Stone interprets the roots/routes dichotomy at its most intimate level, in the playing of a single individual. He locates Aidan O’Rourke’s roots in the playing norms of the Scottish fiddle tradition and then analyzes how O’Rourke stretches or breaks these norms. While I would have appreciated a more solid theoretical framework, I found Stone’s musical analyses convincing; it seems to me that several such individual-centred studies might be profitably combined to track the development and alteration of a traditional style and repertoire.

Routes & Roots closes with a transcription of a 2010 NAFCo panel on “teaching and learning traditional fiddling” with Anne Lederman, Claire White, James Alexander and Cameron Baggins. The panelists offered personal histories and practical suggestions that will be useful for anyone developing or teaching in a large-scale, youth-oriented fiddling program.

The breadth of scholarship in this collection makes it a valuable addition to any music library. Multiple North Atlantic fiddle traditions are investigated taking a wide variety of methodological approaches. However, I would have liked to see a more thorough theorization of the roots/routes dichotomy in the introduction and a more consistent level of scholarship in the articles.

REFERENCES


Crossing Over: Fiddle and Dance Studies from around the North Atlantic 3. Ian Russell and Anna Kearney Guigné, eds. 2010. Aberdeen: The Elphinstone Institute, University of Aberdeen, in association with the Department of Folklore, the Centre for Music, Media, and Place (MMaP) and the School of Music, Memorial University of Newfoundland. 317pp, index of songs, tunes and dances; index.

RICHARD MACKINNON
Cape Breton University

What results when you bring a group of recognized traditional musicians and dancers from around the North Atlantic and put them together for a week with scholars who have been studying the nuances of fiddle and dance traditions, many of whom are respected performers in their own right? You get more than a few lively, vibrant “kitchen rackets” and “ceilidhs” as they say in Newfoundland, the site of the 2008 North Atlantic Fiddle Convention. You also end up with a fine collection of twenty-one well-researched essays on a variety of fiddle and dance traditions, the third collection of essays to result from this innovative conference.

This volume’s contents pertain to traditional fiddling and dancing in Scotland, Ireland, northern Europe, the United States and, of course, Canada. Because of my own expertise in Cape Breton traditional culture and music, I have focused this review on the three articles about Cape Breton and provided a more cursory overview of the other articles in the collection.

Ethnochoreologist Mats Melin investigates how—and why—Cape Breton
step dancing was introduced to a modern Scottish audience in the 1990s. Melin outlines how Scottish dancers and musicians “discovered” Cape Breton step dancing in the 1990s through workshops from visiting Cape Breton dancers and musicians, resulting in a form of dance revivalism through which the “essence of Scottishness” was sought (219). Melin argues that what was actually being revived by this interest group was the Scottish “essence of a tradition.” By taking the transformed “Cape Breton” style of step dancing and bringing it back to Scotland, this “essence” of the form came to represent what scattered memories recalled of some form of percussive step dance tradition in Scotland. (218)

This article is based on research from his recently completed PhD dissertation from the University of Limerick. Musicologist Jessica Herdman explores the complex relationship between Cape Breton fiddle music and dance in her essay “Old Style’ Cape Breton Fiddling: Narrative, Interstices, Dancing.” She points out that “playing [the fiddle] for dances requires particular techniques that become concretized as stylistic attributes” of the old style, such as up-driven bowing, high bass tuning, cuts and cutting (159-60). She has identified three locally defined components—timing, lift and drive—that are essential for Cape Breton dance music but that are challenging to conceptualize. A particularly interesting part of this essay is her close analysis of recordings of four Cape Breton fiddlers of different eras playing the same tune. While each fiddler has a unique style, she is able to identify some common techniques of performance.

Greg Dorchak, a doctoral student in communication, focuses on the meaning of Cape Breton fiddle music outside Cape Breton Island. Through a close examination of the Cape Breton scene in Boston, he identifies two different demographics: those who have no family connections to the island and those who do and still maintain a direct relationship to the Cape Breton community. He points out that the Cape Breton–born musicians are “able to adapt to newness within the community, and that the community fosters agency within the individual. The community has the ability to embrace certain changes within it” (257). However, the Boston-born Cape Breton community does not hold the same notion of adaptability—instead conceiving of the tradition as a mimetic reproduction of what occurs on Cape Breton. This paradigm of thought conceives of tradition in a materialistic manner, rather than a focus on sustainable community. (257)

The fiddle music of another island in the Maritimes, Prince Edward Island, is studied by independent scholar and professional musician Ken Perlman. His article in this collection examines a stereotype of Prince Edward Island fiddlers: while being asked to perform free for many community events, they are sometimes stereotyped as “lazy, drunken ‘ne’er do wells’” by community residents
Perlman dissects this conventional conundrum to explain its origins.

