PLW.
8. CR-61-15 Museum of Man, Transcription, PLW.
10. FO-17.154. Museum of Man, Transcription, PLW.
12. The same vivid image appears in Child “B”, verse. 4.
   For death is printed in his face,
   And sorrow is gone from you.
14. Ibid. 127-128. She notes that this is a common method of perpetrating the memory of the dead in a province where the rose and briar are seldom found in cemeteries.
17. Ibid. 71. In a footnote they point out that the argument continues as to the derivation of the ballad. Is it from “Lady Maisry” (Child #65), or “Lord Lovel” (Child #75)?


---

**WORTH NOTING**

**Ian Bell: A Grand Musical Entertainment**

P & C Sound Reconstructions. 10 Marion Street, Toronto, 1990.

Subtitled “Grassroots Music of Early Ontario,” this presents a miscellaneous collection of items that might have been heard at a concert in nineteenth-century Ontario, many drawn from early manuscripts. A varied group of singers and musicians perform Canadian versions of old British ballads, dance and pipe tunes, a Great Lakes ballad, a Scottish convivial song, an “Ethiopian Medley,” a paraphrase of the “Song of Solomon,” a couple of items from Afro-American musical tradition, a sampling of dinner horns, hornpipes, and quick marches, songs from Quaker and Children of Peace religious traditions, an ode to “The Man Behind the Plough” and a song in praise of tobacco.