

# LABOUR/LE TRAVAIL

73

REVUE D'ÉTUDES  
OUVRIÈRES  
CANADIENNES

JOURNAL OF  
CANADIAN  
LABOUR STUDIES



SPRING

2014

PRINTEMPS

Copyright © 2014 by the Canadian Committee on Labour History. All rights reserved. No part of this work covered by the copyrights hereon may be reproduced or used in any form or by any means – graphic, electronic, or mechanical – without the prior written permission of the publisher.

Any request for photocopying, recording, taping, or information storage and retrieval systems of any part of this book shall be directed in writing to the Canadian Reprography Collective, 379 Adelaide Street West, Suite M1, Toronto, Ontario M5V 1S5.

Tous droits réservés, © « le Comité canadien sur l'histoire du travail », 2014. Aucune partie de cet ouvrage, assujettie à ces droits, ne peut être reproduite sous quelque forme que ce soit sans l'autorisation préalable, par écrit, du Comité.

Pour toute demande de photocopie, d'enregistrement ou d'inscription dans un système informatisé, de n'importe quelle partie de cet ouvrage, vous adresser à « Canadian Reprography Collective » 379 Adelaide Street West, Suite M1, Toronto, Ontario M5V 1S5.

Published with the assistance of the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada.

Publié grâce à une subvention du Conseil de recherches en sciences humaines du Canada.

The Canadian Committee on Labour History and the editor gratefully acknowledge the generous support of Athabasca University Press, and Paul Lau of the Ontario Public Service Employees Union for translations. / Le Comité canadien sur l'histoire du travail et l'éditeur remercie chaleureusement de l'Athabasca University Press, de sa généreuse contribution et Paul Lau du Syndicat des employé-e-s de la fonction publique de l'Ontario de sa traduction.

Cover Illustration: SORWUC sign from the Bimini strike. From the Service, Office and Retail Workers Union of Canada, Local 4 fonds, Box 15, File 21, UBCLRBS.C. Reproduced with permission.

Inside Title Page: SORWUC members picket the Muckamuck. From Don Summerhayes. Reproduced with permission.

Layout Design: Virginia Penny,  
Interpret Design.

## **Labour/Le Travail**

Printed and bound in Canada /  
Imprimé et relié au Canada



Legal Deposit / Dépôt légal:  
Bibliothèque nationale du Québec;  
National Library of Canada /  
Bibliothèque nationale du Canada

Articles are abstracted and indexed in / les  
articles sont répertoriés dans:

*Alternative Press Index;*  
*America-History and Life;*  
*BNET;*  
*Canadian Association of Learned Journals (calj);*  
*CRKN/Érudit;*  
*EBSCO;*  
*The Gale Group;*  
*Genamics;*  
*Goliath;*  
*Google Base;*  
*Google Scholar;*  
*High Beam Research;*  
*The History Cooperative;*  
*IBSS: International Bibliography of the Social Sciences;*  
*JSTOR;*  
*pais International;*  
*Project muse;*  
*ProQuest;*  
*Sociological Abstracts;*  
*Thomson Reuters (Thomson Scientific)*  
*and ISI Web of Knowledge;*  
*Ulrich's*

Member/Membre:

*Association of Canadian Publishers;*  
*Atlantic Publishers' Association;*  
*Canadian Association of Labour Media /*  
*Association Canadienne de la presse syndicale;*  
*Canadian Association of Learned Journals;*  
*Canadian Labour Education and Research Association;*  
*Canadian Magazine Publishers Association;*  
*Conference of Historical Journals;*  
*Council of Editors of Learned Journals;*  
*International Association of Labour History Institutions;*  
*Internationale Tagung der Historiker der Arbeiterbewegung.*

# LABOUR/LE TRAVAIL

# 73

SPRING 2014 PRINTEMPS

ISSN: 0700-3862

Contributors / Collaborateurs 9

## OBITUARY / NÉCROLOGIE

### Elizabeth Quinlan

*Hugh Lukin Robinson (1916–2012)* 11

## ARTICLES

### Julia Smith

*An “Entirely Different” Kind of Union: The Service, Office, and Retail Workers’ Union of Canada (SORWUC), 1972–1986* 23

### Heather Jensen

*A History of Legal Exclusion: Labour Relations Laws and British Columbia’s Agricultural Workers, 1937–1975* 67

### Christo Aivalis

*In Service of the Lowly Nazarene Carpenter: The English Canadian Labour Press and the Case for Radical Christianity, 1926–1939* 97

### Jessica Dunkin

*The Labours of Leisure: Work and Workers at the Annual Encampments of the American Canoe Association, 1880–1910* 127