A number of essays in the collection focus on the transference of music from one region to another using a comparative approach in the analysis of the tradition under study. Evelyn Osborne, a doctoral student in ethnomusicology at Memorial University of Newfoundland, outlines the Island to Island CD project featuring musicians from Newfoundland and Cork, Ireland. Her paper explains how modern technology can be used not just to bridge geographic boundaries, but also to highlight processes of transnationalism and the relationship between diaspora and “old country” in identity-formation. Frances Wilkins, ethnomusicologist at the University of Aberdeen, discusses musical interactions between Shetland Islanders and the indigenous populations of the Arctic, Alaska, Canada and Greenland in the whaling industry. Tunes were shared in this interaction: “As its name suggests, ‘The Merry Boys of Greenland’ is one of the few tunes known for certain to have been taken back by Shetland fiddlers from the Arctic” (9). Anne Lederman, performer, composer and researcher, compares and contrasts two fiddle and dance traditions, one from First Nations communities in the MacKenzie Delta in Canada’s north, and one further south in the Métis communities around Great Slave Lake. She demonstrates that both traditions have been shaped by historical forces but the isolation of the northern MacKenzie Delta region has contributed to better preservation of older tunes. Both traditions, however, are being extensively influenced by commercial country music. Laura Ellestad, a Canadian Hardanger fiddler with ancestral roots in Norway, examines the impact of fiddlers who immigrated from Valdres, Norway to North America between 1846 and 1956. She provides a number of case studies showing how this migration influenced the Hardanger fiddle music in Norway and North America.

Other essays explore notions of musical styles and how styles develop and transform. For example, Liz Doherty, fiddle player from County Donegal and lecturer at the University of Derry, examines the revival of regional styles of fiddling in the Donegal region. She points out that there is often a problem with labels during revivals. What is often referred to as “the Donegal style” does not capture the reality of the individual playing styles of particular musicians throughout the region. By closely examining fiddlers from Inishowen she concludes that “even in a specific and geographic region, often the individual voice is what emerges as the strongest feature” (197). She defines a regional style as a “mosaic of individual re-interpretations of those commonalities rather than a unified and homogenous sound” (197). Anthropologist Sarah Quick’s study of Métis fiddling in western Canada explores commercial compositions rather than focusing on traditional tunes and traditional stylistics, the latter of which have generally drawn more scholarly attention. She provides case studies of two Métis fiddlers, Andy DeJarlis and John Arcand. Alfonso Franco Vázquez, a doctoral student in traditional Galician music, explores the history of Galician music, the role of blind fiddlers in this tradition and the revival of this form of music beginning in the 1970s.
One fascinating essay shows how a life history approach combined with an understanding of legend formation can yield deep insights into the development of folk heroes in musical worlds. Holly Everett’s essay, “Harry Choate (1922-1951) as Cajun Folk Hero,” shows how “Choate’s ethnic background, exciting performances and sudden, seemingly inexplicable death at a young age have all contributed to the construction of a folk hero” (100). She adds the component of “mysterious death” to a formula for the formation of folk heroes developed by folklorist Michael Owen Jones.

Some of the authors in this collection address a theme that has been under-studied in traditional music and dance scholarship: the interrelationship between music and dance. Ethnomusicologist Sherry Johnson examines this issue with respect to the Ottawa Valley step dancing community. In their essay “Ethnochoreology? Ethnochoreomusic?” Karin Eriksson and Mats Nilsson, lecturers in musicology and folklore/ethnochoreology in Sweden, offer a framework for studying music and dance simultaneously. They provide some terminology and suggest a way forward for scholars: “what is needed in order better to understand how music, dance and dance music work together is ... knowledge of the social and historical context of which the music, dance and dance music form a part” (264).

Other essays show how archives and archival materials can play a significant role in helping us to understand traditional music and dance. Elaine Bradtke demonstrates the value of examining archival collections in her article on James Madison Carpenter’s recordings in England between 1928 and 1935. She provides a case study of Madison’s fieldwork, recording equipment, the condition of the recordings, the transcription process and musical notation. Dr. Colette Moloney (Waterford Institute of Technology), explores the music manuscripts John “Boss” Murphy compiled from his own repertoire between 1933 and 1935. The manuscripts remained in his family home until Moloney was given access to them in the 1980s.

Drawing together the work of both established and emerging scholars from both sides of the Atlantic, this collection provides a sense of current and innovative approaches to the study of traditional music and dance throughout the North Atlantic region. However, as with most collections of essays from conferences, this group is uneven: some papers are more developed than others. Some are fieldwork reports, offering valuable data and observations, but not providing much theoretical discussion.

The inextricable and symbiotic relationship between fiddle music and dance traditions is illustrated and analyzed in many of the essays. A valuable addition to the book is an index of songs, tunes and dances mentioned in the articles. Focusing on the North Atlantic as a cultural region allows for a fruitful comparative analysis between groups and across boundaries. This volume will be of value to a variety of disciplines, including folklore, ethnomusicology and ethnochoreology.