## RESEARCH NOTE / NOTE DE RECHERCHE

### Sean Carleton

*Drawn to Change: Comics and Critical Consciousness* 151

## CONTROVERSY / POLÉMIQUE

### Stephen Brier

*The Ideological and Organizational Origins of the United Federation of Teachers’ Opposition to the Community Control Movement in the New York City Public Schools, 1960–1968* 179

PRESENTATION / PRÉSENTATION

Forum: History Under Harper

<b>P. E. Bryden and Matt James</b>	
<i>Introduction</i>	195
<b>Alvin Finkel</b>	
<i>Harper's Vision of the Future Requires Reshaping of the Past</i>	197
<b>Kiera L. Ladner and Michael McCrossan</b>	
<i>Whose Shared History?</i>	200
<b>Lyle Dick</b>	
<i>Remarks on the Harper Government's Review of History</i>	203
<b>Veronica Strong-Boag</b>	
<i>Limiting Identities: The Conservative Attack on History and Feminist Claims for Equality</i>	206
<b>Alain Noël</b>	
<i>History Under Harper: Leaving Québec, and Much Else, Outside Canada</i>	210
<b>Gregory S. Kealey</b>	
<i>Harper and Non-History</i>	213
<b>Yasmeen Abu-Laban</b>	
<i>The Politics of History Under Harper</i>	215
<b>Reg Whitaker</b>	
<i>Harper's History: Does the Right Hand Know What the Other Right Hand is Doing?</i>	218
<b>Adam Chapnick</b>	
<i>Rethinking the Impact of the Harper Government on Canadian History: It's Our Fault Too</i>	222
<b>Jocelyn Létourneau</b>	
<i>L'identité canadienne refaçonnée?</i>	225
<b>Daniel Weinstock</b>	
<i>The Conservative Assault on Parliamentary Government</i>	228
 Concluding Commentaries	
<b>Avigail Eisenberg</b>	
<i>Identity Politics: Conservative Style</i>	231
<b>Bryan D. Palmer</b>	
<i>Imagining Politics</i>	234

REVIEW ESSAYS / NOTES CRITIQUES

**David Camfield**

*Recent Studies in Canadian Labour History from the Great Depression  
into the 21st Century* 239

**Kelly Ward**

*Having It All: Women, Work, Family, and the Academic Career* 255

**Donald Wright**

*Howard Zinn, The People's Historian* 265

**Jennifer Sumner**

*Health, Sustainability, Food Sovereignty and the Future of Food  
and Farming: Critical Issues in Food Studies* 279

**Alan Wald**

*"A Seemingly Incongruous Alliance": Trotskyists and Teamsters in 1934* 301

REVIEWS / COMPTES RENDUS 311

ABSTRACTS / RÉSUMÉS 411

## REVIEWS / COMPTES RENDUS

- Stephanie Ross and Larry Savage, eds., *Rethinking the Politics of Labour in Canada*, by Joseph A. McCartin 311
- Alvin Finkel, et al., *Working People in Alberta: A History*, by Peter S. McInnis 313
- Jan Noel, *Along a River. The First French-Canadian Women*, par Benoît Grenier 315
- Andrew C. Holman and Robert B. Kristofferson, eds., *More of a Man: Diaries of a Scottish Craftsman in Mid-Nineteenth Century North America*, by Darren Ferry 318
- Judith Friedland, *Restoring the Spirit: The Beginnings of Occupational Therapy in Canada, 1890-1930*, by Dustin Galer 320
- Mark Osborne Humphries, *The Last Plague: Spanish Influenza and the Politics of Public Health in Canada*, by Chris Dooley 322
- Theodore Michael Christou, *Progressive Education: Revisioning and Reframing Ontario's Public Schools, 1919-1942*, by George Buri 324
- Dan Malleck, *Try to Control Yourself: The Regulation of Public Drinking in Post-Prohibition Ontario, 1927-44*, by Pamela E. Pennock 327
- Eric Strikwerda, *The Wages of Relief: Cities and the Unemployed in Prairie Canada, 1929-39*, by J. William Brennan 329
- Geoff Meggs and Rod Mickleburgh, *The Art of the Impossible: Dave Barrett and the NDP in Power, 1972-1975*, by Gene Homel 331
- Dimitry Anastakis, *Autonomous State: The Struggle for a Canadian Car Industry from OPEC to Free Trade*, by Nicole Aschoff 333
- Marcel Martel and Martin Pâquet, *Speaking Up: A History of Language and Politics in Canada and Quebec*, by Dustin J. McNichol 336
- G rard Bouchard, *L'interculturalisme. Un point de vue qu b cois*, par Xavier Dionne 338
- Darcy Ingram, *Wildlife, Conservation, and Conflict in Quebec: 1840-1914*, par Gaston C t  340
- Laurel Sefton MacDowell, *An Environmental History of Canada*, by Adam M. Sowards 342
- Claire Campbell and Robert Summerby-Murray, eds., *Land and Sea: Environmental History in Atlantic Canada*, by Theresa Devor 345

Caroline Desbiens, <i>Power from the North: Territory, Identity, and the Culture of Hydroelectricity in Quebec</i> , by Cory Blad	347
Jessica Squires, <i>Building Sanctuary: The Movement to Support Vietnam War Resisters in Canada, 1965-73</i> , by Christopher Powell	349
Elizabeth Comack, <i>Racialized Policing: Aboriginal People's Encounters with the Police</i> , by Erica Neeganagwedgin	352
Tom Malleson and David Wachsmuth, eds., <i>Whose Streets? The Toronto G20 and the Challenges of Summit Protest</i> , by Tara Milbrandt	354
Patrizia Gentile and Jane Nicholas, eds., <i>Contesting Bodies and Nation in Canadian History</i> , by Deborah McPhail	356
Franca Iacovetta, Valerie J. Korinek, and Marlene Epp, eds., <i>Edible Histories, Cultural Politics: Towards a Canadian Food History</i> , by Jeffrey M. Pilcher	358
Linda M. Morra and Jessica Schagerl, eds., <i>Basements and Attics, Closets and Cyberspace: Exploration in Canadian Women's Archives</i> , by Jennifer Douglas	360
Christl Verduyn and Jane Koustas, eds., <i>Canadian Studies: Past, Present, Praxis</i> , by Amber D.V.A. Johnson	362
John Peters, ed., <i>Boom, Bust and Crisis: Labour, Corporate Power and Politics in Canada</i> , by Christine McLaughlin	364
Stephanie Ross and Larry Savage, eds., <i>Public Sector Unions in the Age of Austerity</i> , by Carlo Fanelli	366
A.E. Safarian, <i>Foreign Ownership of Canadian Industry</i> , by Joe Martin	369
John B. Jentz and Richard Schneirov, <i>Chicago in the Age of Capital: Class, Politics, and Democracy during the Civil War and Reconstruction</i> , by Sam Mitrani	371
F. Darrell Munsell, <i>From Redstone to Ludlow: John Cleveland Osgood's Struggle Against the United Mine Workers of America</i> , by Anthony B. Newkirk	373
Cybelle Fox, <i>Three Worlds of Relief: Race, Immigration and the American Welfare State from the Progressive Era to the New Deal</i> , by Sarah Elvins	375
Andor Skotnes, <i>A New Deal for All? Race and Class Struggles in Depression-Era Baltimore</i> , by Christopher Powell	377
Marc Doussard, <i>Degraded Work: The Struggle at the Bottom of the Labor Market</i> , by Erin Hatton	380
Nilda Flores-González, Anna Romina Guevarra, Maura Toro-Morn and Grace Chang, eds., <i>Immigrant Women Workers in the Neoliberal Age</i> , by Gretchen Purser	382

Seth M. Holmes, <i>Fresh Fruit, Broken Bodies: Migrant Farmworkers in the United States</i> , by Eloy Rivas	384
Kathleen C. Schwartzman, <i>The Chicken Trail: Following Workers, Migrants, and Corporations across the Americas</i> , by Joon K. Kim	386
Henry A. Giroux, <i>America's Education Deficit and the War on Youth</i> , by John R. Wiens	388
Timothy D. Taylor, <i>The Sounds of Capitalism: Advertising, Music, and the Conquest of Culture</i> , by Mark Laver	390
Rob Rosenthal and Richard Flacks, <i>Playing For Change: Music and Musicians in the Service of Social Movements</i> , by Francesca D'Amico	392
Michael Andrew Žmolek, <i>Rethinking the Industrial Revolution: Five Centuries of Transition to Industrial Capitalism in England</i> , by Henry Heller	394
Cynthia L. Negrey, <i>Work Time: Conflict, Control, and Change</i> , by Erin M. Rehel	396
Thomas Fetzer, <i>Paradoxes of Internationalization: British and German Trade Unions at Ford and General Motors, 1967-2000</i> , by Wayne Lewchuk	398
A. Ricardo López and Barbara Weinstein, eds., <i>The Making of the Middle Class: Toward a Transnational History</i> , by Andrew C. Holman	401
Salimah Valiani, <i>Rethinking Unequal Exchange: The Global Integration of Nursing Labour Markets</i> , by Thomas Foth	403
Peter J. Stoett, <i>Global Ecopolitics: Crisis, Governance, and Justice</i> , by Stephanie Rutherford	405
Jeffrey S. Juris and Alex Khasnabish, eds., <i>Insurgent Encounters: Transnational Activism, Ethnography and the Political</i> , by Patrick C. Wilson	407